CORA Cork Open Research Archive
Cartlann Taighde Oscailte Chorcaí

Title	Civil service employment for Travellers in the context of building on symbolic ethnic recognition
Authors	Coyle, Chris
Publication date	2024
Original Citation	Coyle, C. 2024. Civil service employment for Travellers in the context of building on symbolic ethnic recognition. MRes Thesis, University College Cork.
Type of publication	Masters thesis (Research)
Rights	© 2024, Chris Coyle. - https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/
Download date	2026-11-04 05:00:42
Item downloaded from	https://hdl.handle.net/10468/17926



UCC
University College Cork, Ireland
Coláiste na hOllscoile Corcaigh

Ollscoil na hÉireann, Corcaigh

National University of Ireland, Cork



Thesis Title

Civil service employment for Travellers in the context of building on symbolic ethnic recognition

Thesis presented by

Chris Coyle

for the degree of

MRes Government and Public Policy

University College Cork

Department of Government and Politics

Head of Department: Dr Niall Duggan

Supervisor: Dr Aodh Quinlivan

2024

Table of Contents

Declaration		2
Funding		2
Conflicts of Interest		2
Acknowledgements		3
Acronyms and Abbreviations		4
Introduction		5
Chapter 1:	Literature Review: Ethnicity and Inclusion	7
Chapter 2:	Irish Travellers as a Distinct Ethnic Group	14
Chapter 3:	The Evolution of Diversity and Inclusion in the Irish Civil Service	34
Chapter 4:	Research Planning and Methodology	42
Chapter 5:	Analysis	69
Chapter 6:	Conclusions and Policy Implications	73
Bibliography		87

Declaration

This is to certify that the work I am submitting is my own and has not been submitted for another degree, either at University College Cork or elsewhere. All external references and sources are clearly acknowledged and identified within the contents. I have read and understood the regulations of University College Cork concerning plagiarism and intellectual property.

Funding

This research received no external funding.

Conflicts of Interest

The author declares no conflict of interest.

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my Supervisor Dr Aodh Quinlivan, for the valuable guidance and support that he has given throughout this project. In addition, I would like to acknowledge the guidance of the course Director Prof Andrew Cottey and sincere thanks to Prof Mary Murphy and Dr Richard Milner for hours of lectures and notes.

Thanks also to my employers, the Department of Defence, and to the Learning and Development Branch in the Department who provided support during this study.

I acknowledge the people who contributed to the research in this work, many of whom wished to remain anonymous, but whose contributions were key to its completion. In particular I would like to thank;

- Galway Traveller Movement;
- Bridgie Casey and Moya, Clare Local Development Centre;
- Sue Targett;
- Brian Dillon, CENA;
- Eamon Connolly, Method Consultants;
- Siobhán McKenna, Public Appointments Service;
- Patricia Mannion;
- All the individuals who participated in interviews;
- All the individuals who participated in focus groups;
- Learning & People Development, Dept of Defence;
- Sarah Whiteley, Dept of Defence.

Most importantly, I would like to offer my gratitude to my wife Eileen Gibbons, who gave her unconditional support, hours of her time, and constant encouragement over the past years, and to my family Hannah Gibbons-Coyle, Ciara Gibbons-Coyle, Eoghan Burke, and Sonas Burke.

Thank you all.

List of acronyms and abbreviations

AFT	An Foras Taluntas (Agricultural Research Institute)
BTEI	Back To Education Initiative
CENA	An Approved Housing Body. The word means 'home' in the Traveller language
CSEAS	Civil Service Employee Assistance Service
CSO	Central Statistics office
DTEDG	Dublin Traveller Education and Development Group
ESRI	Economic and Social Research Institute
ETB	Education and Training Board
EU	European Union
GP	General Practitioner
ICCL	Irish Council for Civil Liberties
IHREC	Irish Human Rights and Equality Commission
IMI	Irish Management Institute
IPA	Institute of Public Administration
ITM	Irish Traveller Movement
LGBTQ+	Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, Queer (+ many other relevant terms)
MRes	Research Masters
NDA	National Disability Authority
NTRIS	National Traveller and Roma Inclusion Strategy
PPS	Personal Public Service (number)
PTSD	Post Traumatic Stress Disorder
RTE	Raidió Teilifís Éireann (Ireland's public service broadcaster)
SMI	Strategic Management initiative
SSGT	St Stephen's Green Trust
STTC	Senior Traveller Training Centres
UCC	University College Cork
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations
UNESCO	United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organisation
VTOS	Vocational Training Opportunities Scheme

Introduction

The purpose of this thesis is to explore the relationship between the Irish civil service and the Irish Traveller in the context of inclusion for Travellers, with specific regard to employment. The reason why this research area has emerged, and why it matters, is because for decades, Irish Travellers have remained on the verges. Not so much on the verges of society – because as a group who identify as having their own distinct identity and ethnicity – there is no appetite to be included in non-Traveller society. But more so, as will be seen in several areas later in the thesis, Travellers are viewed by a very significant portion of non-Travellers, as being untrustworthy (see[CC(1)] page 28). They are viewed with suspicion and they are readily discriminated against, both at an individual level and at an institutional level.

The term non-Traveller is being used through this thesis instead of the more common title of 'settled', this is because usage of the term settled, implies that the Traveller people are 'unsettled'. And although the nomadic lifestyle is a key component of the Traveller's ethnic being, implying an unsettled lifestyle, is a term that Traveller's themselves prefer to avoid. Therefore the most appropriate titles are Traveller and non-Traveller.

On the part of Travellers, this research question will explore how Travellers view themselves and their role in improving their living conditions. Within this there will be discussions surrounding discrimination, physical and mental health, housing and education. The focus on these topics will also include an exploration of Traveller's aspirations regarding employment in the civil service. Do Travellers want nine-to-five, office work? Or does this possibility present situations that are at odds with a Traveller's identity?

The broader question of how exclusion has become commonplace will also emerge. By posing the key question of this paper – ***How has the Irish civil service and the Traveller community in Ireland, responded to changes in employment, since ethnic recognition?*** [FB2]– I aim to place this question front and centre and from that, allow the research to emerge.

For comparison purposes it is necessary to briefly look at how the Irish civil service has had to address how it deals with discrimination and inclusion. Two of the more obvious groupings that have had challenging relationships in the civil service are (a) women and (b) persons with disabilities. Comparisons will be drawn, using these two groups, to look at how the civil service has evolved. Before delving into exploration of the specific thesis question, I will first examine the question of attitudes towards ethnicity and multiculturalism in an international context, through the literature review in Chapter 1. Here, an examination of ethnicity and multiculturalism will demonstrate how and why there is a chasm between ethnic groups and their majority counterparts in societies outside the Irish Traveller discussion.

In the next chapter there will be a description of relevant on Irish society and on the Irish government along with books on Travellers and their evolution. There will also be reference to government reports, policy documents and strategy documents which over time have made efforts to address much of the broader issues that have contributed to low employment for Travellers. Literature from independent stakeholders such as the Economic and Social Research Institute (ESRI), Irish Human rights and Equality commission (IHREC) and the St Stephens Green Trust are also included. The purpose of such a broad catalogue of papers, books and documents is to allow for the assessment of the full picture surrounding the lives of Travellers and how that overview can explain where the dynamic rests at present. The following chapter explores the broader questions around ethnicity and funnels down to specifically look at ethnicity in respect of the Irish Traveller. Chapter three is devoted to research planning and methodology and this is followed by analysis and conclusions.

Chapter 1: Literature Review: Ethnicity and Inclusion

In this chapter academic literature on concepts such as ethnicity and inclusion will be presented. In 1948 The Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR) was adopted by the United Nations (UN) General Assembly to enshrine the rights and freedoms of all human beings. Soon after, the European Union (EU) adapted a migration policy which has its roots in both the Declaration of Human Rights and in the 1951 Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees. This policy was primarily adapted to offer protection to refugees displaced during World War Two. Later amendments removed the timeframe and the geographic requirements.

Since the middle of the twentieth century, numerous outbreaks of war, oppressive political regimes, and poor socio-economic conditions have all contributed to a rise in immigration and by definition, multiculturalism, which was largely made possible by the existence of these UN and EU policies. With immigration, has arisen the need to recognise differing cultures and to accommodate how these differences impact society. This need also requires an appreciation of diversity by acknowledging and respecting minority group identities, cultures and rights (Fowers and Richardson, 1996). Several papers and books have been written which look at the issue of diversity, multiculturalism and ethnicity. One such study was carried out in the Netherlands in 2004 where 64 participants, aged from 18 to 26, were asked about their views on what people in Dutch society think about multiculturalism (Verkuyten, 2004, Study 1). Half the group were asked for their views on why Dutch people might be broadly supportive of multiculturalism, while the other half were asked for their views on why their compatriots might oppose the idea. The two main findings which emerged are as follows;

- Those to be found broadly in favour of multiculturalism were so in the interests of learning and cultural enrichment;
- Those against, expressed concern for security, safety, and anxiety; and they were more in favour of assimilation of minority groups.

Other research suggests it is likely that multiculturalism appeals more to ethnic minority groups than to majority group members, who in turn endorse assimilation more strongly (Sidanius and Pratto 1999). The authors go on to suggest that it can be expected that groups are more in favour of multiculturalism when they see gains for themselves. While some see multiculturalism as the key to managing cultural diversity (Parekh, 2001), others hold the view that ethnic and racial colour blindness allows for the treatment of individuals uniquely, without reference to race or ethnicity (Barry, 2002).

In addition, the distinction between voluntary and involuntary minority groups also raises the question of who may reasonably lay claim to ethnic recognition. Do immigrants, who leave their country of origin by choice have the same rights to claim ethnic minority status as those who are driven from their homes because of war for example? Should voluntary migrants be expected to assimilate into their new society while involuntary groups are more easily afforded ethnic status? Or do all groups who are historically identified as original inhabitants automatically earn the right to be viewed as ethnic, for example Irish Travellers or Native North Americans?

In his 1996 book, *Multicultural Citizenship: A Liberal Theory of Minority Rights*, philosopher Will Kymlicka argues that not all minority groups have equal claims, but that demands by original inhabitants to be recognised as ethnic are reasonable (Kymlicka, 1996). Immigrants, who move by choice on the other hand, waive their rights to ethnic recognition and should be expected to integrate into their new environment.

The debate deepens further when one looks at the question of social stability and cohesion. The 2004 study by Verkuyten, referenced above, indicated that those against the idea of multiculturalism, held that view because they feared that their society was more at risk. They were concerned that ethnic groups, or a diverse, multicultural society, would lend itself to an unstable environment (Verkuyten, 2004, Study 1).

Two similar studies carried out by the same researchers discussed the hypothesis – *the stability of a country is weakened by minorities who maintain their cultures and habits* – (Brug and Verkuyten; Verkuyten and Yildiz, 2007). The outcome of this research found that the majority groups stressed the importance of social cohesion and stability more than the minority (ethnic) groups. Additionally, the greater the emphasis placed on social cohesion by the majority groups, the less they were in favour of multiculturalism, and the more they favoured assimilation.

Having now examined broad, varying views on ethnicity, diversity and multiculturalism in the preceding paragraphs, I will focus on the Irish Traveller, specifically with regard to their place in broader Irish society. In order to provide a clear picture of how the dynamic between Travellers and non-Travellers, including the state, has emerged, it is important that I first lay out how the relationship between all stakeholders has changed over the second half of the twentieth century and onwards into today.

This depiction is as follows:

Until the middle of the twentieth century, the Irish Traveller served a specific function in Irish society. They travelled from village to village, carrying news, and providing services such as tin-smithing and paid labour at harvest time, often themselves benefitting from the harvest bounties. The horse was the primary method of pulling machinery on farms, consequently the Traveller held a valuable role with regard to buying and selling horses to and from the non-Traveller community at horse fairs.

At this time, employment and income generation for virtually all Travellers was on a contractual, entrepreneurial basis, where reliance on direct, fulltime, employment from the non-Traveller was almost non-existent. However, with the onset of industrialisation and wider practices of convenience purchasing, the Traveller was disproportionately affected and the working relationships quickly began to dwindle. For the most part, the relationship between Travellers and non-Travellers moved from a place of respect for hard work and loyalty to a situation where

the presence of Traveller camps at the roadside was, at best tolerated, on the understanding that their nomadic lifestyle meant their presence was short-term.

As the connection between both communities began to evaporate, so began a conversation within the government around how to address the issue of Travellers. It's important to note that this was not a conversation on how to address the differences between Travellers and non-Travellers, but more so on how to create an environment where Travellers could be assimilated (or absorbed) into a non-Traveller lifestyle and culture.

This approach is particularly pertinent when one reads the Report by the Commission on Itinerancy (1963) that arose from three years of work by the Commission on Itinerancy which was appointed by the Irish government in 1960. The Report is one of the first examples of the emergence of major gaps when it came to attempts to address the problem of exclusion and disenfranchisement of Travellers in Ireland. A big flaw in this report, though well-intentioned, is that it left out one of the key stakeholders involved, Travellers themselves. This recurring theme became commonplace during the following decades, especially with regard to government reports and policies on Travellers. Rosemarie Maughan, the National Youth Programme Coordinator with the Irish Traveller Movement, has described this flawed approach as having been "*about Travellers, without Travellers*". From the 1963 Report of the Commission on Itinerancy there arose a national programme of settlement, assimilation and rehabilitation of Irish Travellers. This programme established bodies that examined and directed policy on Traveller's lives in areas such as cultural development, health, hygiene, parenting, housework, training schemes, education, housing, and so on (Crowley: 2005). Una Crowley, The author of *Liberal rule through non-liberal means: The attempted settlement of Irish Travellers (1955-1975)* proposes that these bodies introduced more subtle and systemic methods of control that simultaneously encouraged and coerced Travellers to recognise their moral, social, and economic obligations to Irish society. Crowley quotes Gary Gutting in his 1994 work on the French philosopher Michael Foucault (1926-1984) where Gutting quotes Foucault's work on power and

knowledge as a means “to produce new gestures, actions, habits and skills and ultimately new kinds of people ready to return to society”.

As the disenfranchisement of Travellers increased, the idea that the solution to the differences between Travellers and non-Travellers would be found when Travellers ways were altered to the degree that their lives and lifestyles would assimilate into the ways of non-Travellers. Crowley suggests that that is the attempted aim of the Report of the Commission on Itinerancy.

One of the major issues with regard to the question around civil service employment for Travellers is complicated by the fact that much of the work done by government bodies to resolve these issues, has failed to include input from the Traveller community itself and has not adequately investigated how Travellers could continue with their traditions. This will now be explored by making reference to Claire Jane Snowdon and Leena Eklund Karlsson’s paper, *A Critical Discourse Analysis of Representations of Travellers in Public Policies in Ireland (2021).* This work was a comprehensive analysis of the discourse used by public bodies with regard to Travellers. They point out that the language used towards Travellers and about Travellers ensures that the relationship remains one where the Traveller is the lesser partner.

For example, the authors argue that the language used in the *National Traveller and Roma Inclusion Strategy 2017–2021* (NTRIS), opts for the word ‘inclusion’ in the title, but the chief authors, the Department of Justice and Equality, still uses terminology that separates Travellers from all others by using terms such as *non-Travellers* and *settled community*. The more deep-rooted message, the authors argue, is where words such as marginalised and disadvantaged are used. This suggests a sense of powerlessness and helplessness on the part of the Traveller community.

Snowdon and Karlsson (Year of publication) suggest that this discourse is part of the deliberate prolonging of imbalance between the Department of Justice and Equality and Travellers, hereby giving the government department the upper hand. I believe this view is unfair. I do not believe there is a deliberate plan on the part of a government body whose remit is to present a body of

work that will improve the lives and conditions of a section of the Irish population - to also ensure that the minority is kept in its place, and to ensure that the divide between the communities is maintained.

