

Title	Addressing the concept and evidence of institutional racism in Irish education
Authors	Kitching, Karl;Curtin, Alicia
Publication date	2012
Original Citation	KITCHING, K. & CURTIN, A. Addressing the concept and evidence of institutional racism in education in Ireland. In: KITCHING, K. & CURTIN, A., eds. Racism and Education Conference and Networking Event, 2012 University College Cork. School of Education, University College Cork Institute for Social Sciences in the 21st Century, 43. http://www.ucc.ie/en/education/bodytext-181877-en.html
Type of publication	Conference item
Link to publisher's version	http://www.ucc.ie/en/education/bodytext-181877-en.html
Download date	2025-07-16 06:19:40
Item downloaded from	https://hdl.handle.net/10468/816

Addressing the Concept and Evidence of Institutional Racism in Education in Ireland

Proceedings of the Racism and Education Conference and
Networking Event 2012

Edited by Karl Kitching and Alicia Curtin

Conference Hosted by

School of Education and Institute for Social Sciences in the 21st Century (ISS21)
University College Cork

Conference Funded by

Irish Research Council (for the Humanities and Social Sciences) 'New Ideas' Award 2011-2012



About the School of Education, University College Cork

The department was established in 1905, and since then has served the south of Ireland with pre-service, in-service and postgraduate programmes. During that time it has built up a significant relationship with schools in the Cork city and county, making it a focal point for teacher education in the region. In the past thirty years, its remit has extended beyond teacher education to providing professional development in a range of settings at different levels.

Key taught programmes based in the School include the Professional Diploma in Education (post-primary teaching), the BA in Early Years and Childhood, the BEd in Sports Studies and Physical Education, the BSc Education in the Physical Sciences, the Postgraduate Diploma in Special Educational Needs, the M.Ed. modular programme, the MEd Science, the MA in Guidance and Counselling, and the Cohort PhD. Research students may also engage with individual MEd by Research or PhD routes.

A number of staff and research students in the School of Education are actively engaged in research on processes of identity formation, and institutional, cross-curricular, and subject-specific inclusion and exclusion. The sites investigated by staff and research students include schools, pre-school and care settings, sports settings and third level settings. Such research analyses both Irish and international contexts and relations.

For more information: www.ucc.ie/en/education

About the Institute for Social Sciences in the 21st Century (ISS21)

ISS21 was established at University College Cork with the aid of funding from the Programme for Research in Third Level Institutions and it is affiliated to the Irish Social Science Platform, an all-island programme of theoretical, applied and comparative research and graduate training focused upon the core themes of Knowledge, Innovation, Society and Space, coherently linking together significant and well-established centres of social science expertise across a partnership of third-level institutions.

The Institute brings together social scientists from a broad range of disciplines to pursue research at Irish and international levels in interdisciplinary areas through a number of research clusters, including its Children and Young People Research Cluster and its Migration and Integration Research Cluster.

For more information: www.ucc.ie/en/iss21

About this document

ISBN: 978-1-906642-53-2

Design and printing by Hackett Reprographics Cork: tel: 021 4274014, www.jdh.ie

Additional transcription work by E-equip Business Solutions: www.equipbizsolutions.com

Table of Contents

	Page No.
1. Background to the Racism and Education Conference and Networking Event	2
2. 'Reporting' on event preparation, organisation and proceedings	6
3. Metaphors of, and approaches to race, racisms and anti-racisms	7
4. The complexity of racism in Irish education: data and debates	15
5. Future steps and networks	24
6. Concluding commentary.....	29
7. References cited in the proceedings	30
 Appendix A: Biographies of speakers	 33
Appendix B: Biographies of discussion group facilitators	34
Appendix C: Power and racisms in Irish education: selected research and	
theorisation.....	35
Appendix D: Existing non-governmental, non-profit networks	39
Appendix E: School based resources and programmes	40

1. Background to the Racism and Education Conference and Networking Event

Introduction

The Racism and Education Conference and Networking Event was held on Friday, 17th February 2012 in University College Cork. The event was hosted by the UCC School of Education and the Institute of Social Sciences in the 21st Century (ISS21). The event was organised with funding from the Irish Research Council for the Humanities and Social Sciences¹ 'New Ideas' Scheme 2011-2012.

This proceedings document tells a critical story of the event. Using a social and cultural perspective on racism, power and education, it provides a set of questions for ongoing public, policy-maker and research debate. The publication and dissemination of this document was planned as part of the 'New Ideas' proposal. Its intended audience includes education and social policy-makers, and education and community practitioners, including anti-racism activists.

Institutionalised racism: who does it refer to, and how do its meanings travel?

As Garner (2004) states, "the precondition for racism is the fundamental belief that the world's population is divided into 'races', whether culturally or biologically defined, which enjoy distinctive and unchanging characteristics" (ibid: 19). Racism is much more than a belief in people's heads, however; it denotes a diverse set of social practices and histories loaded with the exercise of power, and is observable in terms of unequal social outcomes. The relevance of racial classification has long been refuted by the vast majority of natural and social scientists. However, the modern political construction of race has become actively, and often violently ingrained in various ways across the globe, having most strongly developed with imperialist expansion and colonial capitalism.

Racism has persisted precisely because it manifests through social practices, and structured relations between different social groups within and outside of state institutions. Constructions of race look and work differently, as they seek to represent the supposedly dangerous, deficient, burdensome, backward or repugnant Other at different times and in different places. Historical and contemporary analyses clearly show constructions of race to be changing, rather than fixed. Such constructions change in relation to particular political and economic circumstances (e.g. imperialism, mid-20th century Irish immigration to Britain, recent immigration to Ireland). Race and attendant practices of racism have been attached in a 'floating' way to social class, physical characteristics, clothing, speech, perceived ability, culture, religion, physical location and, with the increased securitisation of immigration policy in market-liberal societies, citizenship and migrant status (Hall 1997).

Popular and often over-simplified versions of Anglo-American understandings frequently reduce 'racism' to an outdated set of *private individual* prejudices against different-coloured-Others. It is also often assumed that education – and particularly the public school system – is the sole means through which racism can be 'prevented'. This sentiment is well meaning, but neglectful of the social effects of other institutions like policing, welfare, housing, media and healthcare. In its most uncritical and individualised form, it can lead to three overlapping and counterproductive types of interventions on schooling and education:

- The first are those that inadvertently and disproportionately place societal responsibility for both racism and anti-racism on children and young people, deferring the power dynamics of racist inequalities to the 'next generation'.
- The second are those that ignore the ways schools, other education institutions and work place professional development might reinforce or produce racist social and achievement outcomes (including racism at the level of friendships and interactions).

¹ Now named the Irish Research Council (see www.research.ie).

- The third are those that mistakenly presume that childhood and children are not implicated in the ordering and formation of societal institutions and in the formation of existing adult (parent, teacher) identities. The assumption here is that children are not located inside any racialised social order/power structure 'yet', thus masking the relative advantage/disadvantage they experience. Furthermore, children's interactions and peer networks are dismissed in this view as 'harmless', i.e., not part/reflective of wider societal power relationships.

Taking a different approach, certain anti-racist activists, sociologists, cultural theorists and historians tend to analyse the dynamics of *power relationships between racialised groups* who are, by definition, unequally positioned in terms of their access to resources and status in particular societies. Racialised groups² are both

Objects of, and active agents in, the process of constructing the identity in question. The important proviso to this is that the parts played are not equal, as racism by definition involves a power relationship. The term 'racialised group' also allows that, like all collective identities, the one described is fluid and dynamic (Garner 2004: 8).

Such power relationships operate to some degree independently of individual intentions, to disadvantage some racialised groups and advantage others. This idea brings us to the concept of 'indirect', or 'institutionalised' racism. Key to understanding institutionalised racism is that it develops over time and operates 'routinely' as part of a system that appears to be *neutral and universally beneficial* – something that education systems are typically assumed to be. The concept of institutionalised racism did not come from academics and researchers. It was developed through social movements representing racially oppressed collectivities. It was gradually further developed through scholarship. While African Americans campaigned throughout the 20th century for civil rights recognition and against the systematised inequalities they were (and are) subject to, it was not until the 1960s that the concept of institutional racism emerged. In the book *Black Power*, the term 'institutional racism' was coined:

To account for attitudes and practices that led to racist outcomes through unquestioned bureaucratic procedures... They made it clear that white people collectively benefit from the process, even if individual whites did not wish to discriminate. In regarding institutional racism as a form of internal colonialism in the USA they maintained that, although blacks had the same citizenship status as whites, they stood in as colonial subjects in relation to white society (Murji 2000: 844 - 845).

The concept became increasingly used in Britain from the 1970s and 1980s on, particularly by African Caribbean and Asian (Black) minorities, in order to contest the ordinary, everyday processes and procedures of the state and its institutions that helped produce intolerable injustices. The book *How the West Indian Child is Made Educationally Subnormal in the British School System*: the scandal of the black child in schools in Britain (Coard 1971) was a key school-focused text produced at this time. Three decades later, with the Stephen Lawrence inquiry and Macpherson Report, institutional racism had become more of a legal instrument than a critique of internal colonialism (Garner 2010)³.

The 'finding' of institutional racism from a government appointed judicial inquiry was... a watershed in British race relations. Since the early 1950s, when academics first began to address the 'colour problem', the issue had been variously theorised away in terms of psychological misunderstanding or culture clash (Bourne 2001: 8).

² Of course, there are multiple forms of collective identity and/or social grouping: generation, gender, class, family status are but a few. British and Irish education scholarship shows that, criss-crossing with race, these identities are social categories imbued with particular political, economic and representational (and non-politicised) legacies (Youdell 2006; Kitching 2012).

³ Garner (2010) notes that the gradual definition of institutional racism as a legal instrument requires the existence of 'race' to be uncritically accepted. In the Irish case, "Travellers do not apply for justice through 'race' grounds, yet white European groups such as Poles and Lithuanians do" (2010: 105). This example illustrates the complexity of racial categorising and anti-racist politics; race be used as a legal-political tool, yet this deployment can work against certain groups in certain contexts, particularly when other grounds for discrimination are involved. However, one category may need to be used as a proxy for another when legal recognition of race fails. See section 3.3 on this issue.

The Macpherson concept has been critiqued as not being nuanced enough on a number of grounds. Anthias (1999) for example, notes that it fails to tell the difference between mechanisms that may unwittingly exclude through non-ethnic criteria *but where ethnic categories may be over-represented (e.g. skills, language, period of residence, lifestyles etc.)*, and mechanisms that specifically apply to different groups on the basis of ethnic membership or its perception. An example of this includes police stopping and searching on the basis of ethnic membership, or perceived ethnic membership or 'migrant' status⁴. Also, in recent years, the import of institutional racism as a concept has also arguably been superseded by alarming immigration, asylum and citizenship policies at constitutional level (Lentin and McVeigh 2006).

The contextual nature of anti-racist understandings and practices

As constructions of race and racism (both direct and indirect) change, the tactics used to organise and oppose racisms also change⁵. Anti-racist practices and ideas are multiple, and appear in historically and contextually dependent ways (Lentin 2004). Across Europe, the US and the rest of the globe, no one country or region has had completely the same history, set of movements, conflicts or set of state policies when it comes to anti-racism. While the concept of institutionalised racism could be said to have 'Anglo-American' roots, it certainly resonated with participants. Of course, it has been asserted for quite some time by community activists and critical scholarship that Travellers in Ireland have been subject to systematic, institutionalised racism, with quite devastating intergenerational effects (Kenny 1997; Fanning 2002; Hourigan and Campbell 2010; Devine 2011). Fanning asserts that despite policy recognition of the distinctiveness of Traveller culture in recent decades, Travellers' legacy in Ireland "is characterised by the persistence of institutional racism in many areas of social policy, a long-standing denial of Traveller ethnicity and denial of anti-Traveller racism" (2002: 152). Discussing a recent national study of DEIS schools, Devine (2011) notes that 92% of Traveller children are estimated by their teachers to be in the 'below average ability' category. Devine asserts this to be "a clear indicator of structurally embedded patterns of inequality" (2011: 42).

Towards the conference goals and process

The event provided an opportunity for participants, who came from a wide variety of community and professional backgrounds, to share their expertise and to develop links with others. An outline of the methods used in organising the conference is available in section 2, to provide a toolbox of ideas for other such events where useful. Part of the motivation for organising the conference was to explore how and why 'institutional racism' might resonate with people, both as an analytic device in Irish education, and at the level of lived experience. Participants at the conference searched for, and attempted to name, the specificities of racism in Irish education. This document provides **a gathering and analysis of the intellectual and practical understandings that were available, and brought to the table by participants (including presenters)**. The contribution of this document is less to ask 'whether or not the education system is institutionally racist'⁶, and more to provide an understanding of **what intellectual, practical and experiential resources are being drawn upon and circulated to understand and to combat racism in Irish education**. While it is certain that social justice is sorely lacking in Irish society, adequately contextualised explanations of 'why' are key to informing and contesting policy decisions. It is worth noting here that 'institutional racism' appeared on the education policy map in Ireland in 2005 (National Council for Curriculum and Assessment 2005), but disappeared with the publication of the *National Intercultural Education Strategy* (DES 2010). The Equal Status Acts prohibit three forms of discrimination:

4 Stop and search ethnic profiling has been highlighted in the Irish context (Migrant Rights Centre 2011). A 'Stop and Talk, Not Stop and Search' campaign was launched in Britain in September 2012.

5 Such tactics may be definable as, but not always reducible to, 'anti-racisms' (e.g. class-based movements; again refer to section 3.3 and 4.3).

6 Scholarly work and debate around the notion of Ireland as a racist state is ongoing, e.g. in relation to social work with asylum seekers (Christie 2006). Lentin (2007) has argued that the re-imagining of Ireland as a 'diaspora nation' facilitates a racial state which can exclude on the basis of citizenship while hypocritically differentiating between 'legitimate' illegal Irish-US immigrants and 'illegitimate' illegal immigrants in Ireland.

indirect discrimination, discrimination by imputation and discrimination by association. However, if a school provision, practice or requirement indirectly puts someone at a disadvantage, the school may not be accused of indirect discrimination “if the provision is objectively justified by a legitimate aim and the means of achieving that aim are appropriate and necessary” (DES/Equality Authority 2004: 7). The context of economic recession and socio-political turmoil adds a further layer of complexity and political urgency to the issue, as reduced employment opportunities and consumption capacity particularly affects migrants and the minoritised.

Acknowledgements and thanks

Special thanks are due to the event participants; those who travelled long distances and short, to participate in the discussion groups and research/academic talks. Thanks to the speakers, Mairtin Mac an Ghaill, Delma Byrne and Hannagh McGinley for their insightful and informative presentations. Key to the success of the event was the skilled work of the discussion group facilitators: Cyn-di Njoki, Rory McDaid, Hannagh McGinley, Elaine Keane, Amel Yacef, Eileen Hogan, Ifrah Ahmed, Nilmini Fernando, Claire Dorrity, Luke Kasuwanga and Lindsey Garratt. Sincere thanks to you.

Thanks to Alicia Curtin, Kathy Hall, Angela Desmond and Stephanie Larkin, School of Education, for advisory, administrative and organisational support. Thanks also to Caitríona Ní Laoire, Allen White and Linda Connolly for the support of the Institute for Social Sciences in the 21st Century at UCC. Finally, many thanks to the Irish Research Council (for the Humanities and Social Sciences) for funding the event, and to the School of Education for providing additional funding for this publication.

Karl Kitching

School of Education, University College Cork, October 2012.

2. 'Reporting' on event preparation, organisation and proceedings

The event was organised using a participatory format, and was limited to 60 people on this basis. Approximately half of the time was allocated to research/academic input, while the other half was given over to discussion groups focused on the concept and evidence of racism, and, more specifically, institutional racism in education. There were a few simple elements to this approach. While there was a tight schedule between the granting of the award and the event itself (December 2011 – February 2012), these elements appeared to work quite well. First, efforts were made to notify interested parties about the theme of the conference in mid-December using e-mail lists. The response to these notifications was rapid. Within 48 hours, the 50 places originally allocated had been filled. After receiving financial approval from the School of Education, the decision was made to increase the number of places to 60. This rapid response to the event perhaps indicates the degree to which certain activists, practitioners and researchers feel the concept and evidence of institutional racism is something that needs to be addressed in Irish education, and perhaps in Irish social policy and practice more broadly. Travel bursaries were also offered to non-funded migrant and minority ethnic representatives to encourage their participation in the conference in particular. Efforts were made to consult with key community and voluntary sector participants regarding the format and organisation of the conference. Meetings were held in Galway and Dublin which involved researchers, community and NGO workers, and anti-racism activists. Others gave helpful advice on the phone.

Rather than have participants - who themselves had considerable expertise – solely 'listen to input' about racism and education, they themselves took the opportunity to share their experience and knowledge in a smaller discussion group format. By now, such focused discussions may have already provided the opportunity for greater linkages between participants and their ideas in the future. These discussion groups were audio-recorded with the permission of the participants, on the premise that (a) they would receive transcribed copies of their group discussions, which they could edit and (b) such material would be used to inform this proceedings document, and anonymously quoted where appropriate. Participants 'signed up to' principles of participation which referred to this process. In order to protect more global anonymity and due to the large numbers of people involved, points raised by individual participants are not attributed to them, except where necessary and with the individual participant's consent.

Two facilitators were appointed to each of the six groups who had expertise in research, migrant and/or minority ethnic issues and concerns, and group facilitation. The first focused on 'shared and contested thinking around institutionalised racism in Irish education'. After the whole-group talks, groups reconvened to share their experiences of the day, to integrate the issues and evidence addressed where possible, and to raise further questions that might be pursued in policy and in practice. One facilitator/member of each group then summarised the key themes arising from their discussions during the evening plenary session.

Much time was spent analysing the transcripts of group discussions and formal presentations. It is tempting to summarise and thematise what emerged from these transcripts: to produce a tidy framework and set of techniques that will solve things. But racism connotes a diverse set of concepts, social practices and exercises of agency on global, national and local levels. Irish society is partly characterised by clearly racist disparities; this racism also works through discourses and social practices in multiple, unexpected, and thus not-always logical ways. It requires critical, vigilant, analytical focus in our thinking and in the way we challenge it. The story told here is one that attempts to reflect the tension between needing to name racist outcomes while appreciating that racism is not a one-dimensional thing, and racial identity/consciousness does not alone capture the range of power struggles that persons are caught up in.

We have not developed a document that 'reports' in a technicist, one-dimensional and apolitical manner that defines racism finitely. While it is written from a critical social perspective, it does not

prioritise some participants' views as ultimately more useful or insightful than others. As stated in the introduction, the contribution of this document is not just to ask the normative question of 'whether or not the education system is institutionally racist'; it is more focused on providing an understanding of what intellectual, practical and experiential resources are being drawn upon to understand, politicise and combat racism in Irish society and education. As the document progresses, a narrative of international and Irish-specific research on racism and power in education is weaved in and out of participants' remarks. The literature often serves as an important bridging point between, or wider contextualisation of, themes raised by participants. The literature cited in the document is listed in section 7. As part of the project's dissemination focus, Appendix C also lists additional contemporary research on racism, power and integration in Irish education.

3. Metaphors of, and approaches to race, racisms and anti-racisms

This section narrates and analyses the shared experiences of the individuals at this conference and the different people we spoke for and with. More specifically, it examines **participants' feelings, conceptualisations and experiences of racism(s). At the same time, it considers the multiple approaches to anti-racism and education that were overtly and tacitly shared and debated by participants.**

It became clear very quickly that participants brought a huge wealth of intellectual expertise and experiential knowledge to the table. When asked to describe what they understood institutionalised racism to be, many participants turned to metaphor in order to capture both blatant and subtle injustices. Metaphor is a useful tool to unearth deep links between superficially dissimilar and unrelated things, helping us make the familiar strange (Ramachandran and Hubbard, 2003). Metaphors are dynamic and, like racisms, they work on many levels (Huxley, 1954). Asking participants to consider their own understandings of racism clearly provoked strong feelings and experiences. **Many different perspectives on what constitutes an appropriate anti-racist response or set of responses,** both explicitly and implicitly, came out of these discussions. Many participants viewed racism - and institutional racism in particular - as being synonymous with a *systematic oppression* that has become more or less normalised in public political culture and institutions, and possibly internalised by both majority and minority ethnic groups. However, other, more individualised/'bad attitude' notions of racism were also articulated in discussion groups by some participants.

3.1 Tracing agency and inequality: constructions of race, belonging and home

Metaphors which attempted to capture material inequalities and injustices were situated by some participants in wider notions of 'normal' Irishness. It was felt implicitly by some that received notions of Irishness both indicate and help structure immigrants' and minorities' access to agency. Certain participants and presenters indicated their experience of/positioning within racialised power relations in Ireland by interrogating constructions of whiteness as 'normal' and blackness as 'Other', or by questioning the fixity of what 'Irishness' is. Some also criticised common-sense notions of who belongs to particular territories and areas of expertise⁷. Some participants talked about both subtle and overt objectification, and the distancing embedded in the language used to describe them. This objectification could happen regardless of whether the speaker had a positive or negative intention. For example, in the remarks below, the widely repeated research finding that 'immigrants to Ireland value education' is critiqued, in terms of why it was ever posed by researchers as a question worth investigating.

⁷ Racialised colour metaphors are not simply about bodies: as Garner reminds us, 'whiten' is "an active verb, and it covers a process of seeking social agency" (2004: 248). In interrogating racial constructions, one might examine how 'blackness' is experienced and embodied in terms of identity and one's capacity to act in Irish society today. We can also compare it the historic 'blackening', or racially specific disempowering of Catholics, Jews and Travellers in Irish and European history:

The terms dirty and clean and alternatively black and white have been used in many social contexts, including this Irish one, to designate outsiders and insiders. 'Tinkers'... have frequently been called black by Gypsies as well as by settled Irish, two people who were themselves named black and dirty by the English (Court 1985, in McVeigh 1992: 4).

Fig. 3.1.1: "I was not born immigrant... I became black when I came to Ireland"

(Researchers in Ireland) were saying that immigrant students value education and I was thinking that 'why do they say that they value (education)?' It looks like they were expecting them not to value it ... before I became immigrant I was not born immigrant... it's like, I call it ... it's like maybe flu, a disease... Why don't they say that 'there are a group of students and others who don't value their education'? To be honest it can shock you, but before I came here I was not black (laughter)! I became black when I came in Ireland (Group C).

I didn't train as a therapist how to work with Irish people, I just trained as a therapist and then I came to Ireland and I know how to work with Irish people because ... do you know what I'm saying? Like I don't need special cultural training to work with white people... I think it's just ... you know it's not rocket science in some ways (Group A).

The use of particular categories of identification is not naturally or automatically fixed to a person from birth: rather, they can reflect and produce particular forms of agency for people. Perhaps reversing the notion of 'becoming black in Ireland', Hannagh McGinley used the idea of 'the white mask'⁸ to describe how, while the Irish school system silences and pathologises Travellers, this silencing provided her with precarious individual advantages in becoming a successful student and teacher. It encouraged her to internalise the dominant societal view of Travellers as deficient, 'weird', or other, but also provided her with ambivalent educational benefits⁹. Beneath Hannagh's words, another participant points out that, in certain contexts, marginalised children often understand that being identified with a particular heritage/tradition/identity can in fact pose risks for them.

Fig. 3.1.2: Conflicts of marginalisation and 'whitening': fear of dropping the white mask

We were a poor family and the nuns in the convent school were very good to us, they fed us, they made going to school easy. Now with a critical eye looking back, I would look at it differently, but at the time as a child, my experience was quite good with the teachers. Later I became aware of why these things were happening. But at the time, as a child, you don't have the understanding. At the time I accepted it that this was normal, this was my experience and things, if we were in school and there was a school party, I'd be the only child who wouldn't be invited to the party. Or out in the school yard I was on my own a lot and my sister would have to ask some to come and play with me. But I didn't see the bigger issue, I didn't understand that this was to do with racism, or that people would have preconceived notions of who I would be or what I was going to do to their kids... I would say the only disservice that my primary education really did to me was that it never told me who I was, it never mentioned me in the curriculum, I didn't see us at all so, I just thought we were weird... (In post-primary school) settled people knew I was a Traveller. And I didn't know what I was, and people would ask me "are you a Traveller?" and I would say "I don't know" because I had heard all these things "how can you be a Traveller if you don't travel...". And I had internalised all that and I didn't know what I was. So it was a confusing time, I had a huge identity crisis and I suppose I wore that white mask for a long time. I suppose it was easier to be a settled person and that being a Traveller wasn't such a good thing and that you weren't treated so well when you were identified as a Traveller, or identified with that group. So it wasn't really a choice, but I wore that white mask for a long time (Hannagh McGinley Presentation).