Additionally, the authors are critical of the language used in the NTRIS as it endorses the position taken by previous administrations and players who were and are against equality and inclusion for Travellers. There is a suggestion that the report, written by civil servants, with a very long foreword by the Minister, smacks of exclusion and does not include the Traveller community in coming up with solutions. Also, there is a lack of timeframes with regard to specific actions and the 'who, when, and where' element is missing. It is understandable that a critical analysis of the discourse by its very nature must highlight shortcomings in a piece such as the NTRIS, but one can argue that the intent of the authors and of all the stakeholders is being somewhat misrepresented and undermined. The authors of this discourse analysis suggest that there is a deliberate ploy on the part of the 'elite players' (in this case the Department of Justice and Equality) to continue the perception that Travellers are outside the community and not part of society. There is also criticism levelled at the passive language used in thirty-six of the thirty-seven stated objectives – where the word 'should' is used instead of 'will', however there are 149 actions listed in the document, all of which are written in the definite future tense.

In addition, there is reference to the addition of a 'progress to date' column in the document that would form the basis of an annual report in the future.

There has been some progress since the publication of the *National Traveller and Roma Inclusion Strategy 2017–2021* - Internship programmes referred to in Section 27 for example have been rolled out to varying levels of success since the publishing of this document; and funding for third level education for Traveller and Roma students has increased; however, there is little evidence that follow-up in the majority of the aims and objectives has emerged. The Irish Traveller Movement noted in 2021 that only 10 of the stated 149 actions had been completed, 12 were yet to be started, and the rest were ongoing (however, this implies that 127 of the 149 actions

were ongoing). The absence of visible progress endorses the views of the authors of the critical discourse analysis. It is a valid argument that the language used by the government when drafting the inclusion strategy was based on the thinking of several previous entities who were looking at the issues from the outside.

Having reviewed this literature, I am of the view that a clear picture of the attitudes of several stakeholders has developed. This picture suggests that, despite well-meaning and genuine attempts to create a workable environment for both Travellers and non-Travellers to co-exist, a large divide still survives. In particular the methodology used in the Verkuyten study of 2004 provides evidence of this. In order to accurately assess how this can be investigated, with a view to finding a resolution, it will be helpful to examine the progress that each stakeholder has made. This analysis will be conducted in the next chapter, and it will include an examination of how the government and civil service has changed and modernised over the past sixty years.

I will also take a similar look at Irish Travellers and assess how their role, and environment, in Irish society has changed. In so doing, it will be necessary to assess what Travellers have done to assist their developments, and how they could have done things differently. In this context, the dissertation will now proceed to a discussion on Irish Travellers as a distinct ethnic group.

Chapter 2: Irish Travellers as a Distinct Ethnic Group

The purpose of this chapter is to provide a backdrop to how and why Travellers are, to a very large degree, excluded by their non-Traveller counterparts. An examination will also look at what progress, if any, has been made in the sixty years or so since the first formal attempt by the government was made to address the issue. This interrogation will provide a link between the gaps identified in Chapter 1 and the position of stakeholders today with regard to Travellers' inclusion in society.

In Chapter 1, there was reference to the 1963 Report of the Commission on Itinerancy in Ireland. This report, published three years after the commission was formed, received much criticism. However it was the first attempt by the then government to address the Traveller 'problem', and it was perhaps an inevitable starting point when exploring the subject of Traveller / state relations.

Report of the Commission on Itinerancy (Commission on Itinerancy in Ireland: 1963)

The Commission on Itinerancy was established in 1960 by the Minister for Justice.

The membership of the Commission consisted of one High Court Judge; representatives from agricultural bodies; Health officials; A Catholic Church representative; one county manager; one senior Garda Siochána representative, and two public servants (one of which acted as Secretary to the Commission). As I have already highlighted, there were no representatives from the Traveller community appointed to the Commission. The opening address, delivered by Charles Haughey, Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Justice, spoke about the itinerant 'problem' and one of the terms of reference referred to the need for the commission to find a method of promoting absorption of the Traveller into the general community.

The use of the term 'final solution' in the Parliamentary Secretary's opening address - a term associated with the genocide of Jews under Nazi Germany – was at the very least unfortunate. The use of this language – whether intentionally, or unintentionally - in the inaugural speech at the launch of the Commission is seen as having undermined their purpose from the very outset.

The terms of reference also included the hope that the Commission would find a way *"to reduce to a minimum the disadvantages to themselves and to the community resulting from their itinerant habits" (1963:11).*

The view that the raison d'être for the Commission was flawed from the outset is reasonable – the language that was used could certainly have been more considered - but when put into the context of the previous 20 years or so, which saw huge change for the Traveller community, and by extension the non-Traveller community, then the efforts of the government and the Commission may be looked at slightly more sympathetically. It was the first official attempt to address what had become a life of hardship and deprivation for Travellers. However, as the reader makes their way through the report, it is hard to believe that Travellers were ever going to be viewed as anything other than an inconvenience that needed to be managed for the benefit of the non-Traveller community. Amongst the terms of reference in the Commission's remit, was an instruction to seek *to "examine the economic, educational, health and social problems inherent in their [Travellers'] way of life"* and *"to consider what steps might be taken to provide opportunities for a better way of life for itinerants" (1963:11).* So, while it appears that, at least, part of the remit of the commission was to look at how to improve the lives of Travellers, it also appears that the undertones of this instruction was to give legitimacy to flawed government policy by underpinning the plan to assimilate Travellers into settled life.

The exclusion of Traveller participation in the entire project is, by today's standards, a glaring omission, but sixty or so years ago, when the language used spoke of the "itinerant problem", it was an assumption that the perceived problem makers, could not be part of the answer. Indeed, in discussion with one particular focus group during research for this thesis, the point was made that today, in 2025, many policies and plans directly pertaining to Travellers are still being made without their consultation. The Commission looked further afield to our European neighbours to determine if other countries had faced these 'problems' and how they dealt with them. All of Chapter III of the report refers to the Commission's visit to the Netherlands and their findings.

When commenting on the provision of camps by the Dutch authorities for Travellers, they observe;

> *"It is stressed that these regional camps are not to be regarded as an end in themselves, but as a means to give the itinerant population an opportunity to narrow the gap between themselves and the settled community and to enable them to take part in the ordinary social life of the country" (1963:24)*

But the Commission states that this does not imply that there was a policy of removing the nomadic way of life from Travellers, it was more so a means of allowing younger Travellers to have the benefits afforded their non-Traveller equivalents. The Commission does however acknowledge that this approach will serve the purpose over time of causing all Travellers to settle down and abandon the nomadic lifestyle. The Commission also addressed topics such as the attitude of the settled population to Itinerants, where time and again, Travellers are viewed as nuisances to the non-Traveller. The social and ethical behaviour of Travellers including attitudes of Travellers to the settled population, and their attitude to the property of the settled population, is examined and a recommendation that the law be enforced to ensure that laws around begging, for example are comprehensively applied to the Traveller.

With regards to sexual morality and the Traveller, the Commission points out that sexual morality is at a very high standard owing mainly to the cramped conditions in which Travellers live and owing to the fear of immorality or adultery being revealed. The Commission's observations on attendance at church for the almost all catholic Traveller population is not so positive, the Commission is of the view that 'most of them are remiss when attending to their religious duties on Sundays or church holidays'. This is accompanied by a recommendation that a National Chaplain be appointed by the Catholic Church to address their spiritual care.

In Chapter XVI – General Recommendations - the authors of the report conclude that the only way to resolve the Traveller problem is to carry out a programme of absorption into settled life. The authors suggest, along with state help for housing, furniture, etc., that local committees

should be set up to act as liaison between the settled community and Travellers. The suggestion is;

> *"this can best be done by establishing friendly contact and by regular visitation to obtain their confidence and then to encourage them and their children to learn and adopt the ways of the settled life" (1963:107)*

This approach, it is hoped, will allow the settled community to provide the Travellers with lessons in cookery, housekeeping and hygiene and thereby encouraging the absorption and rehabilitation of the Traveller. It is difficult to look back at the *Report of the Commission on Itinerancy* in Ireland with an open mind. Even taking into account the environment in which it was written, it still depicts a very hostile environment for the Traveller and places virtually all of the burden of finding the answers to the problems squarely on the Traveller, and their willingness to change. The report more or less demands that the Traveller should adapt a willingness to leave behind their traditions and culture and become part of 'settled' society in order to be acceptable in that society. However, this is nonetheless a very important document because it started a decades-long conversation on the place of the Traveller in Irish society, and it also shines a light on the attitudes of non-Travellers towards the Traveller. On the 50th anniversary of the publishing of the Report of the Commission on Itinerancy, The Irish Traveller Movement (ITM) presented a review of the original report.

Review of the Commission on Itinerancy Report (Irish Traveller Movement: 2013)

While it is entirely reasonable to assume that the ITM review was going to be biased insofar as the Traveller – the subject of the original report – was unfairly depicted in the 1963 document, so the review was more of a critique than a balanced assessment of the work done by the Commission and the ensuing report.

The ITM made many valid points with regard to the Commission's focus being mostly placed on the problems ***caused*** by Travellers instead of focussing on the problems, prejudices, and exclusion that Travellers face.

The review was carried out by the ITM almost four years before Travellers were granted ethnic status. The view of Traveller activists was, and to a substantial degree still is, a belief that discrimination and exclusion is as alive and well in modern Ireland as it was when the Commission first met in 1960. The review points out;

> *"The Commission takes it for granted that Travellers are demonized and viewed as inferior by the settled population, yet this attitude is never analysed (let alone denounced) for what it is: a racist, discriminatory attitude" (2013:7)*

Fifty years on, when the review was written, Traveller activists in the Irish Traveller Movement and in other representative bodies, feel that they are still fighting a tide of discrimination and prejudice towards their people. The background to this prejudice will be explored further in this thesis.

Portraying Irish Travellers (Ciara Breathnach: Aoife Breathnach: 2006)

Ciara Breathnach and Aoife Breathnach in their book Portraying Irish Travellers (2006) provide a very clear explanation of how the chasm between Traveller and non-Traveller evolved. It may not have originated, but it certainly developed, after the demise of services provided by Travellers, particularly the likes of tinsmithing which was a means of generating income for the male Irish Traveller. Coupled with this was the gradual disappearance of the horse fair which had been a focal point for both Traveller and non-Traveller to meet and engage.

The authors explain how the non-Traveller male tramp, a representative of nomadic lifestyle, provided a door-to-door service in the form of bringing news, or story telling or even playing the fiddle. As an individual, he was welcomed into the household where he dined and sometimes slept in exchange for providing entertainment to the residents. He had a regular route on which he travelled, so a level of familiarity and friendship was built up over time. As the economy became stronger and as we moved further away from the Great War, the 'make do and mend' approach was replaced by a life where replacing a pot or pan was more affordable, and therefore the services of the travelling tradesmen went into decline very quickly.

Traveller survival now proceeded to fall more onto the shoulders of the women and their children who went door-to-door begging for food and subsistence. The Traveller woman and her children offered prayers for those who donated, and curses to those who did not. The Traveller woman had to take on a persona of victimhood and misery in order to gain the pity of the benefactor. She had to endure the shame of making herself and her children look less-than in the eyes of the householder. In addition, there was no sitting by the fireside with the hosts, telling stories and making conversation – instead they briefly, and unevenly interacted, before returning to their camp fire and temporary dwelling – remaining fully apart, in every sense, from the non-Traveller community. The introduction of welfare payments for the elderly, in the form of the Old Age Pension, meant that rural households became less reliant on the need to produce their own foodstuffs, thereby gradually reducing or eliminating the surplus that was given to Travellers

who called. From the mid-twentieth century onwards, the art of begging by Traveller women began to decrease and was almost non-existent by the 1980s.

Post World War II, the introduction of motorised machinery and the decreasing need for horses, rang the death knell for the demise of the fair and with that demise, came a further estrangement of relations between the Traveller and non-Traveller. For the most part, the horse fair was a much more equally-footed scene, where the non-Traveller haggled with, and bought from the Traveller horse seller. It was a significant social setting for both, and allowed an engagement that was highly valued by both communities. What was divisive was the 'art' of fighting - predominantly by Traveller men at these fairs – which was considered as entertainment by non-Traveller spectators. The authors suggest that these fights took place, partly to enable the Traveller man to exercise his prowess, but they also fought because of the absence of a state legal and judicial system that would have allowed Travellers to process their grievances.

By the time the Commission on Itinerancy in Ireland set about their task in 1960, a considerable divide had evolved between Traveller and non-Traveller.

A Social Portrait of Travellers in Ireland (Dorothy Watson, Oona Kenny and Frances McGinnity, ESRI: 2017)

In January 2017 the Economic and Social Research Institute (ESRI) presented a research paper called *A Social Portrait of Travellers in Ireland* (Dorothy Watson, Oona Kenny and Frances McGinnity: 2017). This paper was part of a programme of research on equality.

The authors of this paper provided a succinct description of the type of discrimination faced by Travellers, as follows;

> *"A background and history of extreme prejudice and discrimination against Travellers has necessitated their identification as a group to be protected against discrimination under Irish equality legislation. This negative attitude towards Travellers is documented in MacGréil's work (2010, 2011). Drawing on a national survey of attitudes towards different groups, MacGréil reports that sixty per cent of the population in Ireland would not welcome a Traveller as a member of the family; sixty four per cent reject Travellers on the basis of their 'way of life' and eighteen per cent would deny Irish citizenship to Travellers. Findings by Tormey and Gleeson (2012) indicate that attitudes towards Travellers among young people are less favourable than attitudes towards migrant groups" (2017:2)*

While this research paper covered several aspects of Traveller conditions including education, employment, accommodation and health, I will focus on the employment element of their research only. Citing the 2011 statistics provided by the Central Statistics Office, the authors state that only 11% of Travellers were in employment. One of the reasons for such low employment is the absence of a formal or adequate education and conversely, there was a considerable rise in employment when higher levels of education was attained. Having said that, men were more likely to be in employment, whereas women with children were less likely (2017:35).

The authors concluded that Travellers were almost twenty times more likely to be unemployed than non-Travellers, however, this fell to being approximately nine times more likely to be unemployed when education was taken into account (2017:70). While it's still a shockingly high ratio, it does serve to highlight the benefit of education among Travellers.

It is the view of the authors of this paper, and also of many other contributors to this thesis, that the attitude towards school and education is formed in the home and this poses heightened challenges for parents of Traveller children. Primarily, because Traveller parents have not themselves engaged in the education system. They are therefore ill-equipped to promote education and further education for their children. The authors cite a number of opportunities that can be implemented to at least partially offset this disadvantage. These measures include engagement with parents, provision of supports, and the addition of after-school study facilities to overcome the problems created by lack of space in Traveller accommodation. Inclusion in after-school activities to enhance social interaction for the benefit of Traveller children and non-Traveller children alike is also recommended. These exact measures were highlighted by two other contributors to the discussion around Traveller children and education. These measures, and proposals to implement them, will be addressed further on.

Irish Travellers: The Unsettled Life: Sharon Bohn Gmelch and George Gmelch (2014)

In *Irish Travellers: The Unsettled Life (2014)*, the authors Sharon Bohn Gmelch and George Gmelch provide a detailed written and visual account of typical Traveller experiences throughout Ireland over past decades. The written accounts of some of the contributors also provide a background to the reasons for the divide between Traveller and non-Traveller communities.

The story of Martin Ward from Tuam in County Galway who was the first member of the Traveller community to become a Mayor in Irish politics when he became Mayor of Tuam in 2003, depicts the circumstances in which a Traveller child in the sixties, seventies, and eighties would have approached education and employment.