How can we possibly expect these children to identify their culture as something to celebrate when the rest of the time it leaves them open to horrific abuse? And the school is not starting with the

⁸ The use of the term 'white mask' in Hannagh's presentation referenced Helm's (1995) 'stages of white identification'. It also may reference Fanon's (1986) *Black Skin, White Masks*. Fanon captures what one conference participant referred to as 'being caught between two worlds', underlining the psychic impact of racist colonialism in French-Algerian power relations, where the coloniser is construed as non-dominating and desirably civilised, where difference is denied and curtailed, and where feelings of inadequacy may cripple the colonised.

⁹ Bryan's (2007) analysis of the (mis)representation of Travellers in Irish CSPE textbooks provides significant evidence of the ways in which racist processes, contexts and meanings are at best reduced to individual attitudes, and at worst ignored in everyday texts.

commitment to challenging the abuse. Go celebrate my culture but actually I would like you to start by protecting me from abuse. That would be a great place to start. And then find out if you like my food, you know. Or you want to hear me sing... (Group B).

The following Group A participants' remarks emphasise how definitions of Irishness in both childhood and adulthood are dependent on context. Discussing a young Polish girl, they also emphasise the importance of a sense of belonging that are associated with these definitions. One participant (participant 1) raised the question of how the complex notion of 'ethnicity' becomes reduced to being merely another euphemism to (violently) classify/constitute the Other within a normalised nationalist and/or racial regime. The second participant provided her own definition that seeks to look beyond such reductions.

Fig. 3.1.3: Complicating identities

Participant 2: I mean there's so much (to) ethnicity, you know, do you mean that ethnically is 'she' Polish? What does she eat? What language does she speak? Is that ethnicity? Because I think 'ethnicity' is just (used as) another word for race and I think 'culture' is just another substitute for race, you know, so if you're looking at that are these good measures or signifiers or what we're trying to talk about.

Participant 2: Well I've asked a few friends of mine, Irish people, what it means to be Irish and I got really funny answers a few times from them. It means you eat every Sunday a proper Irish, full Irish breakfast. You celebrate Patrick's weekend, St. Patrick's. And you go to the pub and have a good time with friends... What it means to be Irish for me even though I wasn't born here, I am living here, for me being Irish means having a voice, being heard and participate in Ireland... In growing Ireland. Doing something for this country (Group A).

Rigid, ahistorical and oversimplified notions of Irishness, 'home' and territory did not appear helpful to those negotiating local and 'national' communities to those designated as 'outsiders' or 'newcomers'. It would be easy to adopt an approach which suggests we should do away with, or ignore terms and categories of immigrant status, race, and/or ethnic heritage: to 'treat everyone the same'. However, in their practices of interrogating constructions of race, otherness and 'who belongs', many participants appeared to seriously question the idea that social group categories such as 'Traveller', 'migrant' and 'black', have equivalent status to that of 'settled', 'white' or 'citizen': not just in terms of majority attitudes, but in terms of relative agency, wellbeing and material comfort/security. Therefore, these categories were important. There appeared to be a feeling on the part of many that ignoring the ways in which people are identified would also lead to an ignoring of the relative agency/power of people who are positioned by their occupation of these and other social categories in Irish society. Members of Group B concluded that even those who adopt a 'neutral' stance and claim "I am just me – I am human" must understand the incredible power of this statement, as it seems to implicitly suggest that others are somehow not. This brings us to the metaphor and experience of *dehumanisation*.

Dehumanisation and being dehumanised was a particularly important metaphor, and an injurious, ongoing experience, for some participants. The concept was used to capture the effects of a school/societal context which ignores and reinforces the relative agency of its population in terms of classed racialised inequality. Dehumanising experiences were recounted below through narratives of seeing people in positions of power who view themselves as 'not racist', yet who refuse to acknowledge their (often middle class) implication in - at times bureaucratic, at times overly discretionary, and never entirely neutral - public policies and practices.

Fig. 3.1.4: Everyday dehumanisation: denial of racism/racialised positioning

This week, Wednesday, I was on the bus I was less than 2 cent and the man say to me, he doesn't care I have to pay full money. Then I add one euro and I said "okay I'm going two stops more than because I have to go anyway", then the man said so many different things and I say, look to somebody, like (he) shouldn't be driving the bus... (He said) "Oi, oi come back here, come back here", I said "I'm not coming back because I have my fare". He turned off his car, he called the police for me... The police with a big van they arrived after one hour. All the people was complaining me saying 'Oh our government allowed you this country, this shouldn't be happening' (laughter). I feel so embarrassed myself, I even said "look, you don't understand anything, this is my bus ticket, I paid the money". Anyway the police came, the worst thing could happen was that the man locked me in on the bus and then when the police came the police interviewed (us), I ask him questions and want to ask me questions and the police even said I would go to Dublin bus to complain. And the first thing he told the police was 'I'm not a racist I'm married to Chinese woman', you know. Then I say 'This guy he's a racist' and the police say 'No he's not a racist because he's married to Chinese woman' (Group F)

We have been calling for example for a review of the 1989 Incitement to Hatred Act... there have been no convictions and even one conviction was overturned. The way it works is for a conviction to be secured somebody has to hit me and say 'I am hitting you because X person said "those black bastards should be beaten up"; that's the only the way that conviction can be secured... for me those Civil Servants who say there is no racism because there is not a report, it is not reported because we don't have (adequate reporting mechanisms). If you go to the police to report it, there is no follow up, why would you go anyway? And if when you go you will be told 'okay the ethnic liaison officer is not here, come back next week', will you go back? No. So do you see how it is... it's something which would drag you down and eventually when you decide... you accept "okay now this is not my place, I can put up with anything". So when they call you name in the street, "fine thank you", you know, you ignore it and you keep going (Group E).

Sometime it's easier to see racism which is naked like, if someone slapped me in the canteen or in the street everyone can easily like see... but for me institutional (racism) is clinical... when you can be given a house which is run-down like those in other inner city areas... I mean it destroys your cultural (sic), it would be when you're denied those other basic needs or you're being systematically (denied)... That other racism it takes care of itself because the blame always goes to our nasty neighbour... and leave those guys in suits and in higher offices clear but these are the guys who formulate it and feed it (Group E).

3.2 Approaches to anti-racism: what is being problematised?

Participants in group B suggested that in a context where systematic racism has been normalised (and viewed as an individual rather than systematic or social exercise of power), teachers may fear – mistakenly in their view - that giving marginalised experiences a voice will 'cause' racism. Others adopted a more humanist and individualised response to anti-racism which suggested that racist and dehumanising practices and beliefs was an issue of 'outdated individual attitudes' that can be resolved over time with the appropriate leadership. There was significant debate in some groups over this particular idea during the day. The notion of 'progression' and 'education as the future' was one that expressed hope. However, others posed the intergenerational exclusion of Travellers from education, and the ethnic achievement gaps that persist in tandem with social class disparities in 'old migration' countries like Britain as examples which return us to the normalisation and disguising of power and control in schools/society.

Fig. 3.2.1: A matter of leadership and progression, and/or of power struggles in education?

- Participant 1: (The) Tell It As It Is campaign that began in the early 2000s and produced some work in 2005... and said like two generations later nothing has changed, that you know black kids in England are still achieving less than white kids in everything and it is because of the institutional racism you know within the state and within the education system in Britain. I think at this stage in Ireland we're at the beginning. The majority of black people as such in Ireland are people that were not born in Ireland, the kids that are born there are only entering primary now or early second level. And I think there's an onus on everybody working in the area to ensure that, you know, 50 years time there isn't another group like this talking about institutional racism in education like in Britain, you know.
- ...
- Participant 2: It starts at the top, works its way down and let's start today like, you know, there's 50 years ahead of us; we can improve things
- Participant 3: I know.
- Participant 4: Can I just come back on that?
- Participant 3: Yeah.
- Participant 4: Maybe I'm a bit negative as well about this, I know, and I must admit I'm probably not as positive about that we won't be sitting here in 50 years time at the moment, I hate to say it... I think it's the whole power, the allocation of resources, I mean we're even having problems at the moment getting two students places on a social and community development programme, it's not even a work placement, it's they do a piece of a research out in a community or an organisation and I mean the word that's coming back is really the black students are the ones, that they're having difficulty (Group F).

Definitions of 'the problem', including 'the problem of difference' are vital to examine, as each definition assumes or provokes a particular practical/political/policy response. It is worth returning here to points made in section 2 about race being a political signifier that 'floats' (Hall 1997), and to section 3.1, where participants consider the changing nature of constructions of us/them in Ireland. These can be compared to changing mainstream constructions of 'the problem of difference' in Britain during the second half of the 20th century. As Bourne (2001) relates, problems in post-war Britain were initially viewed at official and scholarly level as a matter of 'cultural difference'. With this definition of 'the problem', the perceived solution was to reduce psychological prejudice amongst 'the hosts' (us), and to view multiculturalism as something to do with immigrant communities (them). After much social unrest that came as a result of intolerable injustices (e.g. the 1981 Brixton riots), the appointment of more black leaders to positions of civic power was pursued. However, Bourne (2001) asserts "to increase the numbers of (individual) black people (in power) without attempting to change the system is to debase equal opportunity to equal opportunism" (Bourne 2001: 12). This thumbnail sketch does not sufficiently do justice to the British case, but it provides signposts back to the importance of considering how 'difference' is thought about, problematised, and responded to. Three broadly different ways in which 'difference' and power were conceptualised by participants and debated in wider research is returned to in section 4.3.

The British state and its institutions were heavily criticised by the 1999 Macpherson inquiry. Certain participants used the language of state and institutional critique to locate the source of power in Irish education and wider society. The first comments suggest a large degree of contradiction between the 'nice face' of the Irish state and public political culture regarding anti-racism, and the everyday experiences of asylum seekers and Travellers in particular. Other comments directly focused on publicly funded education suggest a sense of dissatisfaction with representations of the management of certain key public institutions as being unbiased or apolitical, e.g. patronage of primary schools and assessment systems. The metaphor of school 'choice' as being freely and equally available to all that prevails in market-oriented public and political culture was particularly critiqued here. This brought some participants on to the metaphor of 'sleepwalking to segregation', which is returned to later.

Fig 3.2.2: The role of the state, public institutions and public political culture

I would see (racism as) more than just being institutional, and I think the institutional racism that exists within the country stems from a state racism. I would argue that the Irish nation-state, like all other nation-states, is racist in its make-up, in how it defines who is a citizen, who is not a citizen and if you look at the treatment of asylum seekers and Travellers in particular, all the main establishment parties that have been in Government currently, Labour and Fine Gael, Fianna Fáil, have implemented the same policies towards groups that they feel are not part of 'us' and that manifests itself in the institutions of the state... I've come across it directly with kind of accompanying people, for example, to the offices of the family law court in Cork, to the registry office in Cork, to the motor taxation or the licensing part of Cork County Council and in the way community welfare officers deal with asylum seekers, cut clothing allowances, you know, don't give them the money to ... transportation to go to doctors, etc., etc., so I believe if we are to tackle institutional racism, it is the State we have to confront not just the institutions... Look at the Gardaí, for example, they have this ethnic liaison division... they're the nice guys, you don't see them at 5 o'clock in the morning when families are being dragged from their beds, you know, families being split up to be forcefully deported (Group F).

The state's role (in education) is almost realigning itself to a point where it becomes the arbitrator of choice. So it stands back and becomes 'neutral' and allows a kind of a tapestry of choice to just prevail, persist, without regulation or overseeing from an inclusionary perspective what it is, or what should be put in place. I think as well as that, the state itself is sleepwalking, because I think it has bought into... the apolitical non-ideological stance that the market or school choice is something to be allowed and individualized (Group B).

How can you actually be learner-centred in the current climate? ...We have this set of standards you are supposed to [achieve]... We have this world where everyone wants simplicity and everyone wants numbers and everything has to come to this standard at a certain time and that's the difficulty and even if a teacher had a different approach, would the system have even let her? (Group C).

An Australian researcher called Catherine Howell... talks about how citizenship is kind of accepted racism because it's been institutionalised on a global level and how just by virtue of the fact whether or not you're a citizen of a country it determines so much of your prospects within the country and the fact that countries are allowed to set up these walls against people who aren't citizens (Group E).

Given that education is often conceived the 'nice face' of the state/public sector, the place of teachers' and students' labour in narratives of 'victor' and 'victim' was contested by participants. As stated above, what is defined as 'the problem' is key to the type of intervention that is constructed and assumed legitimate. While not disagreeing with the above remarks, some participants were concerned with the location of power solely in the hands of the state. Others were concerned with the implications of using victor/victim representations as an anti-racist strategy. These issues are further explored below.

3.3 Along with presence/lack of power: politics of representing 'the problem' of difference

Immigrant populations in Ireland are distinctive in terms of their urban/rural density and the predominance of intra-European migration. This suggests the importance of not assuming one common experience of advantage or disadvantage along the lines of 'being an immigrant'. Connected to this the last statement in fig. 3.2.2 indicates, representing the source of power and control as solely held by state institutions may fail to consider the globalising dimension to how racism is currently being organised within market liberal societies. Racist and classed geographies are now legally differentiating and enforcing categories of (productive) citizen-worker from (burdensome) non-citizen-dependent across 'Fortress Europe' (Lentin and McVeigh 2006); this has been found to impact on teachers' perceptions of immigrant children in Irish schools (Devine 2005). Geog-

raphies of migration to and within Ireland are, as keynote speaker Mairtin Mac an Ghaill noted, are important to take into account when considering the usefulness of institutional racism as a concept.

A second point concerning representations of 'the problem' of difference relates to the non-recognition of migrant agency, heterogeneity, resourcefulness and organising (Lentin 2012). The following comments cautions against a narrative that paints racialised migrant and minority ethnic communities purely as victims in two ways. The first argues that the advantages gained by the racially majoritised through racism must not be ignored. The second highlights a complex and perhaps more subtle issue of representing anti-racism in what is popularly called 'the public sphere'. When a claim of racism is made, there is a risk in framing it in terms of an 'us versus them' that occupies every social space in the same way. This tends to repeat and fix constructions of racialised Otherness and ignore the different characteristics of multiple, living social spaces. Such representations can reinforce a monolithically 'public' view of racism as being something new that has nothing to do with 'the Irish' and histories of Irishness. It can also inadvertently suggest that certain members defined as 'the majority' never experience exploitation or repression, e.g., in terms of social class, gender, sexuality, 'etc.' (Butler 1990).

Fig. 3.3.1: Beyond associations of racism as 'the Other's problem': collectivities and details

We prefer to see (racism) as some sort of magical thing that just disadvantages one group and we can be seen to be benevolent and working very hard for the rights of that group without ever looking at the logical flipside that would be if there is a system that disadvantages one group it must advantage another. So you get this really odd thing where there is great concern about racism but nobody is racist and nobody is benefitting from it (Group B).

I think the victim, the perpetrators are victims as much as we are, you know, so we have to bring it in the mainstream and whatever we can do to do it that's been better than just ... otherwise I feel this sort of notion that "we didn't hear of racism until they came", I mean that's how some of the populous voices we hear, that's how they want to see it, but if we make it out issue collectively then it is easier to deal with it as opposed to saying it is only an issue for certain groups, not for everybody else (Group E) .

This level of complexity, where racisms are a collective set of issues that concern all societal members in differing ways, was explored by Mairtin Mac an Ghaill. At the beginning of his talk, he quoted the words of African American novelist and playwright James Baldwin. Mairtin used Baldwin's words to illustrate how literary writing can grasp something about "what it is to be human, about why I feel different to other people, about why people treat each other in a certain kind of way" in a manner that does not come easy to the social sciences and humanities. The use of metaphors which describe oppression in non-grounded manner is filled with risks, particularly in terms of its potential to naturalise the existence of state oppression, by overlooking the multiple arrangements and practices that are actively put in place to exclude others, such as deportation policies (Butler and Spivak 2007): Metaphors and stories of social movements can be easily, uncritically romanticised, crossing borders in ways that prevents us from analysing the origins and particular active characteristics of what is happening in front of us. By importing understandings of racism from other places, it can be quickly assumed that racism in Ireland is also 'imported from somewhere else', thus 'caused by' immigration and unrelated to anti-Traveller, classed and gendered politics (Kitching 2010). Mairtin suggested that we need historically situated explanations of what happens in Ireland, as opposed to *descriptions* that only use terms borrowed from other places and times.

Fig 3.3.2: Naming and interrogating the white world?

I entered or anyway I encountered the white world. Now this white world that I was encountering was, just the same, one of the forces that had been controlling me from the time I opened my eyes on the world. For it is important to ask, I think, where did these people I'm talking about come from and where did they get their particular school of ethics? What was its origin? What did it mean to them? What did it come out of? What function did it serve and why was it happening here? And why were they living where they were living and what was it doing to them? All these things that sociologists think that they can find out, and haven't managed to do... (Baldwin 1965: 121 in Mac an Ghaill 1991: 101).

Metaphors of oppression are important, but when not accompanied by a searching stance, they can prove counterproductive. They can risk suggesting that the conjoined construction of racial identity and the benefits/oppressions of racism are the same in all places at all times. Bringing us back to remarks in figures 3.1.1 and 3.1.2., as Mairtin points out, an important question about constructions of 'Irishness', nationhood and religion haunts questions of racism and education in Ireland and amidst 'the Irish'. By forgetting to historicise 'Irishness' when thinking about racism, we (in the context of Ireland) can reinforce the hopeless assumption that race/racism is a permanent 'part of human nature' (i.e., predictably the same in all places past, present and future). We may neglect to analyse the specific nature of power, control and privilege in contemporary Irish education, and assume that all forces in education are reducible to this historically and universally stable 'thing' called racism that is reducible to a simple fact of 'white-black conflict'. These points should not be taken to undermine the seriousness of racism; rather, they call for a serious *engagement with its complexity and lived reality* in the Irish context.

Fig. 3.3.3: On borrowed terms? Specifying what racism means in the context of 'Irishness'

The question is, what relationship do contemporary social movements around interculturalism, racism and education have with reference to this historical legacy? Are we familiar with this legacy? If there hasn't been a significant number of migrants, asylum seekers and diasporic people here until recently, then maybe that's one of the reasons why a notion of racism isn't here. But that raises the question of the longer history of experience of Travellers, and why haven't their representation had that impact? Why is it that some people seem to know more about or sympathise with the African American experience than we do with the experiences of Travellers? When I started writing about racialised Ireland over a decade ago, the terms, assumptions and definitions used in the Republic of Ireland seemed to be very derivative; borrowed from somewhere else. It was mainly descriptive and didn't provide explanatory processes with reference to racist practices at a local level, such as the school. A lot has changed, and a lot has not changed in that decade... there's a need to establish the specificity of this thing: these practices, these processes of Irish racism, if that's an appropriate term. For example, in western contexts, racism has a history with imperialist oppression. Given Ireland's colonial experience with Britain, it's not self-evident if there is a sense of racial/ethnic superiority among the Irish, where it came from, and what sustains it. One of the terms that's more complex than racism, is 'who the hell am I referring to when I keep on talking about these Irish people?' (Mairtin Mac an Ghaill Presentation).

Section 4 explores in greater depth the contested nature of how 'racism' was understood at the conference, as it was embedded in debates over globalised Ireland, school patronage and social class.

4. The complexity of racism in Irish education: data and debates

As is probably evident by now, participants shared a broad orientation towards anti-racism, but had differing ways of outlining an appropriate response or set of responses, based on their professional experience, their thinking on the issue, and their lived realities. Participants had differing interpretations of terms and identifiers like 'white', 'black', 'racism' and 'anti-racism'. Connected to this, they adopted different positions that were closer to, or further away from the forms of anti-racist thought espoused in public political culture and policy (Lentin 2004). Perhaps most importantly for this document, some had differing positions on what was meant by the role of 'education' in racism and anti-racism. For example, one person could have strong views on and experiences of state complicity with racism, while assuming that public education was a neutral or benevolent space that was exempt from societal power relationships and conflict over resources. Another could view racism as simply a problem of 'bad attitudes in some people's heads', while adopting a more critical stance on the culture of exclusion manifest through school enrolment policies and teacher orientations towards migrant and minority ethnic students. Unsurprisingly, there was vigorous discussion and debate over the data and arguments put forward by the three presenters. Mairtin Mac an Ghaill's words on the shifting nature of education, economic production and other 'national' projects are apposite as a starting point.

4.1 Post-conflict Ireland: racisms in a consumption-driven, lifelong learning society?

Mairtin argued strongly for a return to the genesis of the concept of racism, how it relates to nationalism, and how useful it is given the complexity of modern societies. The concept often denotes the problems of a society based around production, (e.g. manual labour, factory work), as opposed to consumption (e.g. of knowledge, consumer items, etc.). Racialisation relates to the genesis of the modern nation-state, the family, systems that exercise social control and surveillance like welfare and taxation, industrialisation and projects such as colonisation.

Fig. 4.1.1: New orientations towards the nation, education, resources and bodies

I'm trying to capture a new nationalism that is post-IRA and is post-peace process and it's difficult how these things coalesce, and they're not rational, and they're not obvious, and that's why Ireland rightly values its historians because that's how we find out how we live the moment we're living now... Irish schools are making Irish people. Irish schools are making the nation: that's what they do. They don't just hand out these subjects... Some white working class guys came to me the other day, they said its just incredible isn't it, these bourgeois parents; they turn the whole world into a school. It's all about learning; we've actually reworked what we mean by 'parents' and 'teachers' and 'students', that's part of the difficulty if you're coming into the system. And then what this working class guy is saying to me... all this cultural investment and then these guys get to higher education... and all they wanna do is go and get drunk. And they've disassociated... a lot of the theories that are there around racism across Europe.... particularly make sense in an industrial society. (Traditional race/racism theory) particularly makes sense around 'work'. And I know here that Ireland is the same as everywhere else. That notion of "them taking our jobs"; the opposite can also be true of course; but it's that these Others are people who have been too successful... It's difficult in Ireland because... in terms of industrialisation it hasn't followed the... (same line as) Europe. But I think that the discriminations and the exclusions within a post-industrial society, a society where the major means of making work is not around manufacturing and the kind of masculinity and the kind of family life that's associated with that, and the way that men and women are associated with that, men and women, of all those capitals that are there. One of the clues from this late modernity is that it is a consumption society; it is a society around bodies... and it's about looks. And it's about the dress they wear. Again you can immediately in the context of England work this out in relation to Muslim dress. How is it possible...how can that be so offensive? How can people be so angry – white people, rich people, Western people... if you almost pull away from politics as it were and pull away from the racisms and try and work it out, what is it that actually (constructs that racism)? (Mairtin Mac an Ghaill Presentation).

Mairtin's thinking about the forms of nationalism available in Ireland were not taken up in a wide-spread manner by participants, perhaps indicating the unavailability of resources to consider nationalism in Ireland contemporarily. While nationalist ideologies persist, they now often take the more 'soft' normalisation of ethno-centric national membership, or the valorisation of an exclusive 'diaspora nation' in public political culture (Lentin 2007). At times cultural nationalism is refuted in favour of a 'civic' or 'diverse' nation-state ideology. While nationalism is never reducible to racism and vice versa, they do have a specific, ongoing relationship to each other through the state apparatus: the modern state persistently attempts to justify the inclusion of some, constructing the Other as excluded, on biological, cultural, or citizenship grounds (Lentin 2004). The relationship between nationalism and racism is one that persists despite Ireland's purported "cosmopolitan conversion – a makeover for the nation" (Titley 2009: 158)¹⁰.

Mairtin's noting of certain parents turning 'the whole world into a school' may make reference to two things: first, it may connote the spread of education beyond the boundaries of the nation-state's remit in neo-liberal, marketised environments. Second, it perhaps more directly refers to the spread of structured learning activities well beyond the walls of the school, where middle class children's after-school time tends to be spent in organised cultural activities. Given the globalisation of education (greater commercial interests, online learning and competition for international students) it may no longer be useful to presume that borders and barriers to education lie simply 'within' state borders. It is also no longer useful to assume that borders and barriers to the state create barriers to education. Some may qualify to live permanently or temporarily in a particular state, but may face legal, financial or cultural barriers in accessing adult and/or post-secondary education, e.g., in the case of asylum-seekers and Travellers (Linehan and Hogan 2008; Hourigan and Campbell 2010). Others may not have citizenship in Ireland, but are able to pay thousands of euro in fees as non-EEA citizens. Both experience race and racism in Ireland in differing and overlapping ways, e.g. from the threat of deportation to the experience of anti-Muslim racism.