Martin is a pioneer in working for the betterment of Travellers and early on in his story he talks about his own attitude towards education and the general outlook from the Traveller community as follows;

> *"Education was not important to us kids. To my parents it was only important to be able to read a letter and write our names. That's all that mattered. Everything else was unnecessary and a waste of time" (2014:137)*

Martin talks about the need to get out of school at the earliest age and find a way of generating an income, he says his parents held the view;

"...that if you were fifteen, you were too old to be going to school. You should be out earning a living for yourself, contributing to the family..." (2014:138)

He speaks of the need to survive, a challenge which runs through the recent history of the Traveller and is well referenced in Travellers' accounts of discrimination and exclusion.

Martin Ward has worked all of his life in local politics and in social development, with emphasis on Traveller conditions, in the Tuam area. He has seen significant changes in how Travellers have altered their attitudes towards education and the subsequent change in the collective self-belief and esteem of the Traveller community. This change has come about since the introduction of support services aimed specifically at Traveller children and youth. Martin talks about *"a new way of thinking"* including his own personal outlook towards education where he himself returned to studies acquiring a Diploma from the National University Ireland Galway and a Bachelors Degree from Athlone Institute of Technology. Significantly, he raises the question of Travellers contributing to their own *"downfall"* (in the context of education and employment). He suggests that;

"We can't carry a negative chip on our shoulders thinking that people are against us, that people are always out to keep us down. If we think negative, that negativity gets passed on in our attitudes to other people and potential employers" (2014:141).

This view, apart from being a somewhat pragmatic approach, is a vision of what the Traveller can do for their own empowerment and for the empowerment of generations to come.

This precise sentiment was also present in interviews and focus groups where conversation turned to the discrimination that Travellers face. In all cases the views of the participants were that, while overt racism and discrimination is unpleasant and upsetting, by employing an approach of rising above it and not engaging or responding, the Traveller was doing more for their own betterment than responding in kind. Up to this point, this chapter has primarily looked at the history behind the discrimination and exclusion of Travellers in many aspects of society. The focus has been on why the gap that appears to have widened between both communities has led to a lack of meaningful engagement with Travellers. The following articles that will form the last part of this chapter are included because it is important to put into context the work that has been carried out, and the work that continues, to provide a more level playing field for Travellers.

While the question raised in this thesis refers specifically to the relationship between the Irish civil service and the Irish Traveller, there is a much broader context to be considered. Up to now we have looked at the increasing divide between Traveller and non-Traveller. The next part of this analysis is going to look at the Traveller community itself and problems that lie therein.

Later, in discussing the focus groups and interviews element of the research, a further exploration of Traveller's roles in contributing to the problems, and what can be done to effect change, will be undertaken.

The *National Traveller and Roma Inclusion Strategy 2017 – 2021*

The *National Traveller and Roma Inclusion Strategy 2017 – 2021* is a Strategy document that was published in 2017 in the immediate aftermath of Irish Travellers gaining recognition as an ethnic group. It was a broad document taking a view of all of the socio-economic conditions that impacted Travellers. Drawing on research carried out by other contributors, the authors of this strategy presented a bleak picture of the severe challenges faced by Travellers. These challenges include shorter life expectancy; higher infant mortality rate; higher levels of poor mental health (including much higher rates of suicide particularly amongst young male Travellers); poor physical health; low levels of employment; and lower levels of education (2017:11).

The obstacles faced by Travellers also has the effect of generating collective poor esteem and shame which serves as a further alienator when it comes to recognition of ethnicity and pride in their culture and traditions. However, what is most encouraging about this strategy is;

(i) This document was published in the immediate aftermath of Travellers gaining ethnic recognition and therefore there is a sense of momentum and optimism around the possibility of improved conditions for Travellers;

(ii) There is a strong element of joined up thinking in this strategy document where several relevant agencies are involved to provide their input, and most importantly several Traveller and Roma activist groups and support bodies are included.

(iii) As previously stated, Rosemary Maughan, National Youth Coordination Officer with the Irish Traveller Movement has often referred to policies and strategies relating to the Traveller community as being *"about the Traveller, without the Traveller".* This document goes some way to addressing this phenomena*;*

(iv) A steering Group holds periodic reviews of progress being made and plans pathways forward;

(v) Agencies who deal with related issues such as gender inequality, gender-based violence, alcohol/drug misuse, were also asked to provide input into strategies going forward.

The breadth of this strategy document brought several topics into focus for discussion.

In the context of employment, and specifically employment in the Civil and Public Service, an internship programme was listed as one means of introducing Travellers into public service employment (2017:27). This internship programme was rolled out to Traveller and Roma persons in July of 2023 where 25 places were made available in various civil service departments in Dublin and Kildare. In addition, in September 2022, the Garda Siochána ran an internship programme aimed specifically at minority groups and in this case it is intended to offer an opportunity to apply for fulltime positions through a competition confined to those who graduate the internship. The *National Traveller and Roma Inclusion Strategy 2017 – 2021* will be referred to throughout this thesis as it forms a basis for planning how improvements can be made with regard to the conditions under which Travellers live. There will also be a review of this strategy document to assess how much was implemented and what remains to be done.

Joint Alternative Report by a Coalition of Traveller and Roma Organisations (2022)

From the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights – Ireland, there emanated a report by a Coalition of Traveller and Roma Organisations (May 2022). This coalition was made up of five separate Traveller Representative groups – Pavee Point Traveller and Roma Centre; National Traveller Women's Forum; Donegal Travellers Project: Minceirs Whiden (Cant for Travellers talk); and Galway Traveller Movement.

The coalition called on the government to implement much of what it had already committed to in previous policies and strategies and also to what it had included in its own Programme for Government which is the agreed document between the three parties that make up the existing

(2020 – 2025) government in Ireland (The then government being a coalition of three parties - the Green Party, Fianna Fáil, and Fine Gael).

The Programme for Government contains commitments to a successor to the National Traveller and Roma Inclusion Strategy 2017-2021 that will focus on stronger outcomes. This will include the development of a comprehensive Traveller and Roma Training, Employment and Enterprise Plan (2020:77). The five-party coalition called for the immediate implementation of this commitment. This Programme for Government document also espouses a commitment to initiating pilot projects that are aimed at retaining Traveller and Roma children in school and also at strengthening access to higher education for members of the Traveller and Roma communities. The five party coalition who wrote the Joint Alternative Report calls for the strengthening of this commitment. The coalition also calls on the government to realise its commitment to developing a comprehensive Traveller and Roma Training, Employment and Enterprise Strategy.

The following chapter will explore how political and social factors of the post-world war two era, and throughout the second half of the twentieth century, formed the basis for a widening of the gap between Traveller and non-Traveller communities. This contextualisation will create a picture of how all communities have also developed in the latter part of the twentieth century / early twenty-first century and the final element of this exercise will demonstrate how all communities have overlapped. How each party has been affected and responded will be discussed so that a clear picture will emerge explaining where the relationship currently stands and how this relationship has arrived at its existing point.

Evolution of the Traveller Community

The 1960s is a key timeframe to begin with, because it was a period in Irish history where economic and cultural change was happening at a phenomenal rate. It also coincided with Travellers being moved further out to the fringes of society as industrialisation and higher standards of living caused the reduction, or indeed the elimination, of a need for their services.

The literature in the previous chapter that focusses on Travellers depicts a recent history of how their lives have evolved to their detriment. In a rapid change in society during the second half of the twentieth century, their lives became almost unrecognisable. They went from integrating with, and having broad parity with the non-Traveller, to being ousted to the margins of society where they were often generally viewed as a dishonest, lazy and violent group of people. This view continues to this day. The non-Traveller community viewed the Traveller as a nuisance and a problem to be solved. We see how the aim was to eliminate the way of life of Travellers in favour of the more 'settled' lifestyle. These attitudes are mostly evident in the Report of the Commission on Itinerancy (Commission on Itinerancy in Ireland: 1963). However, it is important to recognise that although many modern commentators will suggest that the commission and its subsequent report was short-sighted and one-sided, this work was begun when the Irish state was less than fifty years old and at a time when the second world war was only fifteen years behind us. Some of the literature referred to in the previous chapter highlights the powerful contributions made by the Traveller community as a collective and by many individuals within the community. Two of the literature pieces *Portraying Irish Travellers (2006) and Irish Travellers: The Unsettled Life (2014)* focus on depicting the strengths and contributions that Travellers brought to society**.** This is very important because much of the discourse that originated around Travellers, especially that written in the 1960s, not alone excluded Travellers, but also focussed on the issue as a problem-solving exercise. It should have been framed as an inclusive conversation around how best to accommodate the Traveller tradition within the broader non-Traveller community. Or, with the advent of ethnic recognition in 2017, how to recognise the Traveller way of life as a separate ethnic entity in Ireland.

The 2014 work (Gmelch and Gmelch), while, as a literature piece, is much more personal than academic, it is important because it shines a light on the work of individuals and highlights their contributions to the betterment of Travellers. The quotes on page 21 attributed to Martin Ward from Tuam, Co Galway, match the comments made repeatedly throughout interviews and focus

groups when researching this thesis. The interviews and focus groups that were held with Traveller groups and separately, with Traveller representative groups, contained a recurring recognition that Travellers had a part to play in the evolution of disharmony between themselves and non-Travellers. Several of the contributors readily commented that, while there is clear discrimination from non-Traveller voices that exists solely because of racism, there is also a recognition that some elements within the Traveller community, through their attitudes and behaviours, have a level of responsibility for the bias that is shown towards their people. This will be explored in more detail in the Methodology chapter.

Role of the State

The cultural changes of 1960s Ireland moved at such a pace that the administration struggled to keep up. Economic expansion, while hugely welcomed, put a spotlight on the deficiencies within Irish officialdom. The young nation was still trying to find its feet and cope with expansion in many directions.

The challenges that faced the country after World War two included the inability of the establishment to cope with the unprecedented economic growth across the continent of Europe. Basil Chubb's assessment of the Public Services Organisation Review Group highlighted two major weaknesses in government. One was the inability to formulate policy, and the second was the lack of co-ordination between government departments (2014: 243). The Irish government was under very significant pressure to keep up with rapid change. In the midst of this change, the government undertook a large-scale assessment of Irish Travellers (itinerants) by establishing the commission on Itinerancy in Ireland. The subsequent report from that commission has already been reviewed in the literature chapter, but it is mentioned again because, for all its flaws, it was a comprehensive well-meaning undertaking from the government to try to deal with a major social issue.

By the 1970s, the government was grappling with rapid change, the Irish civil service was trying to introduce practices and policies that made conditions more commensurate with a modern society. Policies around equality, gender, and disability were examined and often small, but very meaningful, changes were made. The discontinuation of the marriage bar in 1973 meant female employees could remain in work after getting married. The Government's 3% target for the employment in the public service of people with a disability was announced in 1977. In 1972 work began to eliminate the pay gap between male and female civil servants (a gap of 20% existed until the Equal Pay Act was introduced in 1974). In 1973, Ireland and our nearest neighbours, Great Britain, joined the European Economic Community (EEC) which opened up many challenges and opportunities. This was effectively the beginning of greater cultural, social and economic change than seen at any time in the country's short history.

Respective government departments have continued over the past decades to review policies that aspire to improve the lives and conditions of all citizens. The latter part of the literature review refers to government policies that have focussed on equality and diversity, which aims to eliminate discrimination towards minority groups, including members of the Traveller community. The next section will explore how groups representing Travellers have responded to policies and legislation and will also examine how meaningful the changes have been.

Representation of Travellers

Since the early-mid 1980s, numerous bodies representing Travellers in Ireland have been formed and many have done extensive work to highlight the poor living conditions of Travellers in Ireland and to work towards the elimination of discrimination.

The Dublin Traveller Education and Development Group (DTEDG) was formed in 1985 and later became known as The Pavee Point Traveller and Roma Centre. The Irish Traveller Movement was founded in 1990, and numerous local branches, like The Galway Traveller Movement have emanated from the umbrella group.

These groups provide support to Travellers, support which ranges from advocating for health, housing, education and employment, to counselling, psychotherapy, and gender empowerment. These services, over the past 40 years or so, since the establishment of Pavee Point and the Irish Traveller Movement, have provided very significant support to the Traveller community with regard to shining a light on the inequalities and discrimination that exist.

As a result of constant ongoing dialogue with government and representative bodies, the Traveller community was finally recognised as an ethnic group in March 2017.

While, symbolically, this was a major step forward for Travellers, discussions that were held with focus groups as part of the thesis research suggested that the overwhelming view of Travellers is that ethnic recognition in itself, has not been backed up by tangible change and action.

Non-Travellers Attitudes and Behaviours

Among a significant portion of the non-Traveller community, there is a strongly held view that Travellers are far too heavily dependent on the welfare state and the black market. Not alone do non-Travellers hold the view that the Traveller community operates outside the law, but there is also a view that the Traveller's lifestyle is entirely alien to the non-Traveller community. Specifically, using reference to activities such as online videos of individuals challenging their fellow Travellers to fights (call out videos), bare knuckle fighting, family feuds, disruptive behaviour at large family occasions, specifically at weddings and funerals. During discussions with Travellers focus groups, and with Travellers' representatives in one-to-one interviews, there was a ready acknowledgement that a small number of Travellers engage in ways of generating livelihoods that is often not legal. However, the broader picture of how non-Traveller communities see their Traveller counterparts, highlight two specific concerns; (i) the commonly held view that all Travellers fall into the categories listed above; and (ii) the derogatory discourse that is used so easily in non-Traveller circles, when referring to Travellers, which can be heard

on a daily basis. This is discourse that is used by persons who would not consider[FB3] themselves as racist, or who are otherwise reasonable and tolerant individuals. Equally as alarming, is the fact that this racist and discriminatory language is rarely challenged. Indeed, the individual who uses this language would most likely be shocked if it were pointed out them that their language and outlook falls under the heading of racism – such is the degree of cultural acceptance that exists with regard to non-Traveller attitudes towards Travellers. It must be highlighted that not all Travellers fall under the headings listed above, and it has to be equally accepted that the entire non-Traveller community does not hold the views listed in the previous paragraphs.

Snowdon and Karlsson's 2021 paper on discourse used in official reports (see page 10), may imply that it is all too easy to stray into the territory of depicting Travellers as something that they are not. This is not the case. In the context of this thesis question with regard to how both the Irish civil service and the Traveller community have responded to employment in the civil service, the views of both communities towards each other, play a pivotal part in creating resistance to engaging in this employment. This will be discussed in greater detail when the views of individuals and groups are explored in the interviews and focus groups later in this work.

The Role of the Church

A brief reference to how the church has had an influence in Traveller's lives is included because, in general, the Traveller community have historically held, and largely continues to hold, a very strong affiliation to their church and to their religious beliefs. Almost exclusively, Travellers identify as Roman Catholic and they still hold many old-fashioned views that can act as deterrents to progress, including in the context of employment - specifically employment for female members of the community. The interviews that I held provided a clear picture of how, in general, Travellers believe that the woman's place is in the home and the man's role is to be the breadwinner. The man, as the head of the household, is the final authority. The focus groups provided strong feedback that the male Traveller would not fit comfortably into the civil service

structure. This feedback emanated, to a large degree, from lack of knowledge on how the civil service is structured, feelings of inadequacy around reading and writing, and alienation by and from the non-Traveller civil servant. While it may be unfair to attribute the lack of employment for Travellers in the Irish civil service to the Catholic Church, there is very definitely a strong link between Traveller's views and the teachings of the church, and the disadvantages that exist therein. This will be explored further in the interviews section.

The next chapter will look at the Irish civil service in the context of diversity and inclusion policies.

Chapter 3: The Evolution of Diversity and Inclusion in the Irish Civil Service

One of the key stakeholders in this thesis is the Irish civil service – and an assessment of its role will form the first part of this chapter. The second part of this chapter will look at how the civil service has evolved and how it has addressed shortcomings in equality and diversity.