Fig. 4.1.2: The exorbitant cost of third level education for non-citizens

I'm in an academic institution now, when, you know, if you are a migrant you finish your secondary education I mean not in EU obviously but if you are non-EU (citizen)... you are 18, your time to go to university comes so then you realise actually I can't go to university because I'm still classified as a non-EU (citizen)... I have to pay... Those are children who have aspirations who will have worked hard to get those points for their Leaving Cert and yet they can't get in because basically they happen to be born somewhere offsite. So that's an example (of institutionalised racism; Group E).

The universalist language of liberalism itself cannot capture the complexity and power relationships involved in how difference is constructed, thus, perhaps counter-intuitively, helping construct insiders and outsiders: desirable and undesirable migrants (Kitching 2011a; Lentin and Titley 2011). The sheer scale of educational consumption and multiplicity of marketised options available to *particular* children and young people participate in suggests a changed, liberal social order that brings with it altered benchmarks of 'national' morality and normality for 'Ireland's children'. In turn, this implies an altering of what is considered 'Other' to the norm. Racism is *mediated* by non-neutral online and print outlets in highly mobile environments characterised by global-local movement of people and labour markets. The upper, professionalised echelons of such markets demand deferral from post-school entry towards investment in further education. The shift towards a constant, 'lifelong' learning trajectory, has made the right to third level education and work very important for migrants (amongst whom, asylum seekers who are statutorily denied such opportunities). The changing gender order associated with a post-industrial labour market (e.g. retail, tourism, pharmaceuticals, financial and IT services, etc.) makes different types of 'normal' masculinity and femininity available to young people that are less reliant on traditional notions of family,

¹⁰ Bryan's (2009; 2010) work on intercultural education ideology provides some important indicators of how the relationship between nationalism and racism persists through a nation-state project like 'Irish' education.

and more pursued through locally correct forms of individual consumption that offered by globalisation (e.g. high street shops, music, online consumption, social networking, etc.) In this context, individual work on the body becomes more important, and racialised Othering becomes more targeted at 'undesirable' bodies that are recast as 'out of place', or pre-modern, regressive and undisciplined, e.g. in the case of western, anti-Muslim panics. Advanced communications media and reduced-cost travel has facilitated transnational childhoods and alternative forms of support for certain diasporic (particularly Eastern European) children and young people in Ireland (Ní Laoire et al. 2009). However, use of such media and opportunities does not automatically mean that minority students are 'advantaged', 'socially mobile' or part of a 'cosmopolitan' elite.

Racism takes on differential shapes in the more religiously, ethnically and class-fragmented spaces of a post-Catholic or liberal Catholic Irish society (neighbourhoods, homes, schools, workplaces, etc.). Given the altered position of schooling in a consumption, individualised or 'user-led' society, anti-racist and intercultural educational discourse needs to develop sophisticated ways of thinking about how race and racism is constructed in more fragmented social spaces: through local interactions with global movements of people, capital and information. There are important signals of the impact of a consumption society on learning and relative advantage/achievement in Ireland. The *Growing Up in Ireland* study has recently examined home, school and community influences on 9-year olds' learning, asserting:

Children from more advantaged families (in terms of parental education, social class, and income) are more involved in cultural activities and social networking outside school. Children from immigrant families are more likely to fall into the social networker or busy lives groups and less likely to engage in cultural activities... Children from more advantaged families (in terms of parental education, social class, and income) are more involved in cultural activities and social networking outside school. Children from immigrant families are more likely to fall into the social networker or busy lives groups and less likely to engage in cultural activities... it is a matter of policy concern that children from less advantaged backgrounds are less likely to engage in the kinds of out-of-school activities which appear to enhance academic performance. In the longer term, children's recreation patterns may serve to widen the social class gap in achievement (GUI 2011: 1-2).

Delma Byrne presented information on the 'Educational Careers of Migrant Students in Ireland' (gathered and analysed with Dr. Merike Darmody, ESRI, drawing upon data from the *Adapting to Diversity* [Smyth et al. 2009] and *Post Primary Longitudinal Study* reports). Delma noted that in the period of data collection (2007-2009), immigrant students were more likely to be represented at primary level in urban, disadvantaged, English-medium, non-Catholic and larger schools (200+ students) respectively. Post-primary schools were characterised by being non-fee paying, English-medium and larger (200+ students). Schools that have a higher share of immigrant students are also more likely to have a higher share of Traveller students. Delma focused her presentation on some of the local politics associated with a school's changed ethnic profile, where certain parents were reported as being unhappy with the attention given to immigrant students in terms of language support. She also noted the widespread reduction of racism to its individual, interpersonal form in local educational discourse. For example schools reported there being 'no problem here' with respect to racism, and students themselves tended to view racism as something that happened outside of the school. Similar to Devine (2005), Delma noted the lack of Department of Education and Skills support felt at local school/leadership level in terms of resourcing 'intercultural' approaches. The data also echoed Devine's (2005) findings of an often positive, but paternalistic approach to migrant students in school practices and teacher-student relationships. Attention to the specificities of minority students' experiences was subsumed by 'positive' racial stereotyping in certain instances and caring, positively reinforcing one-to-one student-teacher relationships.

Delma extrapolated from these studies that minority students did not have equal access to the official curriculum and to knowledge about higher education, due in part to the more advanced

insider knowledge of their Irish/majority group peers. She argued that that **there is evidence of aspects of institutional racism in the Irish education system**, drawing upon the notion of ‘**cumulative disadvantage of migrant pupils**’ (Darmody, Byrne and McGinnity 2012)¹¹. She stated the research suggests that schools can and do perpetuate inequalities through biased disciplinary practices, and other aspects of programming and hidden curricula. These further include enrolment factors and lower teacher expectations of migrant students based on language proficiency and/or other factors. Below, this national-level research is further unpacked amongst conference-based debates about ‘educational values’ and access to education.

4.2 Educational achievement: culture as cause?

An area that provoked explicitly contentious views was that of the ‘causes of educational values’; this has already been alluded to in comments discussed in fig. 3.1:

Why do they say that (immigrants) value (education)?’ It looks like they were expecting them not to value it ... before I became immigrant I was not born immigrant (Group C).

A specific debate opened up over ‘immigrants’ values’ in terms of the anecdotally perceived impact that immigrants have on disadvantaged schools in Ireland. In his presentation, Karl Kitching argued that the often reported idea that immigrant students have a ‘positive effect’ on disadvantaged schools assumes a number of things about ‘immigrants’ that may be counterproductive in the long-run for anti-racism. Referring back to Lentin (2004) earlier, it may indicate a type of anti-racism that refutes race as a biological marker. At the same time however, it uses ‘culture’ as the sole causal explanation to ‘positively’ characterise and ‘explain’ the behaviour of immigrants. Karl argued that reductions of explanations of ‘the Other’ to culture, i.e., culturalism, is a precarious and simplistic practice. It locates the causes of immigrants’ successes and failures within ‘cultural practices’ that are fixed on their own bodies. Making ‘culture’ a causal explanation for the Other has the same effect as using ‘race’ as an explanation: it fails to consider the issue in its complexity, having a more subtle, but no less racialising/dehumanising effect. Most importantly, the ‘glocal’ material conditions and cultural misrecognition that many immigrants experience is generally left out of such ‘explanations of the Other’ that start with ‘culture as cause’¹².

Fig. 4.2.1: The dangers of using culture/culturalism to explain ‘the Other’s’ behaviours

On the one hand, culturalism can be tacitly used to angelicise students and overestimate the agency available to ‘them’ to overcome persistent and multiple barriers. It can also be easily flipped to negatively define ‘deficient’ cultures. What about young people who are ambivalent about what school in Ireland is really teaching them? Do we reduce that to some sort of fixed values that have their origin intrinsically in the student, that have nothing to do with how they experience the local area, being part of a diaspora, or being an asylum seeker?

Migrants and minority ethnic groups are regularly evaluated in public discourse according to vague notions of their ‘culture’ and ‘values’. But it also seeps into how research is reported and how students’ identities are understood. We have seen a number of studies report how teachers and principals hold certain ‘non-national’ and ‘EAL’ students in high regard, as well as reports that emphasise the ‘value’ that students themselves place on education. I am tempted to say why is the idea that

¹¹ The notion of cumulative disadvantage described in Darmody et al. (2012) does not make specific links with critical theorisations of class or racism. It is therefore unclear from this concept how it links to race and intersectionality theorisation in education in Ireland (Kitching 2012a). Given the nuancing of the notion of additive models of double and triple subordination by intersectional thinking elsewhere (Youdell 2006), it is important that the specific nature of inequalities and the meanings made about them is subject to ongoing research.

¹² Karl argued elsewhere that in such discourses, “‘good migrants’ are... positioned as providing an example for the ‘bad (indigenous) working class’ (Kitching 2010: 224). Such discourses have lengthy historical precedent: the internal rationalisation that characterised the rise of many modern European nation-states racialised the working classes as biologically inferior (Lentin 2004). Here, the category of ‘race’ was constructed to ‘explain’ lower social status and supposed incompetence rather than consider power and inequality. The external fortification of such states through imperial competition led to a change in the use of the category of race, the ‘floating signifier’ (Hall 1997). Ethno-national others became constructed as the primary ‘degenerate’ threat. While processes unfolded in a different sequence due to colonial and postcolonial state-building, the above example shows how ‘race’ is deployed to naturalise class inequalities and contingently accept migrants as ‘helping the (classless) Irish nation’ (Bryan 2008; 2009; Kitching 2010).

migrant students value education even a question? But I know politically, the intent of these kinds of research statements to get the message out there that migrant and minority ethnic students want to learn. No more than Delma having to point out to the general public that immigrant students have actually stayed in Irish schools, one could say that this political intent is a statement in themselves of how conditional the trust Irish society has in migrant and minority ethnic students is. But research methods that involve simply reporting on values often does not make explicit that there is an imagined set of people – an ‘us’ describing ‘them’ – usually researchers, teachers, principals and policy makers – who get to problematise and decide whether the ‘values’ supposedly inherent to particular students and families are compatible with the school or not... There is much anecdotal talk circulating among education professionals and in research reporting that migrants ‘lift expectations’ in schools designated as serving disadvantaged communities. I find that idea, because it is so amenable to sugar-coating social relations, highly problematic. I have repeatedly argued that this discourse actually reveals itself as a statement of conflict rather than cohesion, because it implicitly pits an imagined block of ‘good’ migrant students as different to ‘bad’ working class Irish students on the basis of supposed values. Apolitical talk of values and expectations persistently ignores the systemic marginalisation of working class young people and again, over-estimates the capacity of certain minority ethnic or working class Irish students to simply use education as a means of ‘rising above’ their racialised migrant status or their socio-economic status (Karl Kitching presentation).

This is not to remove culture from the analysis: a participant in Group A similarly suggested after this that rather than having ethnic identity being accorded to/defined by ‘values’, it needs to be looked at more in terms of its formation through practices in real-life, physical contexts. It is useful to refer here to the existing literature that distinguishes between the notions of ‘cultural capital’ and fields of practice, and the attribution of ‘culture’ or ‘ethnicity’ as a fixed trait/cause of educational ‘orientations’. Dymphna Devine’s work, for example, has explained the importance of cultural capital for immigrant children and their families in Ireland (Devine 2009, 2011). Such capitals are not context-free ‘attributes’ that migrants ‘transplant/bring with them’. Neither are they necessarily within migrants’ conscious control. Rather, they are socially defined and valued forms of knowledge and behaviour that are exercised, exchanged and transformed in relation to other forms of capital (such as economic and social capital) in particular contexts. The forms of capital defined in one context are not as easily or automatically exchangeable in another; they require constant work and negotiation. As such, educational orientations are not ‘innate’ attributes of immigrants or others; they reflect and further help produce the forms of capital available to students in particular places and times. The positioning of many immigrant students in school areas designated as serving disadvantaged communities strongly suggests a potential for immigrants’ capacity to mobilise, exchange and amass valued capitals to be constrained in comparison to the general population (Kitching 2010; Devine 2011; Darmody et. al 2012).

These points were drawn out to some degree in discussion groups; for example, the following comments of members of Group D demonstrate the complexities of the issue. While it was recognised that evidence was ‘anecdotal’, the first participant pointed out that evidence is emerging that literacy standards have improved in disadvantaged school settings where immigrant students of professional (medical) parents are located. The second participant moved the conversation back to the question of ‘how that achievement is explained’, and the complexities of taking social class and gender into account. This participant noted from the British experience how controversial ethnic monitoring of achievement is.

Fig. 4.2.2: Achievement: what are the signs, and what are the costs of how it is explained?