While reference will be repeatedly made to the Irish civil service, it can be taken that, in reality, this refers to how government policy unfolded over the decades through the various government departments that are managed and run by civil servants. So, when the question is asked "how has the Irish civil service responded to changes in recent years…" the question could as easily read "how has the Irish government responded to changes in recent years…"

The content will also rely on policy documents and papers commissioned by the government, as it will on academic writings and books. This is because much of the work that has been undertaken by government and by Traveller representative bodies, has been published as policy documents. Reports and publications from the Irish Traveller Movement (ITM), Pavee Point Traveller and Roma Centre, and the Central Statistics Office (CSO) provide data and information that paints a clear picture of the challenges faced by Travellers in several aspects including with regard to employment.

Evidence of the work that has been done by government bodies and agencies, and by Traveller representative groups, will deal with the specific question of employment for Travellers, but it will also be necessary to look at the broader picture of the socio-economic background of the country, the outlook and attitudes of government bodies, and how this impacted Irish Travellers.

The thesis topic itself "*civil service employment for Travellers in the context of building on symbolic ethnic recognition"* attempts to look at progress around creating a level of parity between Travellers and non-Travellers, particularly in light of the Traveller community gaining ethnic recognition in March 2017. The thesis title raises the question about whether or not ethnic

recognition has impacted Traveller's ability or willingness to gain employment in the Irish civil service.

The Irish civil service has been included in this thesis because it is an agent of the government and employs over 45,000 on behalf of the government (Parliamentary Budget Office 2022). There is much evidence that, as an employer, a lot of work has been done with regard to equality and diversity. Therefore the Irish civil service is well placed to be scrutinised in the context of this thesis. It is necessary to focus on the civil service, its shortcomings, and how it has evolved over recent decades. The first part of this examination will look at how the civil service has made progress and how it has found its place in taking on the role it is expected to carry out. What will become apparent from the references will be that this role changes as national and global socio-economic situations change.

Joseph Lee's Ireland 1912-1985 (1989) explores how Ireland evolved over the course of about seventy years. Lee provides a broad picture of how the political establishment developed and how social services and supports were introduced. In the course of these developments, during the Lemass Government of the 1960s, efforts were made to reform the civil service;

"Lemass presided over the creation of an organisational infrastructure that would provide some alternative sources of advice for policy-makers. He did not visualise these other bodies as rivals to the civil service, but as reinforcements. The Economic Research Institute established in 1960, and An Foras Forbartha, established in 1964, were perhaps the most prominent additions to the IPA, AFT and the IMI (Institute of Public Administration, An Foras Taluntas, and the Irish Management Institute) established in the course of the 1950s.

The National Industrial and Economic Council, representing employers' organisations, trade unions and the government, was set up in 1963. It would be superseded in 1973 by a more broadly based body, now including agricultural interests, the National Economic and Social Council. The quality of many of the reports issued by these bodies improved the flow of information and intelligence available to such decision-makers as choose to take cognisance of them"

(1989:365). This reflects the evolution of the civil service and how the decision-making processes were being altered and implemented during this time.

The Public Services Organisation Review Group, which became known as the Devlin Group, so called after the chairman Liam St. John Devlin, was appointed by the government of 1966.

The Government and Politics of Ireland (Chubb: 2014) is critical of the Irish civil service of the mid-sixties. His assessment of the Devlin Group suggests that repeated recommended changes were slow to see implementation. The purpose of the Devlin Group was "*having regard* to *the growing responsibilities of Government, to examine and report on the organisation of the Departments of State at the higher levels, including the appropriate distribution of functions as between both Departments themselves, and Departments and other bodies" (2014: 243).*

This review was established as a result of a dire need to address financial pressure. On this occasion, the financial pressure arose from the failings of the public service to respond to unprecedented fiscal growth, where the Irish state struggled to benefit from the rapid financial expansion that began in the early 1960s. The lack of expertise and knowledge was obvious to the civil service management itself to the point that the role of the Civil and Public Service needed to change considerably to accommodate economic expansion.

The Devlin Review Group published a wide-ranging report that broadly focussed on how the delegation of functions would enhance the efficiency of the Public Service. Most of the recommendations were never implemented, or, at best, diluted versions of recommendations were introduced. When recommended changes were introduced, they were often done so on a sporadic basis in perhaps one or two departments, as opposed to across the entire civil service.

However, the Devlin report is viewed as the basis for recognising how the Public and civil service needed to change. Indirectly, many of the recommendations *were* eventually introduced, in varying guises, over the following fifty years or so. A more recent assessment of the civil service and its shortcomings is outlined clearly in Irish Government Today (O'Toole: 2023). In his assessment of modern Irish Government, the author provides a comprehensive overview of the

civil service (2023: 293-373). O'Toole highlights how change has been implemented in the Irish civil service over the past decades, especially arising from the financial crisis of 2008. Ongoing modernisation programmes have aided in the evolution of a more equal civil service. Equality continues to be addressed with regard to policy around gender and diversity towards persons with disabilities. Pay parity and representation at higher grades for female civil servants is well established (2023:334).

The 2020 Programme for Government, and The Comprehensive Employment Strategy for People with Disabilities (2015-2024) have also outlined ambitious targets to increase the numbers of persons with disabilities in the civil service (2023: 347). The entirety of chapter six of O'Toole's work, titled The civil service (2023: 293-373), which addresses the make-up and role of the civil service, is very supportive of how the organisation functions today, but equally, the author is very sympathetic to how the civil service has responded and evolved, over the past decades, essentially since the foundation of the state. The current programme for government (2025-2029) has committed to implementing several programmes for Traveller and Roma groups surrounding inclusion, health, education, and financial support (p.99).

Finally, as part of the review of how the government and civil service continues to change to accommodate new ways and practices, including the management of diverse cultures and people, Norma Riccucci's Managing Diversity in Public Service Workforces (2020) is worth referencing. Although Riccucci's work is based exclusively on data from workforces in the United States of America, the sentiment expressed in the chapter on Race and Diversity Management (2020:129) is relevant to this study. Riccucci states that entrance exams into the civil service are based on passing a civil service exam known as a merit exam, as it is practice that the persons who attains the highest merit in the process is most entitled to be employed. However, the author suggests that the attainment of the position on merit is flawed because the exams themselves are often found to be culturally biased and not job related (2020:136). Riccucci goes on to say that *mitigating cultural biases does not simply denote developing the exams in, for example, Spanish*

or an Asian language. Rather, it suggests that efforts are made to ensure that all the job applicants are operating from a level, fair playing field (2020: 136).

This observation is particularly relevant to this thesis because what emerges later in the research, in interviews and focus groups, is evidence that Travellers exclude themselves from civil service recruitment processes on the grounds of cultural and educational bias.

Diversity and inclusion

"Diversity is being invited to the party; inclusion is being asked to dance"

Vernā Myers *

Vernā Myers is an inclusion strategist, cultural innovator, thought leader, and social commentator. She is the author of **Moving Diversity Forward: How to Go from Well-Meaning to Well-Doing. Since 2018 she has been VP, Inclusion Strategy at Netflix leading a team in implementing strategies to integrate cultural diversity, inclusion, and equity into all aspects of the organization's global operations.*

The inclusion of this passage is necessary to put into context how the state has responded to marginalisation and exclusion in the past. The Irish civil service has been in existence for approximately 100 years and each decade has seen the introduction of new strategies and improvements with varying degrees of success – more recently, the 1980s saw the introduction of career breaks, flexi-time, and electronic salary payments, the 1990s heralded the Strategic Management Initiative (SMI) which, for the first time, made reference to performance appraisals for civil servants. In the first decade of the 21st century there was the first of several plans to renew the civil service. Mixed amongst the major changes have been a myriad of pay agreements, leave allowances, work-life balance initiatives, grade absorptions and, in the context of this thesis, there have been many initiatives to ensure that diversity and inclusion are part of the Irish civil service. For the purposes of putting the thesis question into context I will briefly make reference to two distinct groups that have been the focus of inequality in civil service employment and I will look at the positive changes that have been introduced over the past few decades. These

groups are; female employees who were subjected to gender discrimination in the Irish civil service and; individuals with disabilities in the Irish civil service.

Gender Inequality

Until 1973 a female civil servant in Ireland could not remain in employment if they opted to marry. This was known as the marriage bar and, while not exclusive to Ireland or indeed the civil service, it did impair career progression for female employees. In her paper written in 2022, Deirdre Foley (Foley: 2022) provides a clear outline of the background behind the marriage bar, and the reasoning (of the time) for its existence. Foley cites the influence of the Catholic Church and its dominance in Irish society as one of the main reasons for the retention of the marriage bar for so long. Additionally, the woman's place in the home was also firmly embedded in the Irish Constitution;

> *"In particular, the State recognises that by her life within the home, woman gives to the State a support without which the common good cannot be achieved. The State shall, therefore, endeavour to ensure that mothers shall not be obliged by economic necessity to engage in labour to the neglect of their duties in the home"*
>
> Irish Constitution (1937) Paragraph 41.2

Foley quotes Nancy Wyse Power (an Easter Rising activist and member of Cumann na mBan, and one of the first women to be appointed to the grade of Principal Officer in the Irish civil service) who stated in the 1950s;

> *"Any woman who is promoted must be greatly superior to her male competitors. It is not enough for her to be as good as them – or even a little better – she must be so outstandingly good that her claim cannot be ignored"*

To a certain degree, the view expressed by Nancy Wyse Power is still relevant today, almost three-quarters of a century later. As of 2017, while women make up 63.1% of the entire civil service, they occupy only 28.7% of senior positions (ESRI; 2017).

A 2020 Research document *"Gender Balance at Work - A Study of an Irish civil service Department"* prepared by Shannen Enright and Helen Russell (ESRI: 2020), identifies how

flexibility for working mothers, coupled with a raft of changes – as much cultural as procedural – would help to address gender imbalance with regard to promotion.

Individuals with Disabilities

The National Disability Authority (NDA) is an independent statutory body that provides information and advice to the Government on policy and practice relevant to the lives of persons with disabilities. In 2008 the NDA published the comprehensive document *"Effective Leadership and Organisational Culture for the Recruitment and Retention of People with Disabilities in the Irish Public Sector"* (NDA: 2008). This set out a clear background to the lack of progress in employment for persons with disabilities and the author, Juliette Alban-Metcalfe, outlined how an organisation who employs persons with disabilities can benefit;

> *"Research suggests that increasing contact with people with disabilities helps to reduce stereotypes and fears, and that knowing someone at work who has a disability is likely to lead to more inclusive attitudes towards disability and greater awareness of disability legislation. Therefore, organisations will benefit from a culture that is open to develop what may be new and innovative approaches to inclusion, such as work placements, work-shadowing and mentoring schemes"*

Effectively, the employment of persons with disabilities in the Civil and Public Service, in a meaningful way, not just to fill mandated quotas, is likely to lead to greater inclusion and greater benefits for the individuals and for the organisation. The *Comprehensive Employment Strategy for People with Disabilities 2015-2024* which was published by the Minister of State for New Communities, Culture, Equality and Drug Strategy outlined a ten year plan with reviews built in every three years and it states that;

"The use of internships and new recruitment avenues will be examined, along with the provision of special competitions restricted to qualified applicants with disabilities" (2015:22)

During research for this thesis, a representative from the Public Appointments Service spoke about great strides that are being made with regard to individuals with disabilities – particularly those with a physical disability, but also for persons with intellectual disabilities. Their view is that the intern programmes are of huge value both to the individual and to the organisation concerned. However, internships by their very nature imply that the process is finite and the retention of staff after the internship period has elapsed is still a challenge. The discontinuation of employment once the internship period has expired has nothing to do with the quality of the individual's work, or the nature of the work involved, but more to do with the regulations surrounding fulltime employees in the civil service. So, the Public Appointments Service is currently looking at ways to enable individuals who take part in internships to remain in their jobs on a permanent basis, once they satisfy the terms of their probationary/internship period. The Cardiff University paper - *Representation and Inclusion in Public Organizations: Evidence from the UK civil service (Andrews and Ashworth, 2014)* - finds that although urgent work is needed with regard to the role of organisational leadership and culture in shaping inclusive practices and processes, evidence demonstrates that representative bureaucracies not alone place a high value on belongingness and uniqueness, but also contributes to improved policy outcomes.

This dissertation will now move onto the Planning and Methodology Chapter.

Chapter 4: Research Planning and Methodology

The subject of my thesis question - ***How has the Irish civil service and the Traveller community in Ireland, responded to changes in employment, since ethnic recognition?*** [FB4]***?*** - might suggest that there is a normative influence, insofar as it is reasonable to hold the view that all members of ethnic groups should have an intrinsic right to food, shelter, income, healthcare and education. It would therefore be easy to assume that permanent, pensionable state employment would act as one way of providing that security, and it may also be reasonable to gather that that would be the wish of individuals (in this case, Travellers) to be employed. To reduce the risk of taking a normative approach by simply asking if the civil service does enough to offer employment to the Irish Traveller or if the conditions in which Travellers live are in line with 21st century values - the question must be asked "does the Irish Traveller believe that employment contributes to their customs and traditions?"

There are many variables to be considered when posing this question, for example, at just over 80% (CSO: 2016), is unemployment so high in the Traveller community because;

(i) Prejudices and discrimination towards Travellers prevent engagement;

(ii) nine-to-five employment is not part of Traveller culture;

(iii) low uptake in education in the Traveller community prevents participants from engaging in employment opportunities;

(iv) social welfare and the black economy;

(v) other unknown reasons

During interviews with several stakeholders, the opening question was often "Why are there so few Travellers employed in the Irish civil service?" and in almost every case, the response was "How do you know there are few Travellers employed in the civil service?" The fact is, it is difficult, if not impossible, to know to what degree the Traveller community is represented in the Irish civil service.

Interviews and focus groups with Travellers, Traveller representative bodies, and with the Public Appointments Service, all point towards the likelihood that many Travellers – most in fact - will hide their ethnicity, based on their lived experiences, when they engage with non-Traveller institutions. It would be easy to assume that secure employment is what the Traveller wants and needs, and the danger with taking this position has become apparent in historical attempts to find an end to the exclusion of Travellers.

The Commission on Itinerancy (1963) stated that *there could be no final solution until itinerant families were absorbed into the general community.* This made the assimilation of travellers into settled society the aim, and that strong normative theme placed limitations on the discussion - the idea that the relationship between Traveller and non-Traveller should be a certain way.

The broader subject of relations between the settled community and the Traveller community is emotionally charged. Many non-Traveller people will explicitly condemn the Traveller with the usual list of labels, while the Traveller man or woman will recite multiple experiences of discrimination and racism. It is therefore very important to conduct this thesis research with as much value-free narrative as possible. I have referred to this issue earlier in the thesis when I discussed discourse analysis (Snowdon and Karlssen).

The consistent, long-held position of the Traveller community – as espoused by representative groups like Pavee Point - has been that, as an ethnic group, Travellers must retain the right to practice their culture and values. Therefore it is arguable that providing long-term employment may have a detrimental effect. Assimilation into general society through employment may be the furthest thing from recognising ethnic identity. The question of employment for Travellers, while vital to their wellbeing and prosperity, is only one cog in the mechanism that makes up challenges facing Travellers. Until an umbrella approach to dealing with inherent difficulties is established and implemented, the question of employment in the Irish civil service, or any other employment, must be put into context.

The analysis of this long-term debate does not realistically lend itself to Quantitative Research methods – simply put, a survey or questionnaire will not effectively extract the information required. If quantitative research is, in its simplest form, primarily concerned with the gathering and analysis of data, and according to *Social Research Methods (Bryman: 2017)* qualitative research methods emphasise words rather than quantification, then qualitative research best fits the environment in which this thesis question sits. This is further supported by Bryman, who says that qualitative research is more likely to focus on the inductive approach, and will likely result in the emergence of theories. Qualitative research also takes the following into account:

(i) the ways in which the individual interprets their social world;

and

(ii) the view that social reality is constantly changing in the eyes of the individual / stakeholder.