Participant 1: The only thing we have at the moment is anecdotal. I know that Karl was pooh-poohing that earlier on but it is a fact that... the children in disadvantaged schools in inner city areas, the general picture in terms of literacy standards, has improved. And one of the things... one of the reasons for that, that principals report and teachers report is the impact of having, it goes to social class as well. If you go to other country schools for example, the disadvantaged areas in the country, in Dublin city, there happens to be a hospital beside it, kids are just arriving now en masse into the local schools. Their parents are working class. So you have got these kids that are coming in so it is partly social class, it is an ethnic mix and it is impacting on schools themselves.

Participant 2: In England in 2003 we also had few figures but there was a push to finding out who was there and where. So we started to collect evidence of in the early 2000s, maybe now it has moved on, of black Caribbean boys and black Africans... there was evidence there that they were underachieving, oh but and male working class as well. Indian boys and Indian girls doing quite well in certain areas. And then also, and this is interesting that Pakistani girls do better than their brothers in some areas. So the gender thing, and then the next stage was, so we had in 2003 to ask where were the children in the country achieving? Where were they doing well, from whatever background, and what did that say? And we did become more sophisticated in our understanding. We did not know enough about gender issues before. And then they keep now coming up again and again. So what I am saying is that it is not that unusual for a country not to know or have figures, but I think there comes a point where there may be a push towards deciding to check... And it is highly controversial, isn't it, this monitoring? (Group D).

The 'positive' anti-racism of those who argue that immigrants' presence enhances educational achievement in disadvantaged areas may be buttressed by recent findings which suggest that primary schools designated as serving disadvantaged localities have increased literacy scores independently of immigrant students' scores (Eivers et al. 2010). However, major political questions remain regarding the quantitative interpretation of such results, and it would be very easy to ignore the existing body of research in Ireland which has carefully documented stable correlations between literacy achievement and being (white, Irish) working class. Has the arrival of immigrants done something that decades of policy and intervention failed, in some respects, to do for working class children's formal literacies? Has a purported 'immigrant cultural capital effect' academically transformed the strong statistical relationships that exist between Irish working class mothers' educational achievement, number of books in the home and the achievement of their children? (Eivers et al. 2004). Or should other factors be taken into account, such as the increased resourcing and intensive focus on testing afforded to DEIS schools during the 2005-2009 period (Weir 2011)? Weir (2011) notes in a review of DEIS between 2007 and 2010 that

While the average reading and mathematics scores of pupils whose home language was not English or Irish did increase significantly between 2007 and 2010, so too did the scores of native English/Irish speakers. This indicates that greater numbers of international pupils in the 2010 sample could not account fully for the improved overall average 2011: 10).

Prior to all of these questions, however, is the ethico-political question of *how migrant students, at national level, become overrepresented in areas of disadvantage* in the first place. Assessing international and national evidence, Delma, along with colleagues Merike Darmody and Frances McGinnity, note that schools serving areas designated as disadvantaged:

Are more likely to have experienced declining student numbers, attract a diverse body of students requiring extra supports, and have different school climates, and be more likely to use streaming practices. Given this evidence, the school-going patterns of (migrant) young people represent systematic disadvantage if these schools expose them to a heightened level of risk of not adjusting socially and academically (Darmody, Byrne and McGinnity 2012: 7).

The OECD (2009) report that social class has had a greater effect on the achievement of immigrant students than of indigenous Irish students. Eivers et al. (2010) have noted at national level evidence of lower reading performance among children whose home language is neither English nor Irish. Devine (2011) notes recent Irish research suggesting the 'deficit' view that many teachers hold of children who are not fluent in English, which has been linked significantly to streaming and tracking practices (Lyons 2010; Darmody et al. 2012). Following MacRuairc (2009), she argues

identifying language acquisition as the central goal of educational policy, to the neglect of social and cultural dynamics in children's lives will only consolidate and reinforce existing patterns, as has been shown with respect to working class children (Devine 2011: 43-44).

Darmody et al. (2012) question a recent statement by the Department of Education and Skills (2011) which presents migrant students' increasing representation in Leaving Certificate Applied programmes as being evidence of their being mainstreamed successfully into the post-primary education system' (2011: 164). Previous ESRI research has demonstrated the lack of curricular challenge experienced by LCA students. Furthermore, post-school employment opportunities for those who complete the LCA tend to be comparatively less available than for labour market entrants with the traditional Leaving Certificate/Vocational Programme; Banks et al. 2009.)¹³.

4.3 The politics of place, religion and intergenerational family: 'one size fits all?'

Schools, while usually designated as pre-political or apolitical, are places that actively enact and reflect specific struggles over local and societal resources. Urban school settings are particularly complicated places because of the ways ethnic, gender and social class differences construct and delineate them, and because of the population densities that characterise built-up areas. The politics of school catchment area, patronage and provision at local level in Ireland have received much media and scholarly attention in recent years (McDonald 2007; Daly 2009; Coolahan et al. 2012), perhaps to the detriment of parallel, or overlapping discussions of social class and problematisation of the received notion of 'free school choice' (McCutcheon 2007; Byrne and Smyth 2010; Kitching 2010; Devine 2011; Darmody et al. 2012). Smyth et al. (2009) found that schools that are subject to greater between-school competition in Ireland are less likely to have migrant students. Darmody et al's (2012) national survey data notes:

Where schools were oversubscribed, enrolment criteria, such as 'first come, first served' and priority given to siblings already in the school, were likely to favour settled communities and thus migrants were under-represented in these schools. Among the two schools with no migrant students, it was evident that differences in admissions policies exist (Darmody et al. 2012: 12).

The specific issue of local school enrolment policies and discretion as a barrier to immigrant students provoked some consensus, but also some contentious discussion at the event. A number of participants described the dominance of Catholic management in the primary sector as a proxy means through which racialisation and class stratification is facilitated. Place in this reading is political; it reflects and embodies struggles, inclusions and exclusions. Others took a more 'one-size fits all' view of enrolment policies, arguing that catchment area could not be seen to directly racially discriminate. In this view, the division of space into particular boundaries and places is regarded as neutral.

¹³ Much has been written in the US and the UK about purported 'achievement gaps' and the combined, devastating impact that deficit-framed or tracking-framed national education policy can have, especially when associated low teacher expectations are taken into account. African American scholar Gloria Ladson-Billings referred to the racialisation of explanations of achievement in the US as the 'education debt' (Ladson-Billings 2006). Ladson-Billings (2006) is not suggesting achievement results are imaginary or 'made up'. The 'debt' she refers to is society's debt towards students it persistently excludes and explains in terms of their 'deficiency' and 'Otherness'.

Fig. 4.3.1: The insufficiency of liberal pluralism in capturing the politics of place

While the language of the Education Act talks about inclusion, schools are allowed to have enrolment policies, and encouraged to have enrolment policies that actually lead to exclusion and certainly leads to a situation where equality of access isn't the norm... our school opened as an emergency school for children who were unable to get into their local schools and 96% of those children are children whose parents are not Irish although a lot of the children were born in Ireland. Those parents who came to our school had been unsuccessful in negotiating access to Catholic schools, to Gaelscoils and to Educate Together schools in their local area and the only thing in common out of (all the) children who had no school places was that they weren't Irish or their parents weren't Irish. And that is a very clear sign to me of institutionalised racism. Perhaps it's unintended, but the religious clauses, the Gaelscoil clauses and the Educate Together first-come-first-served clauses in enrolment policies work against newcomers. It gets very difficult for people to access primary schools which are national schools where there should be equality of access... People are beginning to realize that you are going to have schools for migrants and schools for white-Irish beside each other, often sharing the same campus... when we get our new (school) premises our school is going to be beside a Gaelscoil and the reality of that will be very, very stark. It is happening more and more and I think we are kind of sleep walking to segregation. We are doing that in Dublin in primary education (Group B).

The school that is applying the enrolment policy will say that we are rejecting other people in the town – they can't get in either. "We have defined our catchment area and if you live in the catchment area we'll deal with you but if you don't live in the catchment area..." You cannot say that they are not accepting Muslims because they are Muslims or black people because they are black people (Group D).

A number of years ago when there were so many black kids who couldn't find schools and actually the blame was (put) on the students themselves ... and yet it's not as if those children came in from Lagos or Nairobi... They were (born) here so their parents were getting child benefit and then all of a sudden (education and social policy makers) don't want to acknowledge the problem, the problem was we chose the enrolment policies and all of a sudden when that's how the school ended up, you know, when Educate Together came into being (Group E).

There is a risk of oversimplification in the reduction of religious pursuits, ethos and/or catchment area to being solely or always about racialised and classed struggles over resources. The equation of religion with race, for example, typically can be worked against the minoritised, e.g. in the case of populations in the west experiencing anti-Muslim racism, or minority communities who offset racism by drawing on their religious similarity to the dominant ethnic group. Enrolment policies in Irish schools are multi-layered in terms of the preconditions they lay down, and are developed at local level, making generalisations about their effects somewhat difficult. However, familial pursuit of religious and/or other school ethos always has a socio-economic dimension alongside the cultural practice of religious observance: the point is ultimately, that manner in which these interact are context specific (Kitching, forthcoming, 2013a).

Specific cases of the politics of place and 'kin' can shed light on the cultural and legal complexities involved. The recent overturning by the Circuit Court and High Court on appeal of an Equality Tribunal ruling was discussed in more than one group. A Traveller student, John Stokes, was recently denied access to the oversubscribed Christian Brothers High School in Clonmel on the basis of not fulfilling one aspect of the enrolment criteria: the 'parent rule', i.e. that he did not have a parent who had attended the school. Lawyers from the Irish Traveller Movement Independent Law Centre representing the student via his mother Mary argued in the Circuit Court and the High Court that this was a discriminatory practice, because the parent rule is more likely to exclude both children of migrant and Traveller fathers. Both migrant and Traveller fathers were unlikely to have attended the school due to recent arrival in the area and a history of educational exclusion respectively. However, the Circuit Court found that the school's policy of favouring the children of

past pupils was “justified, appropriate and necessary to fulfil its family ethos”, and the High Court upheld this finding (Heffernan 2012). One participant described their feelings on the case:

Fig 4.3.2: The intergenerational nature of educational exclusion

I don't see the parent rule as being any way inclusive or supporting an inclusive education system and it does create indirect discrimination, not just for Travellers but for migrant children. It is a class issue as well in terms of if your parent hasn't completed secondary school and I suppose when we talked about institutionalised racism it is those policies that can create the systems and practices in the school (Group B).

The issue of 'one-size fits all' policies has been strongly critiqued by anti-racist education scholars in Britain (Gillborn 1995; Crozier 2001). A number of participants at the conference were similarly critical of what they regarded as a lack of policy and legislative understanding of the intergenerational nature of education exclusion. The alternative reading of students as equally-positioned individual players (unlinked to intergenerational dis/advantage) in the education sector was discussed under various guises during the day. Below are two examples of the opposing side of this argument. On the one hand, the first participant argued that policies which fail to account for group-specific histories of marginalisation intervene in ways that individualise and problematise the Other, leading to further Othering.

The individualised responses in the system assume that the group is the problem, the marginal group is the problem so rather than changing the system, the group has to change, not the system... Saying that “they always hang around together” and they hang around together because of the hostility, because it's safe. And why don't we examine it differently? (Group A).

On the other hand, a participant questioned the practice of a teacher personally loaning black shoes to Traveller students who did not wish to follow the school's policy on footwear.

I have a problem about the teacher who bought the four pairs of black runners; because I don't think she should you know... I feel she is treating them differently, and why isn't it just as easy for their parents or those children to make the choices. Sorry now, it's on the letter that this is the uniform it's black trainers. Why would they set out to be different and to be noticed and wear white runners, if they know the rule is 'black this is', are they looking for to be treated differently and to be? (Group F).

The first two statements assume something about 'difference', and both have implications for how anti-racist policy and practice is pursued. The first suggests 'difference' to be a group identity that is constructed through power struggles; the defining characteristic of one's identity is thus one's superior or inferior position. In this example, the minority 'hanging around together' are explained in terms of self-protection and preservation in a hostile social environment. Thus treating people 'the same' and/or assuming they experience the world in 'the same way' is inherently unequal, as they are not equally positioned. The second assumes 'difference' to be a (natural) individual trait that bears no relationship to one's social status; by this logic, treating people 'differently' in resource terms is inherently unequal, and claims of difference amount to little more than seeking special attention/internalisation of victimhood. A way of moving critically beyond these opposing terms (i.e. entirely free individual versus entirely racially dominating system) is to consider the multiplicity of factors at play in the distribution and exercise of power in neo-liberal forms of racism, which the third statement (below) alludes to.