I believe that Bryman's expansion of the qualitative research definition is key because it can bring the research from being a method into being a strategy, where the individual's interpretations and their view of social reality are taken into consideration. Because much of my research was conducted through interviews and focus groups the interpretations of the participants as they responded to questions had to be considered. By this I mean, when a response was given I had to question if it accurately reflected the lived experience of the respondent, or was it a learned response to a systemic situation? The very act of at least questioning the responses and the possible interpretations was of value, because it allowed me to pose additional questions to probe a little further. This was very helpful in highlighting emerging patterns and this approach also allowed me to drill down into certain scenarios. Additionally, Greg L. Lowhorn's 2007 paper *Qualitative and Quantitative Research: How to Choose the Best Design* (Regent University) also endorses qualitative research in this case where he says "....*quantitative research seeks to validate a theory by conducting an experiment and analysing the results numerically, qualitative research seeks to arrive at a theory that explains the behaviour observed..."* The observed behaviour is key to the research that I have carried out. In this case

the observed behaviour is decades long and includes the actions of all stakeholders – the state, the Traveller and the non-Traveller.

The Director of the University of Chicago's Writing Program, Larry McEnerney, states that *the function of (academic) writing is to move the conversation forward and to change the existing ideas of the community* (2014). I believe the existing ideas of the communities in this case are twofold: firstly, ideas of looking to see how change can be effected through state agencies, activists groups, and government departments: and secondly, ideas that allow the apportioning of blame to the other side be rigorously examined. When these ideas are not addressed all parties are often stuck in a place where it is not possible to reach consensus on how to move forward. The changes in attitudes and behaviours, on the part of one of the stakeholders, will be most beneficial if reciprocated by similar movement by the other stakeholder. The huge challenge is to have all parties implement changes that are mutually beneficial. A specific example of this is looking at how the systemic discrimination in the non-Traveller community can be lessened, while trust increases on the part of the Traveller. If this were to occur, then a more harmonious, or at least, a less acrimonious environment would exist.

Research Design

Consideration of research planning and methodology was essential to ensure that the most accurate information was extracted from the sources available and to convince the reader of its validity. This is based on the principle that the purpose of research is to generate new knowledge. When considering the most effective method of research design, it was necessary to reflect on how best to facilitate a discussion that would provide a clear picture of the issues and also of the likely compromises that would lead to a resolution of some or all of the obstacles. This could not be done by surveys, or by questionnaires, it was essential that participants were afforded the space, facility, and freedom to openly discuss and reflect on their respective positions. Therefore the obvious element of designing the research method, in addition to a comprehensive literature

review, was to include adequate provision for discussion. A combination of one-to-one discussions (interviews) and group discussions (focus groups) fed into the need for objective information gathering, coupled with times for thought, discussion, and disagreement.

Max Weber asserts that there cannot be complete objective analysis of social phenomena because value-neutrality is not possible in social sciences (Max Weber 1864-1920). This was a challenge because a subject as emotive as the relationship between Traveller and non-Traveller, where the former has experienced discrimination and exclusion to such a distressing level, carries a high normative value – where it is reasonable to assume that one knows what should be in this case.

The obvious, and ideal scenario, would be one where discrimination and racism does not exist, but when it does, there is a need for the discriminator to assess their role and reflect on why this is the case and what changes in behaviour are required to eliminate it. It is also necessary to ask the group against whom the discrimination is being levelled to assess how they respond to the hostility and to consider how the impact on them is manifested.

Feedback from focus groups and interviewees strongly indicated that the effects of discrimination and racism towards the Traveller people manifests in collective mistrust, shame, and poor self-perception. The challenge to the group being discriminated against is to find a way to rise above this behaviour and to step away from any ideology that provides ammunition to the aggressor.

Several times during discussion, Travellers spoke of how they were reared to ‘turn the other cheek’ with regards to behaviours and comments directed towards them. However, they recognised the effects this has on them as a people and as individuals.

Activists, who were interviewed for this project, also hold the view that the conditions around mental health and around high suicide rates are directly linked to the collective hurt and injury caused to Travellers.

The following individuals and groups were interviewed;

Source	**Details**
Traveller Focus Groups	3-10 participants. Where it was not possible to engage in a one-to-one interview or where I wanted to introduce a broader, perhaps more balanced, view.
Managers in Government Departments	Human Resource Manager(s); Recruiting/policy Staff in the Public Appointments Service;
Human Rights campaigners	One or more Human Rights campaigners who have a track record in working for human rights for Travellers.
Galway Traveller Movement	Senior person in the organisation.
Teacher, family liaison.	Specifically, one teacher who has more than 20 years teaching Traveller children at all levels.
Non-Traveller Focus Group	3-10 participants. In order to compliment the Traveller focus groups and to include views from those outside the Traveller community.

Reading

Much of the reading material was based on fact and therefore did not require a very high level of interpretation (policy documents, government acts, reports, etc.)

Publications that have been authored by interested parties, and might therefore be prone to bias, were read and analysed with caution – I will refer to this when I write about potential obstacles later in this assignment.

Interviews

The interviews were semi-structured and recorded by note-taking. Each interview participant was allocated an equal amount of time. Each individual participant was provided with a synopsis of the interview and given the opportunity to alter, add or retract any element. Phone interviews were avoided – in-person or Zoom interviews were held.

Focus Groups

Focus Groups were used to gather the views of members of both the Traveller Community and non-Travellers. They were held at centres where social groups regularly meet and clear guidelines surrounding terms of reference were provided. The reason that I used focus groups was that there was easier access to several people at once, and the nature of a focus group led to both discussion and dialogue in a more relaxed environment where participants appeared to rely on the support of their peers and where confidence grew as more and more participants opened up. I believe the outcome of the focus group discussions balanced well with the outcome of the one-to–one interviews.

Knowing when to use structured questions, versus informal questioning, and knowing how to structure the process so that the order in which the questions were asked contributed to the best outcome and allowed me to get the best value from the focus groups

Interviews and focus groups

The individuals and organisations that were approached for **interview** are listed in the table below;

Title/Name	***Contacted***	***Response/reply***
Former senior official in a Traveller Advocacy Group.	February 2022	No reply.
Traveller Liaison / information Officer in a third level institution.	March 2022	No reply.

Irish Human Rights and Equality Commission.	June 2022	Declined to provide someone for interview, but forwarded links to recent policy documents.
Irish Traveller Movement.	February 2022	Declined to be interviewed, but suggested contacting local (Galway) Traveller Movement.
Galway Traveller Movement.	April 2022	Provided a representative who took part in an interview.
Public Appointments Service.	June 2022	Provided a representative who took part in an interview.
Traveller Activist in West of Ireland	June 2022 and August 2022	No reply.
Pavee Point Traveller and Roma Centre.	July 2022	Declined to provide someone for interview, but forwarded links to recent policy documents.
Academic/activist from the Traveller community.	May 2022	No reply.
Teacher, with over 20 years' experience teaching Traveller children and adults, and working with Traveller families.	May 2022	Took part in an interview

Individual from the Traveller community who works in the civil service.	June 2022	Took part in an interview.
Activist from the Traveller community who deals with Traveller youth in employment.	April 2022	Took part in an interview.
Individual from the Traveller community who works in the private sector.	May 2022	Took part in an interview.
Housing officer with a Traveller Support Group	July 2022	Took part in an interview.
Representative from a consultation company that engages with public bodies to devise programmes for Travellers.	May 2022	Took part in an interview.

Each interview lasted approximately one hour and fifteen minutes in total, of which the first few minutes dealt with an introduction and practicalities on how I would conduct the interview and what was expected of the participant and also on how I was going to record the data collected. At the outset, I also gave the interviewee the option of remaining anonymous. In all cases the interviewees expressed a wish to have their identities withheld, and while this was somewhat surprising, it did allow me to ask probing questions that I might have otherwise steered away from (had the identity of the participant been revealed). I used the last ten minutes or so to recap what we had discussed, seek clarification if needed, and to allow the responder to look over their answers and either add in, remove, or withdraw their responses. I also encouraged each interviewee to contact me in the days that followed the interview if they felt there was anything about the process, or their answers, that caused them to become uncomfortable. No participants followed up with calls or changes after the interviews. Five of the interviews were held via Zoom; three interviews were held in person.

The following is a brief synopsis of three of the interviews that were held. The theme in several of the interviews was similar, so the following is a representative sample of the overall interview process.

Interviewee 1

The first interview was held with a representative of a Traveller organisation. They have worked as an activist for Travellers for many years and they drew on their experience as an activist, as a Traveller, and as a parent. I began by exploring why are there so few Travellers working in the civil service? The immediate response (from this Interviewee and from two other interviewees at later dates) was "how do you know there are few Travellers working in the civil service?

When this topic was probed further, it became clear that the interviewee knew of a number of Travellers in employment, both in the private sector and the public sector, who hide their ethnicity and are therefore not recorded as belonging to an ethnic minority. The most common reason, by far, for this approach is to protect themselves from bias, discrimination and exclusion. The interview participant in this case cited numerous cases from within their own family circle and from their work as activists where Travellers were subjected to racism, hate speech, harassment, and exclusion in their jobs. This interviewee recounted one example of where a Traveller worked in their job for just over one year before deciding to disclose to their manager that they were from the Travelling community. In this case, the manager proved to be very supportive and walked through the process of the Traveller 'coming out' to his colleagues. The experience was reported as being pleasant overall, with little or no negativity attached and full support from colleagues forthcoming. However, the experience of this individual is that they still endure everyday demeaning reference to their ethnic group and this, while not intended to be offensive, was (and is) the dialogue that workplaces tolerate and accommodate on a daily basis. The idea that something could be done to change this is not even a consideration for the average Traveller who is holding down a job among non-Traveller peers. They merely carry on accepting

that this discourse as part of their lives. The interviewee also believes that this is typical of many work environments, where language and demeanour towards any ethnic minority, but especially Travellers, is endemic. To the point that almost all who use these terms do not even recognise it as discriminatory language or behaviour, and most would be appalled if they thought that they were being perceived as racist or prejudiced. This fed into a discussion which centred on "*Do Travellers believe that they have the same employment opportunities as non-Travellers?"*

The response was an emphatic no. The interviewee themselves has had experience of what they referred to as 'institutional discrimination' where prejudice and bias against Travellers exist. The respondent cited their experience of institutional discrimination whereby they are followed by security personnel when they enter their local supermarket to do some shopping although they have done their weekly shopping in this supermarket for many years and have never given any reason to staff to suspect them of theft. The respondent believes that this behaviour on the part of non-Travellers is repeated in the workplace and that Travellers will mostly be viewed with suspicion. However, in the interests of balance, the interviewee was also quick to point out that there are several examples of where "Travellers do not help themselves". When asked to elaborate, they cited the existence of a plethora of videos on social media, particularly YouTube, depicting (usually) male Travellers engaging in violent and threatening behaviour (towards their fellow Traveller). It is the view of this contributor that these images portrayed by the Traveller only serves to endorse the biased or racist view of the Non-Traveller (the history of Traveller fighting stems from the understanding by Travellers that they did not necessarily have the support or sympathy of the civil authorities and they therefore developed their own system of justice and honour through fighting. But, over the decades this 'noble' fighting for the sake of honour, reputation and esteem, has been largely replaced with fighting that is based on profit and prize money).

Interviewee 2

This interviewee represented the Public Appointments Service (PAS). Their role in the Public Appointments Service is Head of Diversity and Inclusion. They had worked in the Office of the Mayor of London (under the previous mayor Boris Johnson and the current incumbent Sadiq Khan).

Because 15%-20% of people of working age in Ireland were born outside the state and this is not reflected in the Irish civil service demographic, the Public Appointments Service has ran campaigns for several sectors. The interviewee highlighted the programmes and recruitment campaigns that the Public Appointments Service has ran over the past 20 years or so that are targeting several minority groups, which includes the Traveller Community. The most recent campaigns aimed specifically at Travellers and Roma are an internship programme that offers paid placement to 25 individuals in counties Dublin and Kildare, and additionally, a Garda Siochána internship programme. While these internships will offer paid employment for a defined period of time (usually up to one year), and in addition will offer a wealth of experience for the individual and the employer, there is still an obstacle to these internships becoming fulltime employments. Additionally, one key obstacle appears to centre on the lack of education that interns may have and this can prevent them from being considered for fulltime similar posts in the Civil and Public Service. The Public Appointments Service has made representations to the Dept of Public Expenditure and Reform to have the education requirements for entry to the grade of Clerical Officer in the civil service removed so that those who do not meet the formal education requirement, can satisfy the entry requirement through perhaps an intern programme, or similar experience, and can be considered for fulltime positions by this means.

At present the Public appointments Service is also in discussion with the Dept of Public Expenditure and Reform to have the same criteria applied to those who engage with campaigns for the grade of Executive Officer in the civil service.

While all of the Public Appointments Service initiatives are moves in the right direction, there is a sense that participation in these endeavours, on the part of the Traveller community, is lukewarm at best. Given the difficult history that has existed between both communities, it is understandable that this would be the case, but it is a significant obstacle nonetheless.

Interviewee 3

This individual has over 25 years' experience working alongside Travellers and Traveller families to help improve their standard of living. They primarily engage with families both from an adult literacy perspective and also with regard to providing education through helping to ensure adequate school attendance for Traveller children. Their input into this discussion was unique in that, as a non-Traveller, they have been immersed in Traveller culture and their way of life for over a quarter of a century and they can see, from an educator's point of view, the impact that societal actions have on the community. campaigns in the civil service and why it is that there are therefore so few civil servants from the Traveller community, this contributor provided the following response which paints a bleak picture of Traveller life in 21st Century Ireland;

> *"Discrimination and racism exists within Irish society against Travellers. This can be a barrier to many getting work and finding housing. Young Travellers are aware of this discrimination from an early age and it impacts adversely on them. They learn from a young age that they are not considered as valuable as other members of society. This, along with other issues, leads to a high level of depression within the Travelling Community from a young age. Many are on antidepressants from their early teens and can see no future for themselves. Unfortunately, suicide is far too common within their community and causes deep hurt and sadness. The Travelling Community is very closely knit and so death and illness within the community adversely affects almost the entire community. I feel that the Community is suffering PTSD due to their oppressive past, their poor living conditions even today, illness, suicide, and their inability to process the vast changes in their lives*

over a relatively short period of time. The stress that many Travellers I know live under, is immense. Trauma is a barrier in anyone's life and many Travellers that I know live in a constant state of trauma"

This is a serious indictment of Irish culture and of those whose job it is to ensure that Travellers are included in society. This interviewee highlighted the closure of the Visiting Teacher Service for Travellers in 2011. This service had existed to allow for the appointment of Teachers to attend Travellers' homes in order to provide support to pupils and families. Where previously, teachers were able to visit Traveller students and their families, form bonds with each family and help to put in place structures and support that gave the Traveller child the best opportunity to continue with education, their closure represented a very significant setback. The teachers who were engaged in the Visiting Teacher Service had also provided a valuable link to the schools who were in turn able to monitor the progress of the child and put facilities in place to assist them.

The discontinuation of the Senior Traveller Training Centres (STTC) which had been located around the country, providing social services, and were closed as cost saving measures in 2012, impacted on the link between Traveller and educator. These centres provided training in useful skills and provided literacy classes for adult Travellers who had little or no previous formal education. The involvement of parents in these centres often lead to a better understanding of the importance of education for their children and assisted in breaking the cycle of illiteracy in many families. When asked for their views on what needs to be changed so that Travellers are more likely to engage, they provided the following response in respect of literacy and education;

"Although more and more Travellers attend secondary school, only about 20% sit their Leaving Certificate exam. This prevents them from progressing into 3rd level education unless they return to education at a later stage. There are many reasons that Travellers do not continue to Leaving Certificate. Some of the barriers to students remaining at school include poor literacy skills, peer pressure and [they are] unable to see a purpose in formal education. Poor literacy skills must be

addressed in Early Years and Primary school. For this to improve the government must fund and provide extra support for Traveller children who often come from homes with little or no literacy. Homework groups and afterschool activities, help with keeping the children's interest in school and lead to better participation in the classroom"

Elaborating on the education facilities that could be opened up to Traveller children, the interviewee pointed out how support for the children who are likely to struggle is key;

"Transitioning from primary school to secondary school is difficult for many Traveller children. Primary schools are child centred, where the class teacher knows each child personally and can provide support accordingly. Secondary school is more varied where individual students can feel lost. Programmes such as the School Completion Programme, work with children who show signs in primary school of having difficulty moving into the secondary system. Traveller children/teenagers still struggle, leading to poor attendance and therefore poor academic performance. The Skills for Work programme run by the Education and Training Boards (ETB) are free to employees and employers"

And finally, on this question, the interviewee's response with regard to Traveller's lifestyles, and their attitudes to education:

"However, many Travellers enjoy being self-employed which allows them the freedom to travel. It can be difficult to get adult Traveller participation in education unless there is an incentive. More Travellers are attending Vocational Training and Opportunities Scheme (VTOS) which provide courses to improve general levels of education. They also avail of The Back to Education Initiative (BTEI) which provides part-time further education courses mainly for young people and adults who have not completed the Leaving Certificate or an equivalent qualification, but they are still in the minority. The Traveller community in general have little

understanding of how difficult it is to succeed in education. Students need to attend school every day and to do extra study at home. Often, the girls are expected to help out at home from a young age and this can interfere with their education. Boys are often expected to be out of school by 16 years old, as it is seen as no use to them in their future. Traveller girls are still getting married young, most being married before 20 years of age. In such cases, education is not seen as a priority"

While much of the contents of this interview painted a bleak picture of why there is no real hope of a Traveller youth having the same aspirations as their non-Traveller counterpart, going way beyond holding a position in the Irish civil service, there is evidence (outside of the scope of this thesis) that a light is being shone on Traveller living conditions, mortality, and the challenges around mental health. However, it is very apparent from the interviews that the challenges around civil service employment are only one small strand in much bigger dialogue. Moving onto the focus groups, these challenges will become more apparent.

Focus Groups

Details of those who took part in the focus groups are as follows;

Description	***Location***	***No. who participated***
Traveller Community group (ages 18-31)	Mid-west	7 (3 male, 4 female)
Group of Travellers from a halting site (18-50)	Galway	6 (3 male, 3 female)
Non-Traveller group (Ages 18-45)	Galway	6 (4 female, 2 male)

In the case of all three focus groups, they were convened by the community workers and youth workers involved and, in the case of the Galway focus group - residents of a halting site - this was arranged through a Traveller family liaison who works in the halting site with children on a one-to-one basis and with the families of those children. While I tried to keep the length of the conversations to approximately one hour, in each case, this was extended to approximately 90. This was for two reasons;

1. It was important to allow participants to express ideas and views that, although not strictly related to the subject matter, allowed individuals to be heard. This had the effect of gaining trust and showing respect to the participants in acknowledgement of their willingness to take part;
2. Although there were several deviations away from the questions asked, the comments that were made provided a much broader insight into why Travellers and employment is challenging. In fact these 'extra-curricular' comments will feed into the conclusion of this thesis in a significant way.

Achieving balance in the focus groups

Where I felt that one or more individuals were of a stronger personality and therefore inclined to keep the focus on themselves, I used mediation and facilitating skills from my experience in both fields (mediation and training/facilitating) to move the conversation onwards and to bring in participants who were quieter and more reluctant to step forward with their views. One of the main outcomes of the focus groups from an observational point of view is that women Travellers were much less inclined to come forward with ideas and suggestions – the male Travellers were quicker to comment and provide definite opinions. However, after each focus group had concluded, female travellers were more willing to speak 'off the record' while the customary cup of tea was being had. I raised this phenomena with other interviewees (both from within and outside the Traveller community) in order to establish if it was a reasonable observation that, in general, male Travellers dominated their female counterparts. In a sense this question was raised to determine if a female-only focus group would be beneficial. The responses I received indicated that there certainly was not a clear pattern of behaviour where men were in charge and women subservient, but there was agreement that it is likely to be far more common for the man of the Traveller household to make decisions with little or no reference to his wife or family. This in itself does not imply that the women of the household is victimised in any way, it is however acknowledged that the family dynamic in Traveller life often goes back to an earlier time where

the prominence of the father as the sole decision maker is a usual occurrence. The contributors to this conversation were eager to point out that that is most likely a more common feature in non-Traveller families also, but that the domination of the father in a non-Traveller family is perceived to be less so because it is viewed by society as being unacceptable and therefore less apparent.

Potential blind spots and how to address them

Potential blind spot	**Solution**
Gender imbalance	Initial research indicated that there would be less access to male Travellers than female Travellers. I aimed to overcome this by the introduction of focus groups where I could specify one or more male-only groups if necessary. It turned out that gender imbalance was not an issue. In fact, participation from male Travellers was forthcoming and, at times, male contribution dominated conversations to the point where I had to deliberately bring female contributors into the dialogue. On a couple of occasions, there was an air of 'the man doing the talking' where females might either have nothing to add or would simply agree with that which was already said by her male counterpart.
Misrepresentation of interviewees or focus group participants.	I was aware of the possible impact that my expectations might have on the outcome, where I might have had preconceived notions about what the answers were going to be (known as the Rosenthal Effect) and I also looked at the possibility that a participant, knowing they were being interviewed and observed, would respond differently to that which would be their normal response (known as the Heisenberg Effect) – both of these

	scenarios had the potential to skew the outcome of the interviews and focus groups. To counter this possibility, I provided a synopsis of the interview/discussion to the participant for their consideration after each interaction. This allowed the interviewee to review their contribution and to agree on the discussion content. In the case of Focus groups, I followed Lowhorn's description that the group should consist of 3-10 participants with a moderator and recorder (Lowhorn: 2007). Instead of providing each focus group with a written synopsis of the discussion after the event, I use the last few minutes of each session to recap what was discussed and to outline my understanding of the responses. This allowed an opportunity to modify responses when required.
Participants do not want to be quoted.	This arose in almost every case. Both in the focus groups and in interviews. Both from Travellers themselves and from activists and from personnel representing the state. In each case, once I provided assurance that all information would be treated confidentially and no one would be identified if they did not want to be, I was able to proceed. I held this discussion with each participant at the outset of each session and I believe, once clarification was reached, the process flowed more freely because the participants were more at ease. This also meant that I could ask questions that I might have otherwise veered away from had the interviewee been identified.

Balanced numbers of interviewees / groups	By this, I mean that I was concerned I might have more participants representing one view only. I overcame this potential difficulty by creating a long list of potential participants in the knowledge that there may well be several who would decline. This is exactly what happened, I would estimate that approximately 50% of those I approached, either declined to take part or did not respond at all. That said, my original pool of possible interviewees and contributors was such that a casualty rate of 50% could be accommodated without compromising the research
Assumptions with regard to roles	As an outside observer to the discussion that took place under the headings of employment, a few points worth nothing became evident; (i) While the group was made up of more women than men, there was minimal input from the female cohort; (ii) When it came to discussing certain types of work (for example in this case, employment in the civil service) there was a very strong undertone that suggested we were discussing employment for women Travellers only and that office work would not be considered by male Travellers; *(iii)* Employment or business opportunities, should result in money being circulated *within* the Traveller community – in this context much of the

	discussion on employment was centred on employment or business opportunities that would provide services or goods exclusively to the Traveller community by the Traveller community

Seven members of the Traveller community attended the first of three focus groups.

The following is the list of questions that formed the basis of the discussion;

Questionnaire for Focus Groups	
1.	Have you ever worked, or are you currently working, for an employer?
2.	Would you like to have fulltime employment (working for an employer)?
3.	Why would you like / not like to have fulltime employment (working for an employer)?
4.	What obstacles have you met when applying for work?
5.	What do you know about the Irish civil service?
6.	What do you know about working in the Irish civil service?
7.	Would you consider working in the Irish civil service?
8.	Have you ever worked, or do you currently work, with individuals from ***outside*** the Traveller community? If yes, what is/was your experience like? If no, why not?
9.	What are your views on employment opportunities for Travellers?

The questions above formed the basis of an overall conversation about Travellers and civil service employment, but also very much expanded to discuss the conditions under which Travellers live. In particular, the discrimination and exclusion that each Traveller experienced; their responses to negative comments; their processing of discrimination (in shops, pubs, etc.). This was a theme of each of the three focus groups that were held – all Travellers have faced discrimination and exclusion. There was a very strong message that Travellers, although

recognised as an ethnic minority, did not see this recognition backed up with actions that allowed their ethnicity to be accommodated and even celebrated.

In addition to the focus groups, several of the reports that were researched for this thesis, and several people who were individually interviewed (both from inside and outside the Traveller community) suggested that one of the main reasons why Travellers do not engage in employment outside of their own community is because they simply do not see the point. Their experiences tell them that if they apply for employment, the social and cultural obstacles that they will meet will usually mean that they will not be successful. This is true also when it comes to why Travellers do not engage in education for any longer than they, their families, or their communities see fit. What is the point in attending school up to Leaving Certificate level if the same obstacles exist when job-seeking? What is the point in competing with non-Traveller job candidates? It is a more practical and indeed safer option to get employment within the Traveller circle in a job that serves Travellers. One of the focus groups that I held was co-facilitated by the Project Development Officer from CENA (a Traveller-specific housing association). This discussion / focus group looked at previous workshops that were held in order to prepare a strategy document with regard to Travellers' living conditions. The four themes that arose from previous workshops and were going to form the basis of the proposed strategy document were; Health (specifically mental health), Education, Housing, and Employment. The facilitator of this group presented a very convincing argument on why Travellers should become involved in campaigning for their basic rights under the four headings. Among the group were seven participants that comprised the original focus group and two additional activists from the Traveller community. It was striking to see how the conversation that was held surrounding each of the four headings involved the facilitator, and the activists, with little or no input from the Traveller individuals themselves. This did not appear to be a lack of interest, it seemed more to reflect the apathy of the ordinary Traveller when it came to looking to have their basic human rights met. This apathy had been repeatedly voiced throughout interviews and focus groups and

is also identified in numerous findings from research carried out by the likes of the Economic Social Research Institute (ESRI) and St Stephen's Green Trust (SSGT).

However, what is striking is that Travellers are not entirely of the view that the onus is on the non-Traveller to change approaches and attitudes. There were many examples cited where Travellers can help themselves, chief among these options are; the continuation of education; the willingness to look at how Travellers are perceived and the role of the Traveller in that perception; and getting involved in activism at all levels. With regard to questions 8 and 9 in the table above, all the focus groups provided virtually unanimous negative responses when it comes to Travellers extending outside their own community to engage in employment, or indeed to engage socially. There was a very small cohort who expressed a cautious willingness to engage with non-Traveller employers whereas the much more common response suggested a strong mistrust of non-Traveller employers. The collective responses from each of the focus groups were very much of a mind that Traveller employment, for the most part, should be contained within the Traveller community and that any revenues generated through employment within the Traveller community, should be spent within the community itself.

An in-depth discussion around the types of work Travellers could carry out included the aspiration that Travellers could move away from the work with which they are most associated – the likes of driveway laying, and power washing - and that they could move towards skilled work – like tradesmen and tradeswomen; or service providing. Again, the insular view of one focus group was that if young Traveller men were to qualify as motor mechanics, then they would have a ready-made market among their Traveller peers, most of whom own cars and are drivers. When pressed to establish why they would see their clients coming exclusively from within their own community, the response was that they (Travellers) do not have the trust of the non-Traveller community.

Evidence of discrimination

A recurring theme throughout all of this research, and particularly prevalent during the focus groups is the lack of trust on the part of the Traveller community arising from years of discrimination. This lack of trust was evidenced by several examples, two of which are (i) where the owners / directors of a very successful company have not revealed their ethnicity as Travellers because they would immediately lose business; and (ii) the example of a driver for a very prestigious chauffeuring company who, on a daily basis, hears clients, as passengers in his car, speak in derogatory terms about Travellers. They are unaware (presumably) that their driver comes from the community. One could argue that perhaps this is a long-held out-dated view on the part of the Traveller, that we have moved on and this kind of discrimination has at least lessened. But the manner in which Travellers have, time and again in focus groups and in interviews, recounted their own experiences of how they are treated / spoken to / spoken about / excluded makes it impossible to dismiss as simply rhetoric.

Furthermore, all the Travellers who spoke of their experiences, did so in the spirit of understanding that the people who utter discrimination or who behave in a racist, exclusionary way, are more often than not, people who are simply perpetuating the societal view of Travellers. They are not supremacists, or bigots, or racists, but they live in a society where discrimination towards Travellers is entirely acceptable. The evidence of discrimination that arose during these conversations was backed up by much of the literature that is used in the review, dating right back to initial attempts in the 1960s to address Travellers issues under the Report of the Commission on Itinerancy.

Evidence of institutionalised discrimination

Feedback from several sources during interview and focus groups demonstrated the strong prejudice against Travellers. So-much-so that both employers and Travellers themselves, are strongly of the view that there are many Travellers in employment who deny their ethnicity in order to avoid discrimination. Several examples were cited whereby, not alone do Travellers

conceal their ethnicity in the workplace, but they also have to accept a daily onslaught of language and rhetoric that is demeaning and discriminatory. One participant highlighted how they have visited the same grocery supermarket for years and, while shopping, they are pursued by security personnel each time they visit, despite never having given any reason for this scrutiny. At one Traveller focus group, there was a strong unanimous view that where Travellers reveal their ethnicity in their place of employment, they are treated with suspicion, and they are discriminated against when it comes to their specific jobs and roles. One participant stated that *"there was no problem getting a job as a cleaner, but getting a proper job was out of the question".*

In August 2021 the Irish Human Rights and Equality Commission (IHREC) submitted a document ***Developing a National Action Plan Against Racism*** to the Anti-Racism Committee (this Committee was set up by government in 2020. It had a mandate to review current evidence and practice and make recommendations to the government on how best to strengthen its approach to tackling racism, including through drawing up a new Action Plan Against Racism for Ireland). In their submission, The IHREC, while speaking about ethnic and migrant communities, stated;

> *"groups including minority ethnic and migrant communities are overlooked and under-served in the Irish labour market in terms of the dimensions of decent work; they are more likely to face restrictions in accessing the labour market, face barriers in occupational attainment, are more likely to have lower pay, lower security and stability in work, and are more exposed to work-related discrimination" (2021:43)*

During focus groups, participants spoke of their hopes for employment in the future. They emphasised that they do want to enter the labour force and engage in meaningful satisfying work but they are hampered by the existence of constant discrimination.

Discussion on Traveller attitudes and outlooks

The groups involved in discussion were willing to accommodate all questions or scenarios posed, including the question of whether individuals in the Traveller community contribute to the prejudice against them.

One interview participant holds the view that Traveller fighting is rooted in their tradition and history and defending the honour of an individual or family was (and is) an important part of Traveller culture. However, they also very strongly hold the view that fighting for prize money - often very large prize pots - is not part of the Traveller tradition and should not be done.

The interviewee also very strongly held the view that the phenomenal spread of YouTube videos where Travellers challenge their opponents to fights, feeds into the discrimination and bias that Travellers face, and that this is one example of where the Traveller could take action to help eliminate, or at least reduce, prejudice. There is a risk of being perceived as taking a victim blaming stance by raising the subject of a Traveller's roles and responsibilities with regard to the social exclusion that exists, and with regard to Traveller fights, there is evidence that the average Traveller does not believe that engaging with the civil authorities to resolve issues is a viable option, therefore sorting out their differences internally is the preferred course of action.

But virtually all Traveller representative bodies acknowledge that there is a cohort within their community that portrays Travellers in a negative light. Most also recognise that the behaviours and attitudes of this cohort fuels, and threatens to assist the argument of legitimising anti-Traveller sentiment by those inclined to do so. As a non-Traveller, who has never experienced discrimination or racism, it is easy to imply that both sides need to take a look at themselves, but until a conversation can be had that gives voice to all reasonable views, then little progress can be made.