I was there with a man I was talking to last night and we were chatting. He's a white man and he was saying to me “why do black people always stick together”? ... He couldn't see it... Whether those terms are still racism I don't know (Group D).

As noted earlier in this section and in section 4.2, class (as well as gender, dis/ability and sexuality) is a form of identity whose power struggles intersect with race and ethnicity. There is no one 'Irish', 'migrant' or 'Muslim' experience, and the terms through which both racism and anti-racism are enacted is subject to change and revision in particular times and places (see also sections 1 and 3.1 of this document). Additionally, as noted in section 4.1, racism takes on differential shapes in the more religiously, ethnically and class-fragmented spaces of a post-Catholic Irish society (neighbourhoods, homes, schools, workplaces, etc.). Here, racism may be configured less through overt notions of biological/cultural superiority or inferiority: while the construction of some people and spaces (such as schools, homes and churches) as essentially different persists, these are now normatively evaluated in 'glocal' terms of being more or less liberal, marketable, normal or desirable than others.

This returns us to the politics of representing 'the problem of difference' noted in fig. 3.3.1. Certain anti-racist discourses (whether emphasising free individual choice metaphors or anti-system politics) can inadequately pit 'us' and 'them' as groups with fixed traits against each other. Perhaps an additional set of questions about definition needs to be kept in play: how is the particular problem of school enrolment is being defined, what notions of equality and diversity are being drawn upon, how race as a political category is foregrounded and/or ignored, and what alternative ways of conceptualising enrolment are excluded from these definitions? At a very basic level, however, the following participants' frustration provides sobering pause for thought, on the form of anti-racist and intercultural discourse that s/he views as available in everyday education in Ireland.

I suppose I should be grateful that there is something that we can term as a 'mainstream approach towards racism in education', maybe I should be grateful for that, but the approach tends to be very much a spotlight on groups... a pathologising analysis of disadvantage... you know, "oh Travellers don't value education", or a stunning denial of the systematic abuse of the community. So when the spotlight is going that direction rather than back on the mainstream community... we don't have a word for the form of education we promote currently. We talk about intercultural education but it is monocultural education. You know, that we don't have to describe that so therefore we don't have to take responsibility for the way in which it is deeply problematic (Group B).

As the above statement indicates, participants reflected regularly on the types of anti-racist discourse available to education practitioners. Some felt that the lack of a more critical/stronger reading of racism corresponded to the fact that there is a reluctance to confront teacher practices as part of the exercise of power in society. This feeling contrasts markedly with a perspective discussed earlier, where some felt that public education had a 'natural' anti-racist trajectory that was characteristic to it, which would help resolve racism as a societal issue over time.

I think the way that people are often very disappointed with say intercultural anti-racist training, people say 'oh I really want that training', like the teachers would say 'I don't know what to do' and they go along for a day or a couple of days training and it's not what they thought it was going to be. They wanted a list... Lilia Bartolomé, she talks about that, about how teachers want their teaching bag of tricks... it's so much more than the philosophy of ... you know, 'Muslims do this', 'Travellers do that', that's what they wanted and they didn't get it and they still feel, you know, unsure somehow (Group C).

5. Future steps and networks

Although we are talking about institutional racism, we have to see how it affects the ground level. And, because sometimes we can see policies that are made that look ok in theory but, when you look at the ground level, the effect that comes around is different... we know that institutional racism is a difficult concept, but even when clear areas are named, and the issues are talked about over and over, there's still no change. An example is access to third level education for unaccompanied mi-

nors. It was something that was being talked about 10 to 12 years ago, but still we haven't seen much change... We talked about policies being used as a buffer by government and other organisations; when they say 'we have that strategy', without really evaluating the (political) effects that strategy is causing, just to have the box ticked (Group B, plenary).

We found that we were very well able to articulate evidence of institutional racism with regard to enrolment policies, with regard to equality of access, equality of outcome... but when it came to talking about institutional racism or trying to define it, we really struggled, and felt that there was a lack of a conceptual language about institutional racism particularly within the Irish context. So I think that's something for academics and policy-makers and practitioners to begin to talk about: can we (define) institutional racism in Ireland... what is the specificity of Irish racism? We acknowledged a slowness to change in Irish policy-making, and we also asked a lot more questions than we had answers... What exactly is it that we are asking teachers to do in schools, broadly, and what is the function of schools? I suppose that goes back to models of education: are we working within a model of the school as reacting to the market needs or should schools have a broader function in terms of providing an inclusive schooling ethos. Who has responsibility for ensuring inclusive education? Within the Irish context, we don't really know because of the complexity of school-state relations so, when an issue comes up in relation to discrimination, it's bounced back and forth... who has responsibility (Group D, plenary)?

We felt there was a tension between the real complexity of these issues and the constraints that exist by the attempt at simplification by those who are resistant to the discourse (of institutional racism). There is an attempt to try to simplify and categorise, and yet these issues are so, so complex (Group C, plenary).

There are many debates to be had over education as a site of conflict and education as a site of cohesion. But can we have that please, because we don't have it? We assume it's all cohesive... Linked to that, how do we understand bullying, how do we understand children being kicked on the way home from school. If we only problematise that, the only logical endpoint is that children are responsible for racism (Group F).

Representatives of each discussion group participated in a panel discussion at the end of the day, where the issues raised and the overall experience of the conference was reflected upon. A strong sense of energy and enthusiasm was generated by the spaces for discussion and it was stated by many that it needed to be replicated and moved forward politically and culturally; at the same time, there was a level of private despondency regarding the enormity of the task of anti-racism in Ireland. One participant observed that there is nothing difficult or complex about the act of treating other people like human beings. What is complex, she argued, is the construction of racialising ideologies that are invested in practices with dehumanising results. This section describes some of the key points that emerged during the final panel session, while continuing to draw on the discussion groups as a reference point. The recommendation that repeatedly came up was the need to **disseminate the research that has been done on Irish education**; this document, not least Appendix C, goes some way towards furthering this goal. The other points refer in overlapping ways to (1) how race and racism is conceived of in Ireland (2) the search for certain ethico-political anti-racist norms for education; and (3) the search for a repertoire of practical anti-racist education responses.

Austerity politics: Cultural, social and economic responses to re-constructions of privilege

The September 2012 report *State Sanctioned Child Poverty and Exclusion* (Arnold 2012) highlighted that one-third of people living in direct provision are children. Long before the onset of recession, asylum-seeker children, young people and adults living in direct provision have been subject to overcrowding, poor diet and a range of risks, including sexual violence and serious mental ill-health. The conditions asylum-seekers have lived in have rarely been linked to current Irish/Eu-

European mainstream austerity politics, perhaps because those living in direct provision in Ireland have no rights in the electoral system, and thus can only have indirect influence over the political establishment through advocates and social movements. However, the effect of austerity politics, i.e., the persistent prioritising of interests over others as 'the only solution' to public governance, were placed front and centre by participants. A key area described by one participant was the use of the term 'mainstreaming' in public policy. This term, it was argued, painted 'a nice gloss over the withdrawal of resources for Traveller education':

What we've had in the last number of years, particularly in the last year, is a complete decimation of resources in Traveller education. The infrastructure that was built up over 40 years was wiped out overnight with the last budget. Many organisations, like ourselves, were calling for a review of some of the structures that were there because they were 40 years old and they did need changing and they did need tweaking but rather than do that and face the challenges the government saw this as an easy target and they closed down the senior Traveller training centres overnight, they took out the resource teachers, they took out the visiting teacher, you know, they took out a number of resources that was there but rather than face the challenges there were being identified by the community it was easier to take out them resources and now subsequently blame the community for saying that the community wanted to be mainstreamed (Group A).

The terms of relative advantage and disadvantage shift politically in times of austerity; however, the political logic of liberal-market Irish/European governance has retained its individualism and thus its naturalisation of inter- and intra-national hierarchies. With austerity politics in mind, some participants looked towards an ethic of interrogating privilege, a term that has resonance with Anglo-American critical literature. They recommended confronting the potential loss of face that goes with breaking with the imagined and practised solidarity which majority racialised group may have with each other; this loss of face, of course, does not automatically assume the person loses their material advantages in life (Kitching 2011b).

You've to look at the privileges that you're losing, all the time. Whenever I'm challenging racism or when I choose not to challenge it I look ... I'm aware that there's a privilege involved, that I'm losing something (if I challenge), so if it's in the home and my mother is saying something that I wouldn't agree with sometimes I'll stay silent because I don't want to fall out with my mother and because that's a privilege, yeah, and then it's making yourself aware of even those little privileges, you know the 'I don't want to be the awkward one at the party' or 'I don't want to be the loud one again', so there's always a little privilege like when you choose to stay silent... it's about who you choose to be, do you choose to be the awkward one? (Group C).

The question of whether those in the majority ethnic group are capable of deconstructing their own privilege was raised in the plenary by Group C. Given the importance of international as well as national governance, perhaps a key message is **that the politics of interrogating privilege in Irish education require constant turns away from the self, and constant linkage to transnational political movements**. However, as the next point suggests, Irish-based actions might not repeat familiar patterns of being largely subsumed under **Anglo-American (white/black) models of race and anti-racism** (Mac an Ghaill 2002).

Working with and against bureaucratised and discretionary performances of 'Irishness'

Referring back to figures 4.3 and 4.4, there was debate over 'positive' accounts of immigrants in education that focus on 'culture as cause'. The key area of debate was the ways in which certain cultural practices were interpreted as reflecting some innate trait of a group. Reversing this to look at the majority, some members of Group A were keen to stress that there are aspects of 'Irish administrative culture' that tactically need to be named for their (sometimes legalised), privileged (ab)use of discretionary powers, e.g., in school enrolment policies, in social protection payments and entitlements, in Ministerial executive authority over citizenship, and so forth. As Mairtin not-

ed, Irish schools make 'Irish' children: as an institution, schools play a key role in culturally legitimating/categorising and materially privileging certain ways of being and living. Participants had a lot to say about Irishness, and Irish public political culture, not least the fact that some non-citizen children and young people are moving through the school system with little concept of the formal and informal financial and social barriers that will meet them when attempting to access third level.

Participant 1: If we're reflecting on 'Irish culture' you are going to come up with generalisations and there's a usefulness in them so when you talk about the stereotypes it's where on that continuum is stereotyping and reflective ...

Participant 2: There's something there isn't there, how there could be a generalisation that could be quite useful but then there's a process that happens that solidifies it into a stereotype which can then be acted upon to create prejudice... I think wasn't it Martin Luther King who said you know "I can't control what you think about me but I can control what you do to me", so there is something to be said about having tight legislation and tight laws, you know, and recourse that has to happen because, you know, maybe you can't make people like them but at least you can't beat me up and not get away with it, you know (Group A).

The tactic of naming such (sometimes legalised) discretionary local practices in Irish publicly funded institutions is important, and it does not equate with reducing such practices to a discrete or bounded 'Irishness' that is unilaterally held by some bodies over others (while erasing social class, gender and other power relationships simultaneously in play)¹⁴. A Group C representative at the plenary noted that the data they saw from Delma Byrne's presentation on migrant segregation in primary schools was quite alarming, and they wondered if the primary school segregation suggested parents were avoiding placing their second generation children in certain schools, based on the negative experiences of their first generation children. This remained an open question for them in tandem with the more obvious questions of social class and of the age distribution of migrant students.