Group discussion on Education / work

Time and again, during interviews and focus groups, the question of education arose. While there is evidence that more young Travellers are staying in education up to leaving certificate level,

and a higher number than ever is moving onto 3rd level education, there is still a disconnect between the Traveller community and the education system as highlighted in the contribution from Interviewee 3 above.

Of the three focus groups that met, totalling 19 people, one individual was in third level education; three had undertaken hair and beauty training; the remaining 15 had left school prior to reaching Leaving Certificate level. Of those 15, one had had employment in the past, and the remaining 14 were in receipt of welfare payments.

There was an absence of wanting to proceed onto third level education, or indeed, in the wanting to continue in secondary education beyond the age of 15 or 16. But, there was an appetite for training and for gaining skills through apprenticeships and training centres. However, one contributor, quoted above, refers to the difficulty with getting buy-in from Travellers for long-term training programmes for two reasons; it curtails their ability to travel for sections of the year, and it also means they are more likely to enter into employment as opposed to being self-employed, which in the eyes of the Traveller, exposes them to further limitations particularly surrounding their nomadic lifestyle. In connection with these possible limitations, I raised the specific subject of Travellers working in the civil service possibly being an ideal means of complimenting the Travellers' lifestyle, but I was met with immediate resistance. When we dug a little deeper, the hesitance came from a fundamental belief that fulltime, permanent work would not lend itself to the lifestyle of the Traveller. I put forward the proposal that there are several facilities within the civil service - career breaks, leave with/without pay, shorter working year facilities - that would help accommodate a Traveller to maintain the elements of their ethnic lifestyle, but, similar to the broader lack of trust mentioned earlier, this element of the discussion seemed to add to the resistance around engaging in employment.

This dissertation will now conclude with an analysis of the issues raised.

Chapter 5: Analysis

Based on the amount of different directions that the focus groups and interviews have so far taken, the one certainty is that I will not end at a point close to that which I originally intended when considering the original question. That is, I thought I would reach a conclusion as to why there appears to be a disproportionately low number of minority groups employed in the civil service and, in particular, why there are so few members of the Traveller Community employed as civil servants. What has become apparent through my study and research is that there are multiple layers to my hypothesis and the question - ~~*How has the Irish civil service and the Traveller community in Ireland responded to changes surrounding employment since ethnic recognition?*~~ *How has the Irish civil service and the Traveller community in Ireland, responded to changes in employment, since ethnic recognition[FB5]?* - has evolved and developed to something considerably different than first thought. This is particularly obvious in the comments from interviewee 3 (page 56), who depicted a sombre view of how Travellers deal with many struggles that are not encountered outside their community. My epistemological and ontological perspectives are a significant influence – that is my thinking, my reading, my interviewing and my beliefs. Although I have written earlier of the need to remain as non-normative as possible, I can see that subjectivity will present challenges to the empirical research. Using a qualitative research method has brought me along the path of asking many questions and, instead of reaching a definitive conclusion, I am brought down side-roads, which will eventually reach a point of a new theory or question. The question broadens far outside the confines of employment for Travellers in the civil service and is steered much more towards how we (society inside and outside the Traveller community) have wound up in a situation where over sixty years since the Commission on Itinerancy in Ireland was formed, and several years since Travellers were recognised as an ethnic group, the development of relationships between both communities does not appear to have evolved in a direction of progress. Instead of reaching a definitive conclusion, I have merely begun to contribute to another level of questioning on such

a broad topic. Looi Theam Choy writes that qualitative research methods help to unpack differing perspectives within a community (2014). This is precisely what appears to be happening.

Like the evolution of the research process thus far, the execution of my research methods brought a whole new set of challenges. Because I opted for a qualitative method –literature, interviews and focus groups - and because the participants were, for the most part, not neutral, I had to be objective when absorbing and analysing bias and subjectivity from participants. This was challenging.

Elizabeth Jackson from the University of Cumbria (2013) says *"consideration of philosophical underpinning can be crucial for both shaping research design and for explaining approaches taken in order to support credibility of research outcomes" (2013:49)* – this highlighted the challenge of carrying out research that I can stand over and that will withstand scrutiny.

I did not want to engage with the process at a level where I was working so hard on accommodating philosophies, backgrounds, beliefs, etc. that I lost sight of the need to extract accurate information. From a broader perspective, the first element of addressing the issue of gathering credible data was to acknowledge the challenge, then to consider and research ways of accommodating it. At a narrower perspective, when I scheduled the interviews (or, at least the initial few interviews) I built in the option of a second, shorter follow-up interview, so that a review of the discussion could have taken place if necessary. I saw that this could have been interpreted as a means of controlling the dialogue, and therefore the outcome, but it allowed for a review that would help to ensure consistency had the need arisen. As it turned out, no revisits were necessary. By posing the question ~~– How has the Irish civil service and the Traveller community in Ireland responded to changes surrounding employment since ethnic recognition?~~ ***How has the Irish civil service and the Traveller community in Ireland, responded to changes in employment, since ethnic recognition[FB6]?***

– a light is being shone squarely on the behaviours and attitudes of two large entities, the Irish state and the Traveller community. The reason for choosing this thesis question is multi-fold.

The question will provide an overview of one strand of inequality in a broad organisation (taking the Irish civil service as one organisation for the purposes of this work). Inequalities towards other groups in the civil service are being addressed, and there is no doubt that imbalances that affect other groups will, in the future, be identified and addressed as time goes by (a brief study of other groups who have been treated inequitably has been provided in the Context chapter). As importantly, the literature review has time and again kept on returning to the subject of the major challenges that face the Traveller community around health, mortality, housing, education, etc. While the focus of the thesis question remains focussed on civil service employment for Travellers, a much broader, and much bigger discussion must centre around the living conditions of Travellers – with particular reference to housing, employment, health (especially mental health), and most worryingly, premature mortality (including high rates of suicide). In order to be able to look at the question of employment for Travellers in the civil service it will be necessary to look at the topics listed in the paragraph above. In fact, it will be impossible to look at how to change the attitudes and behaviours of all stakeholders until the much bigger subjects are included in the discussion. It is important to note that although the thesis question asks how these two parties have responded to ethnic recognition with regard to employment, it is not to be assumed that this question is raised so that the numbers of Travellers working in the civil service can be increased until there is proportional representation. While that may well be the outcome, it is equally possible that there will be no change in the number of Travellers employed, or indeed it may well be the case that, if other overarching issues and concerns are examined and rectified, then the Traveller may well be encouraged to move further away from fulltime employment, and move towards their Traveller heritage and lifestyle, thus reducing the numbers of Travellers already in civil service employment.

While the burden of responsibility with regard to creating a healthier and safer environment for Travellers rests with government, local authorities, support groups, etc., it is also necessary for Traveller communities, facilitated by their respective representatives, to look at their role in

bringing the bias to an end. Consequently, a significant portion of the research that was carried out, particularly during interviews and focus groups, discussed the role of Travellers in helping to reduce the bias and discrimination that they experience. Therefore, the picture that has emerged through the literature review and through research broadens the thesis question because, when one asks, how ha~~ve~~s the Irish civil service and the Traveller~~s~~ community in Ireland responded to changes in employment, since ethnic recognition[FB7] ~~responded to ethnic recognition in the context of employment~~, it must be answered by reference to the overall picture surrounding Travellers' lives. The thesis question cannot be addressed as a standalone discussion. While this means that the subject of the thesis has broadened beyond its original parameters, it also means that the thesis question can be asked with vital reference to the context in which it can be best explored.

Simply put, the research tells us that if we ask the thesis question using only data surrounding employment, or perhaps only surrounding government policy on ethnicity, we will miss the opportunity to explore this question to the fullest extent.

Chapter 6: Conclusions and Policy Implications

The thesis question that began this paper asked ***how has the Irish civil service and the Traveller community in Ireland responded to changes surrounding employment since ethnic recognition?***

The reason why there was a reference to the recent ethnic recognition is because it is just a few short years since the Traveller community were recognised as an ethnic group in Ireland and there was much celebration and hope arising from that moment. The views and experiences of most Travellers that I spoke with is that the ethnic recognition was symbolic only and that there was much more to be done to give it meaning. It became increasingly apparent that civil service employment is a very small issue when placed into the sphere of Travellers' lives in Ireland. The issue of employment is certainly one that remains front and centre with regard to Travellers, and like representation in all public service areas – politics, Defence Forces, Garda Siochána, Hospitals, etc. – it is important that Travellers and all other ethnic communities are proportionally represented in civil and public service employment. But it is also apparent that the cultural relationship between the non-Traveller and the Traveller has to change considerably for the employment issue to be addressed. The altering of positions by both Traveller and non-Traveller will, for the most part, be facilitated by the state through government intervention, both at local and National level. But we also know from previous attempts that the imposition of change on either party will not work. This must become a 'the lightbulb has to really want to change' moment, (which is the answer to how many electricians does it take to change a lightbulb, the answer is 'one, but….the lightbulb has to really want to change'). How does this come about?

A previously referenced discussion on how to improve living conditions for Travellers was facilitated by the Project Development Officer with CENA. This discussion focused on four key areas:

- Accommodation;
- Health (focussing on mental health);

- Discrimination;
- Training / Employment.

The discussion very quickly revealed the inherent links between each of these four areas;

- sub-standard accommodation was directly related to poor physical and mental health;
- there is a direct link between the discrimination that Travellers face on a daily basis and challenging mental health,
- lack of meaningful employment directly affects poor physical and mental health.

The next six analytical points of the dissertation will explore the main issues affecting Travellers, and while these are arguably broader than the original question posed in this dissertation, it is becoming increasingly clear that it is not possible to examine employment for Travellers in isolation. The much broader picture must be taken into account.
Following this, we will then move onto specific policy recommendations.

1. *Ongoing Discrimination*

There is not a shadow of doubt that Travellers face discrimination on a daily basis, much of which is verbally aggressive, but most of which is poorly veiled in attempted subtlety – staring, moving away, phrases and words that have become synonymous with derogatory meaning and are thrown about both inside and outside Traveller circles. There was a very strong view among the Traveller focus group participants that many, if not most, non-Travellers who utter discriminatory words either to or about Travellers, do so without even being aware that they are being discriminatory or racist. In effect the discriminatory attitude to Travellers by the majority of those in the non-Traveller community, has become endemic to the point that it is not recognised as discrimination. The rhetoric, attitude, and language, is entirely acceptable to the non-Traveller community. This attitude was very clearly evident in the ESRI report *A Social Portrait of Travellers in Ireland* (see page 25) and also in the literature review by referencing Verkuyten study of 2004 (see page 8). Each member of the focus group emphasised their rearing with regard to 'turning the other cheek' when it came to dealing with comments and attitudes of those who presented with conflict and aggression. The group collectively held the view that responding with aggression or confrontation was, for the most part, counter-productive. There were occasional times when simply ignoring someone's words was not possible, but the group were also very aware that, should they engage in a verbal or physical confrontation, they were likely to be less believed by Gardaí than the non-Traveller person.

2. *Address mental health challenges in the Traveller Community*

One interview participant, who wished to remain anonymous, cited a comparison between the challenges facing young black males in inner city London and the young male Traveller in Ireland. This comparison was drawn from observations of how teenage, predominantly male travellers, are discouraged from engaging in education beyond a young age and who are then left to their own devices when it comes to moving forward with their lives. This 'rudderless' phenomena, which is by no means exclusive to the Traveller community in Ireland, or to the black community in London, has the effect that young adults are guessing at where their place in their community lies. This aimlessness, leads to vulnerability and susceptibility that can either lead to a negative outwards expression of their marginalisation through violence and crime, or to an inward reflective journey that causes higher rates of self-harm and suicide. Another anonymous interviewee from the Traveller community spoke of their concerns surrounding Traveller fighting and the explosion in media and social media in recent years surrounding Traveller feuding. The contributor to this conversation held the strong view that Travellers, while once using fist fighting to sort out differences (rightly or wrongly), has now become a very significant money generating source where thousands of Euros are bet on the outcome of fights. Effectively, fighting nowadays has little to do with defending honour, but is now a major money and gambling business. This contributor felt that the attention from non-Traveller communities causes a lot of harm to the vast majority of Travellers who have no role to play in feuding and who are all painted with the one brush with regards to how the Traveller is perceived in modern Ireland.

3. *Retain Department Social Protection and Health Service Executive (HSE) supports*

The St Stephen's Green Trust in their research document *Mincéir Misl'er a Tom Tober (2021),* which explored Travellers in the mainstream labour market, pointed out that one deterrent for Travellers, when it comes to looking for employment, is their fear of losing some or all of the social protections that support them (Social Welfare payments, Medical Card, etc.) (2021:11). This was endorsed by several interview and focus group participants. The immediate and sudden loss of such vital social supports, acts as one obstacle to individuals seeking employment.

A response to this may well be to allow a member of the Traveller community to retain some of their state-provided social supports for part or all of their employment, perhaps on a decreasing scale, so that the benefits are not wiped out from the outset. Allowing an individual to maintain their level of income and support so that they are not discouraged to apply for employment in the first place, would be a starting point with regards to recruitment and retention.

For example, while poorer health and premature mortality rates for Travellers exist, there is an argument that the assurance of continued access to primary care, via the Medical Card, is essential – regardless of income or of employment status. So perhaps Travellers should retain their medical card without being means tested, with a step-down to GP card only or medicines card only, if health and means permit at a later date. The logic behind this proposal is that, while in fulltime civil service employment, over time, the mental and physical health of the individual should improve. Particularly where appropriate support mechanisms, via the civil service Employee Assistance Service (CSEAS), are put in place. This improvement in an individual's situation should, at least in theory, reduce the need for relying on social services. If employed in the civil service, the Traveller will also give up 37.5 hours per week, take on travel costs to and from their workplace, and no longer enjoy the time freedom that, anecdotally, they may use for generating black market income streams to supplement Dept Social Protection payments. Therefore the advantages of allowing a retention of support services would enable the Traveller

engage in employment and bring their experience and abilities to the table. This would also act as an immediate way of incentivising a Traveller to take up work in the civil service - to ensure that they are, at least in the short to medium term, in receipt of the same supports they would have while unemployed.

4. *Transient education for Travellers on the move*

There are Traveller families who move regularly and, therefore their children miss a lot of their education. Travelling is part of Traveller identity and so must be acknowledged and allowed for as specified in UNESCO's Rights of the Child. Schools require the PPS numbers of all students, so tracking movement within Ireland should not be difficult. The difficulty would arise when Travellers move to the UK or further afield. Transient education has its difficulties, but I believe that it needs to be looked at for the benefit of children of transient families. If the system was set up with Traveller involvement, I see no reason for it not being successful. In the past, Traveller children were not automatically placed in age-appropriate primary school classes, but were placed according to their ability. Being placed in age-appropriate classes was a recommendation to be achieved by 2003. (*National Action Plan against Poverty and Social Exclusion*, 2001-2003 and 2003-2005). Many young Travellers that I have worked with remember being put at the bottom of the class and merely given colouring to occupy their time. Today, there is a much better relationship between schools and Travellers, but there is still an element of distrust within some families with the education system and its importance in their lives.

In 2011, the Visiting teacher Service for Travellers was ended. These teachers' role was to visit schools with Traveller students and visit Traveller families. They formed close relationships with Traveller families and helped with attendance, following up on students from place to place and providing information for Traveller parents and children. They also helped schools to understand the difficulties that many Traveller families face. It is a shame that this service was disbanded.

The Senior Traveller Training Centres (STTC) were also closed down about the same time. These Centres provided training in useful skills and provided literacy classes for Travellers who

had had little or no previous formal education. The involvement of parents in these Centres often lead to a better understanding of the importance of education for their children and assisted in breaking the cycle of illiteracy in many families. After their closure, the plan was to integrate Travellers into other educational opportunities, but this has not really happened

5. *Improvement of Literacy Skills for Traveller children and adults*

From interviews with activists and individuals engaged in education for Travellers, it is essential that poor literacy skills must be addressed in Early Years and Primary school. For this to improve the government must fund and provide extra support for Traveller children who often come from homes with little or no literacy. Homework groups and afterschool activities, help with keeping the children's interest in school and lead to better participation in the classroom. Transitioning from primary school to secondary school is difficult for many Traveller children. Primary schools are child centred, where the class teacher knows each child personally and can provide support accordingly. Secondary school is more varied where individual students can feel lost. Programmes such as the School Completion Programme work with children who show signs in primary school of having difficulty moving into the secondary system. Traveller children/teenagers still struggle, leading to poor attendance and therefore poor academic performance. The Skills for Work programme run by the ETBs are free to employees and employers. However, many Travellers enjoy being self-employed which allows them the freedom to travel. It can be difficult to get adult Traveller participation in education unless there is an incentive. More Travellers are attending VTOS and BTEI courses, but they are still in the minority. The Traveller community in general have little understanding of how difficult it is to succeed in education. Students need to attend school every day and to do extra study at home. Often, the girls are expected to help out at home from a young age and this can interfere with their education. Boys are often expected to be out of school by 16 years old, as it is seen as no use to them in their future. Traveller girls are still getting married young, most being married before 20 years of age. In such cases, education is not seen as a priority.

6. *Leadership in combatting racism towards Travellers*

In 2018, Peter Casey, one of six candidates running in the Irish presidential election was quoted as saying that *"Travellers are simply people camping on someone else's land"*, he also claimed that recognition of Travellers as members of an ethnic minority in 2017 was *"a load of nonsense".* The comments were quickly condemned by all other candidates and a cross-section of the community. Martin Collins, co-director of the Pavee Point Traveller and Roma Centre, responded to those comments as follows;

> *"Our president needs to be inclusive of all citizens and I would not have any confidence that he would be inclusive. These comments put Peter Casey's presidential campaign on the same level as a local election where people play the Nimby (not in my back yard) card to gain votes, as we have seen so often in the past."*

The candidate who uttered these words had his share of the vote substantially boosted in the immediate aftermath of his comments, and he finished as runner up to the winner and almost sixteen percentage points ahead of his nearest competitor. Apart from this event being an indictment of a candidate who aspired to hold the highest office in the country, it is also of significant concern that so many voters opted to support them.

Specific recommendations

There is a lot of work to be done to combat racism towards the Traveller community.

It is possible that, at some point in the future, the Irish Government will have to offer an apology to the people of the Traveller community for allowing decades of deprivation and racism to continue unaddressed. This is evidenced by the numerous reports that record sub-standard living conditions, high infant mortality rates and premature death in adults compared to non-Travellers. If, for no other reason than that listed above, and if only as a damage limitation exercise, the state should either introduce or improve on the following;

1. Appoint a Senior cabinet Minister with responsibility for Inclusion and Equality – not just as a sub-section of the Department of Justice brief, but as a standalone cabinet post in its own right (as our population becomes more diverse and as the urgent need to address direct provision conditions continues, along with the housing crisis for Ukrainian nationals, there is scope for a full cabinet post);
2. Run information programmes in schools and on media platforms, and information programmes in public service organisations, to counter what has become socially acceptable discourse with regard to derogatory and racist language which is commonly used to refer to or describe Travellers;
3. Introduce an education module on Ireland's ethnic group into the national school syllabus;
4. Review the roles of Traveller Liaison Officers in public service bodies (civil service departments, Regional Health Executives, and local authorities), to ensure that their role is to advocate for the Traveller and to ensure that the Traveller is provided with a fair process;
5. A Traveller Liaison Network producing an Annual Report could help to ensure accountability on the part of each public service body;
6. Local authorities should be mandated to appear annually before Public Accounts Committees to explain underspend on Traveller housing / Traveller accommodation budgets;
7. All Travellers should have an immediate right to a medical card based on their ethnicity and the associated heightened health risks and mortality rates;
8. All Travellers should be automatically entitled to access to mental health services in the form of psychiatric appointments; counselling sessions; and immediate free access to addiction treatment centres;

9. Include Travellers on a more meaningful basis in dialogue around their welfare and traditions. This would in some way address the *"about Travellers, without Travellers"* phenomena which is often referred to by Rose Marie Maughan from the Irish Traveller Movement;
10. An immediate review of the *National Traveller and Roma Inclusion Strategy 2017 – 2021* along with a time-bound commitment to deliver on the aims contained therein;

Implementation of some or all of the above recommendations would give more meaningful credibility to the fact that Travellers became a recognised ethnic group. However, while Travellers believe that symbolic recognition is a step forward, the experience of Travellers is that symbolism is not enough, that ethnic recognition carries with it a need for tangible actions. They believe that there must be evidence that ethnic recognition is meaningful and none of the Travellers that I spoke with during research see any day-to-day change in their lives as a result of ethnic recognition. From the focus groups and interviews, it is clear that huge mistrust exists between both communities. Building trust, is a key component in ensuring that Travellers can be included in an open society that also accommodates their cultures and traditions and that the cultures and traditions of non-traveller communities is also respected and accommodated. While it is easy to throw out words like culture and tradition, what does that actually mean, how is this build-up of trust created while cultures are being accommodated? This is arguably the most challenging issue of all, how to ask groups to be open to altering their respective mind-sets. There is evidence of change from within the Traveller community as follows:

- despite the low numbers of Travellers represented in education, activism, political life, academia, etc. the representation is increasing, this should be encouraged from within the community;
- Travellers, to a large degree, have embraced social media and are quick to both participate and to call out racism or discrimination when they see it occurring;

- Many Travellers have come out as members of the LGBTQ+ community which is something that would have been almost unheard of a decade ago;
- There are several respected Traveller voices at activist level that speak with elegance and pride when talking on behalf of their people and the rights of their people;
- The Traveller focus groups also recognised that a small section of the Traveller community can portray a poor image of the community as a whole, an example of this referred to the so-called 'callout videos – that is footage posted on social media, particularly YouTube, that shows Travellers 'calling out' other members of their community for the purposes of a fight.
- Soon after comments directed at Travellers were made by a presidential candidate in 2018, Marti Beanz Warde, an actor and stand-up comedian from the Traveller community, appeared on the Raidió Teilifís Éireann (RTE) discussion programme "Cutting Edge". His comments were of significance in that he recognised that the words spoken by that presidential candidate and the votes of almost one-quarter of those who voted (for that candidate) were not emanating from racists views or were not racist votes, but came from a place of not being able to have conversations around Travellers and the non-Traveller. Furthermore, Martin Beanz Warde held the view that most non-Traveller people who held unsympathetic views towards Travellers, did so, out of a sense of disenfranchisement.
- In addition to callout videos, there have media reports of Travellers attending functions like weddings and funerals where they did not strictly adhere to the law, one such recent example centred around the attendance of between 200 and 300 Travellers at a funeral in March 2021 during Covid-19 lockdown that caused many non-Travellers both as private citizens and from those in public life, along with Traveller representative groups like Pavee Point, to react with a view that this was unacceptable.

But, the tradition of funerals and the reverence of death in the Traveller community is sacrosanct and should the community be condemned for observing what are probably their most valued traditions? Technically, the answer is yes, the Traveller community clearly broke the law by gathering in such big numbers when the country was in the midst of a global pandemic. But this is also an example of where the lived experience of the Traveller must be a consideration.

- Additionally, Traveller exclusion from pubs is very common despite contravening the Equal Status Act. Publicans who exclude Travellers often provide examples of where previous experiences caused them to take this action. Is a Traveller group more likely to fight when they consume alcohol? Are different Travelling families likely to use a social gathering such as a wedding or funeral as an opportunity to sort out differences? If, as is anecdotally suggested, the answer is yes, then should a hotel manager or a pub landlord have the right to exclude Travellers? The answer is an emphatic no, there can be no justification for someone being judged on their race or ethnicity. It is concerning in these cases that there is a very strong likelihood a Traveller will be excluded from a venue on the assumption that Travellers cause trouble – a basis built on hearsay, instead of actual experience.

With differences like those mentioned above emerging almost on a daily basis around how the cultures of Travellers and non-Travellers' clash, what can be done to examine and possibly change the outlooks on the part of the non-Traveller? Some points for discussion are:

1. The systemic discrimination towards Travellers that the majority of us either grew up with or heard as normal discourse must be addressed and addressed at an early stage. Therefore the role of schools can and should have a place in teaching children about our rich culture of nomadism in this country. Along with the social studies that children are taught from a very young age in School, modules specific to our own nomadic people should be front and centre; This could be accompanied by attendance at Traveller festivals

like ***Misleór***, the Festival of Nomadic Cultures, that has been held annually in Galway since 2019;

2. The introduction of guest speakers in schools from a host of Traveller Activist movements (e.g. Galway Traveller Movement, Irish Traveller Movement, Pavee Point, the National Traveller Women's Forum, Minceirs Whiden);
3. The setting-up of an arbitrator facility (similar to the role of the Workplace Relations Commission) specific to Traveller issues;
4. The holding of a citizen's assembly to examine how best to enable Traveller and non-Traveller cultures meet and accommodate each other;

Through some or all of the above, to recognise that the differences separating the two peoples are the greatest strengths in each community and should be seen as such.

As mentioned earlier, the creation of a full ministerial portfolio to deal specifically with inequality would not only serve the Traveller / non-Traveller discussion, but would also take disability, foreign nationals, refugees, and gender inequalities into their remit. The symbolic recognition of Travellers on 1st March 2017 was a great beginning but a beginning only.

The Irish Council for Civil Liberties recently made the following comment;

> *"the institutional and societal racism against Travellers is reproduced in the justice system, at all levels. There can be little doubt that the criminalisation of nomadism and ill-conceived policies of assimilation have fed into societal racism and that must be addressed. The government must act decisively, now, to unpick decades of damage."*
>
> *(ICCL: 2022).*

There is a gargantuan amount of work to be done but Travellers now appear to be willing to step out of the shadows and be seen. Traveller Pride, Various Traveller festivals, social media presence, activist groups who are proud of their people and traditions, Academics and professionals from within the Traveller community – all are becoming more visible.

Much of this is perhaps resulting from the validation afforded Travellers through their ethnic recognition in 2017 – whether it was symbolic or otherwise. It is of huge urgency and importance that tangible actions be taken now to lessen premature deaths, poor mental health, and lives lived in deprivation. So, the question that this thesis proposed at the outset ~~–~~ ***How has the Irish civil service and the Traveller community in Ireland, responded to changes in employment, since ethnic recognition***[FB8]***?*** ~~***How has the Irish civil service and the Traveller community in Ireland responded to changes surrounding employment since ethnic recognition?***~~ – remains valid but, to a degree, remains unanswered. Employment in the civil service is one strand of a much bigger dialogue. The recent history and experience of the Traveller community shows an evolution at a rapid pace, while attitudes and beliefs, appear to remain static. What is clear is that a very significant inequality exists that will require change from all sides if a more harmonious existence is to be achieved.

It is arguable that we are in the midst of a humanitarian crisis around Travellers lives which should not be happening in 21st century Europe.

Chris Coyle

120227908

Bibliography

Alban-Metcalfe, J. (2007). *Effective Leadership and Organisational Culture for the Recruitment and Retention of People with Disabilities in the Irish Public Sector*. National Disability Authority.

Andrews and Ashworth (2014). *Representation and Inclusion in Public Organizations: Evidence from the UK civil service.*

Barry, B. (2002). Culture and equality: *An egalitarian critique of multiculturalism. Harvard university press.*

Breathnach, C. and Breathnach, A. (2007). *Portraying Irish Travellers*. Newcastle-upon-Tyne: Cambridge Scholars.

Brug, P. and Verkuyten, M. (2007). *Dealing with cultural diversity: The endorsement of societal models among ethnic minority and majority youth in the Netherlands*.

Bryman, A. (2016). *Social research methods*. Oxford university press.

Choy, L.T. (2014). The strengths and weaknesses of research methodology: Comparison and complimentary between qualitative and quantitative approaches. *IOSR journal of humanities and social science.*

Crowley, U.M. (2005). *Liberal rule through non-liberal means: The attempted settlement of Irish Travellers (1955–1975).*

Department of Justice and Equality. (2017). *National Traveller and Roma Inclusion Strategy 2017–2021*.

Enright, S. and Russell, H. (2020). *Gender balance at work: a study of an Irish civil service department* (No. 115). Research Series.

Foley, D. (2022). *'Their proper place': women, work and the marriage bar in independent Ireland*, c. 1924–1973. *Social History*, *47*(1), pp.60-84.

Fowers, B.J. and Richardson, F.C. (1996). *Why is multiculturalism good?* American psychologist.

Gmelch, S.B. and Gmelch, G. (2014). *Irish Travellers: The unsettled life*. Indiana University Press.

Government of Ireland. (2015). *Comprehensive employment strategy for people with disabilities 2015–2024.*

Gutting, Gary. (1994): *The Cambridge Companion to Foucault*.

Irish Human Rights and Equality Commission. (2021): *Developing a National Action Plan Against Racism: Submission to the Anti-Racism Committee.*

Jackson, E. (2013). Choosing a methodology: Philosophical underpinning. *Practitioner Research in Higher Education*.

Joyce, S., O'Reilly, O., O'Brien, M., Joyce, D., Schweppe, J. and Haynes, A. (2022). *Irish Travellers' Access to Justice.*

Kymlicka, W. (1996). *Social unity in a liberal state. Social philosophy and policy.*

Lowhorn, G.L. (2007). Qualitative and quantitative research: How to choose the best design. In *Academic Business World International Conference. Nashville, Tennessee*.

MacGréil, M. (2011). *Pluralism and Diversity in Ireland. Prejudice and Related Issues in Early 21st Century Ireland*, Dublin: Columbia Press.

McEnerney, L. (2014). *Leadership Lab: The Craft of Writing Effectively*: University of Chicago
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=vtIzMaLkCaM

Movement, I.T. (2013). Review of the Commission on Itinerancy Report. *Electronic document retrieved from https://itmtrav.ie/wp-content/uploads/2017/02/ITM-Review-of-the-1963-Commissionon-Itinerancy. pdf.*

Parekh, B. (2001). *Rethinking multiculturalism: Cultural diversity and political theory. Ethnicities.*

Pavee Point Traveller and Roma Centre; National Traveller Women's Forum; Donegal Travellers Project: Minceirs Whiden; Galway Traveller Movement (2022). *Joint Alternative Report by a Coalition of Traveller and Roma Organisations*.

Sidanius, J. and Pratto, F. (1999). *Social dominance theory. Handbook of theories of social psychology, 2.*

Snowdon, C.J. and Eklund Karlsson, L. (2021). *A Critical Discourse Analysis of Representations of Travellers in Public Policies in Ireland*. *Societies*, *11*(1).

St Stephen's Green Trust. (2021): *Mincéir Misl'er a Tom Tober.*

Tormey, R. and Gleeson, J. (2012). *'Irish Post-primary Students' Attitudes Towards Ethnic Minorities'*, Irish Educational Studies, Vol. 31, No. 2, pp. 157-173.

Verkuyten, M. (2004). *Emotional reactions to and support for immigrant policies*: Attributed responsibilities to categories of asylum seekers. Social Justice Research,

Walsh, B. (1963). *Report of the Commission on Itinerancy*. Stationery Office.

Warde, Martin Beanz, Traveller from Tuam, Co Galway, discussing his views on Traveller and non-Traveller relationships: (undated).
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=3yUX6jiE0To

Watson, D., Kenny, O. and McGinnity, F. (2017). *A social portrait of Travellers in Ireland*. *Research Series*, *56*, pp. 589-608.