There is further debate to be had about the merits of 'tightening up' or 'nationalising' certain practices and procedures in Irish education, e.g. school enrolment policies. It is worth remembering that institutional racism was partly defined earlier in the document in terms of its 'one size fits all' approach to difference and power. The point was made by participants in Group A that the re-orientation of initial teacher education towards four-year undergraduate and two-year postgraduate programmes provides a key opportunity for compulsory space to be given to intercultural and anti-racist teacher education. This has been followed in recent months by provisional recommendations on amalgamation of certain teacher education institutions in Ireland (Sahlberg, Munn and Furlong 2012). It is worth noting, however, that terms of neither the recent **Audit on Enrolment Policies** (DES 2007), the **Discussion Paper on a Regulatory Framework for School Enrolment** (DES 2011), the **National Intercultural Education Strategy** (DES/OMI 2010), the **Report of the Advisory Group to the Forum on Patronage and Pluralism** (Coolahan, Hussey and Kilfeather 2012), nor the report of the **International Review Group on Teacher Education** (Sahlberg et al. 2012) make specific reference to combating or educating about indirectly racist patterns of discrimination. Neither does Sahlberg et al's (2012) report make reference to issues of teacher 'supply and demand' discuss the (Irish language) barriers faced by some people of migrant and minority ethnic background in their pursuit of third level teacher education. Some of these make at best surface reference to combating or educating about indirectly racist patterns of discrimination in schools and other education institutions, by citing global, European and national conventions or a general ethos of 'inclusion'. It is not known what the outcome of the planned divesting of (Catholic) schools, or the planned 2013 regulatory framework on enrolment will be. We know that the logic of 'free parent choice'

14 As has been argued by Warmington (2009) amongst others, the process of anti-racism in education requires a dual working with and against racial categorising at a conceptual and political level.

often disguises the unequal pitting of social groups against each other in accessing schools. Historical precedent shows that nation-state surveillance techniques can work in ambivalent ways for anti-racism, where the political hierarchy of race is constantly naturalised: “the introduction of strict controls over the entry of non-nationals into the territory of the nation-state is inextricable from its novel need to quantify and categorise those living under its jurisdiction” (Lentin 2004: 55). While a formal outlawing of institutional racism does not exist in Ireland (the concept of ‘indirect discrimination’ on the basis of race/Traveller identity working as a weak stand-in), the formalisation of a legal notion of institutional racism that is quite depoliticised and only referential to one setting (e.g. employment or education or health) often places the burden of ‘proof’ on the already racially minoritised (Anthias 1999; Garner 2010; Kitching 2011b). Thus formalisation or increased regulation is not regarded here as a cure-all, or an end to politics. The interplay between the cultural, institutional, economic and the legal requires constant attention, with reference to multiple informal and institutionalised spaces, and people making/being made by those spaces (citizens, non-citizens at home, school, in the neighbourhood, work, third level, recreation, health, media institutions, etc.)

Pressure on teachers in negotiating difference and power with students

Based on Hannagh’s presentation, Group B noted the importance of school principals affirming the individual and understanding him/her in the wider cultural-political context of his/her life. However, this was noted as quite complex and challenging in contemporary professional culture.

Every teacher could make a difference... there’s a thing about starting where people are at... some teacher inside the school would be an advocate for (migrants)... it’s a difficult one and you’d have to work it out locally, of actually maybe getting to know the family, that they’ve got trust in the school. Of course, once that’s established the next step is that you just slag each other off in a humorous way in this very heavy, difficult area. I thin there’s lots of little points of intervention that don’t address the big thing of institutional racism but it can make a difference... we got through the system because we were sponsored by individual teachers (Plenary discussion).

If we start from that vantage point, I am not going to teach you to appreciate someone else’s culture, as a teacher I am going to assume that as a good human being you are interested in an equal society and interested in challenging oppression. So that our identities get built up around that. I don’t feel guilty for being white, or I am not being made guilty for being white (Group B).

The incredible pressure placed on, and the changing role of teachers was noted in the plenary session by Group A and also in research (Devine 2005; 2011). Negotiating identity and difference, while not stereotyping/fixing in a singular category, and while consciously thinking about complex power relations, was recognised as challenging. As noted in sections 3.3 and 4.3, there may be three broad ways of understanding ‘the problem’ of difference: the first, meritocratic view naturalises difference as a set of individual traits that should have little or nothing to do with one’s educational and social development, thus largely depoliticising it. The second emphasises identity difference as constructed through practices imbued with power, i.e., cultural de/legitimation and material dis/advantage. The third is to examine how both representations may oversimplify and further construct one’s capacity to act, e.g. by overestimating or underestimating it, and to look at how representations of difference ignore multiple power relationships. Each of these approaches has implications for how the ideology of ‘equal treatment’ is understood and pursued as a set of practices.

6. Concluding commentary

The IES (Intercultural Education Strategy) is about thinking, planning and doing things differently, conscious of diversity and the need to create intercultural learning environments. It is not about radical change and is not resource intensive. It requires respect for difference, and a concerted and evolving change of attitude (DES 2010; our parentheses).

One wonders about the gap between the lived reality of racism in Ireland (given the conference participants' contributions and the masses of research available), and the liberal-conservative, language-support dominated character of the 2010 *Intercultural Education Strategy* (cited above). Looking to the colonial roots of the Irish primary education system and its contemporary form(s), we know that schools and education policy in Ireland are long-established arenas where social norms around national belonging, proto-racism and modern racism have been negotiated, re-inforced and altered. These processes occur within a historically centralized administration and locally autonomous system (Akenson 1970, Kenny 1997; Coakley 2012). Schools are sites where people tacitly and overtly compete for societal resources. Schools and education policy help mediate students', parents and teachers' views on, and implication in racisms. They can reinforce to the fact that race, ethnicity and/or migrant status are sewn into patterns of educational advantage and disadvantage. Where school structures and cultures ignore powerful processes of advantage and disadvantage, they normalise an extremely limited and socially destructive picture of racism.

We need to constantly ask how and what racialised identities are constructed through specific relations of structure and agency in Irish education's 'glocal' spaces. As commentary about liberal-market societies in this document suggested, institutional racism, which is focused on the nation-state, needs further debate in terms of how it, as a concept, 'fits' with, or is destabilised by, the postcolonial bureaucratic and migratory context of Ireland. Within and beyond Ireland, institutional racism cannot be satisfactorily thought of as an entirely pre-defined set of practices that have a solely and uni-dimensionally 'racist' character, that are stable over time, that occupy all spaces in the same way, and that, in a globalised world, are entirely controlled or 'managed' by sovereign nation-state policy, non-neutral as it is. The questioning of 'tightening procedures' in Ireland is one that requires complex discussion: Irish state administration/bureaucracy is described as having a comparatively, weak policy implementation character, where a high degree of centralisation is combined with strong local political agendas/institutional autonomy (Akenson 1970; Kirby and Murphy 2011). A number of participants were critical of the capacity for education and social policy to be 'fudged' in Ireland, which to some degree, is officially legitimated by the privileging of 'local ethos'. However, to 'tighten up' or to nominally 'secularise' policies is to suggest that there is not a cultural/historical/political character to the development and implementation of state policy (Kitching 2013a). It may also overlook the 'one size fits all' thinking that is part of the problem of institutional racism in British education, for example (Gillborn 1995; Crozier 2001). Ethnic monitoring of achievement statistics is not needed to name certain current and historically racist outcomes in Irish education. Irish society has systematically disadvantaged Travellers in a way that is ethno-racially specific, i.e., not reducible to class or other forms of stratification.

But it would be important that ethnic monitoring of achievement and the specific *politics of interpreting such achievement in Ireland* is given careful consideration, given emerging discrepancies between 'immigrants', or those whose mother tongue is neither English or Irish, and the majority (white) Irish population (Devine 2011). The importance of the politics of representation and interpretation cannot be overstated in any market-liberal society, including Ireland. Racism cannot be challenged by looking clinically at 'outcomes' and designing state policies after the fact which 'fix things'. The attempt to 'fix' and 'manage' racism is a key way in which it is contemporarily downplayed and underestimated by policy, and depoliticised in practice. A prior, *critical interrogation of how racialised and national identities are formed and experienced*, as opposed to apolitical notions of 'managing them and us', is necessary. This latter notion forms part of a practice of surveillance, which can politically reinforce rather than contest notions of fixed and 'given' races.

While the cross-societal racisms experienced by asylum seeker and Traveller children are particularly clear, mapping and historicising constructions of race in Ireland is an ongoing necessity for education research. The intersection of social class disadvantage with racialised inequalities is a particular concern. These must be tackled together and in their own right because, while heavily interrelated, class and race inequalities are not reducible to each other. We know from international experience that suggesting racism is 'ultimately a social class issue' often stems from a middle class perspective that sees racism as a problem which low-income populations are 'responsible' for. Such a perspective denies the processes and outcomes of racist and classed privilege and disadvantage that social systems mediate (Kitching 2012a; Bhopal and Preston 2012).

What is the role of education in an age of representation and multiple, 'glocal' social spaces?

In our group, there was lots of talk about the power of education to be a space where these things can be played out... there was debate, it was sometimes overt and sometimes more subtle... around what 'education can possibly do'. And if you think about racism as systematised, education cannot solve racism, because it's systematic. It's not just in education and education is not the origin of it. But on the other hand, education has to be a symbol of working on it... one the one hand we had people in the group who were overtly saying 'education is a place where people come into conflict, and they compete, and they participate in that competition in very subtle ways... what is the value of education, what can it do, and what can it not do... can we proliferate our relationships, can we have cross-sectoral relationships? Maybe that's a way (Group E).

It is tempting to think that greater inclusion is a state of existence that can be achieved definitively. Usually, this is a state that is considered achievable through the implementation of certain actions, practices and ways of being that are 'absolutely inclusive' and the removal of others that are 'definitively exclusionary'. It helps struggle to think in this way, and it is important to have such a vision, not least in terms of fostering a sense of hope. However, 'hope' should be considered less like a thing, and more like a practice. The above type of thought about a 'fixed state of inclusion' or a 'fixed state of racism' may stop us, paradoxically, from taking a more dynamic and searching critical view of racism, inclusion and 'their causes'. If we assume that racist outcomes must follow on from certain practices that are 'always racist', we become blind to the politics of everyday life that are not intuitively, systematically, constantly or even 'logically' part of our map of inclusion and exclusion. Policy change is only as 'good' as its adaptations and interruptions in everyday schooling and society. Ultimately, the ongoing analysis of power helps us deepen and constantly pursue our understandings of what is considered to be 'racism' and what is considered to be 'inclusion' in schools. This persistent orientation towards the terms of racism and inclusion should help educators to adapt to what new possibilities for racism, and what emergent possibilities for anti-racism circulate between society and schools.

7. References cited in the proceedings

- Akenson, D. (1970) *The Irish Education Experiment*. New York: Routledge and Kegan Paul.
- Anthias, F. (1999) Institutional Racism, Power and Accountability. *Sociological Research Online* 4(1).
- Arnold, S. K. (2012) *State Sanctioned Child Poverty and Exclusion: The case of children in state accommodation for asylum seekers*. Dublin: Irish Refugee Council.
- Banks, J., Byrne, D., McCoy, S. and Smyth, E. (2010) *Engaging Young People? Student experiences of the Leaving Certificate Applied*. ESRI Research Series 15. Dublin: ESRI/NCCA.
- Bhopal, K. and Preston, J. (eds) (2012) *Intersectionality and "Race" in Education*. London: Routledge.
- Bourne, J. (2001) The Life and Times of Institutional Racism. *Race and Class*. 43(2): 7-22.
- Bryan, A. (2007) The (Mis)representation of Travellers in the Civic, Social and Political Education Curriculum. In P. Downes and A.L. Gilligan (eds) *Beyond Educational Disadvantage*. Dublin: IPA, 247 - 258.
- (2008) The Co-articulation of National Identity and Interculturalism in the Irish Curriculum: Educating for democratic citizenship? *London Review of Education* 6(1): 47-58.

- (2009) The Intersectionality of Nationalism and Multiculturalism in the Irish Curriculum: Teaching against racism? *Race Ethnicity and Education* 12(3): 297-317.
- Byrne, D. and Smyth, E. (2010) *Behind the Scenes? A study of parental involvement in second-level education*. Dublin: The Liffey Press in association with The ESRI, NCCA and Department of Education and Science.
- Butler, J. (1990) *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the subversion of identity*. London: Routledge.
- Butler, J. and Spivak, G.C. (2007) *Who Sings the Nation-State?* London: Seagull Books.
- Christie, A. (2006) From Racial to Racist State: Questions for social work professionals working with asylum seekers. *Journal of Applied Social Studies* 7(2): 35-49.
- Coakley, M. (2012) *Ireland in the World Order*. London: Pluto Press.
- Coard, B. (1971). *How the West Indian Child is Made Educationally Sub-normal in the British School System*. London: New Beacon Books Ltd. for the Caribbean Education and Community Workers' Association.
- Coolahan, J., Hussey, C. and Kilfeather, P. (2012) *The Forum on Patronage and Pluralism in the Primary Sector: Report of the Forum's Advisory Group*. Department of Education and Skills. <http://www.education.ie/en/Press-Events/Conferences/Patronage-and-Pluralism-in-the-Primary-Sector/The-Forum-on-Patronage-and-Pluralism-in-the-Primary-Sector-Report-of-the-Forum%E2%80%99s-Advisory-Group.pdf>. Accessed 19th October 2012.
- Crozier, G. (2001). Excluded Parents: the deracialization of parental involvement. *Race, Ethnicity and Education* 4 (4): 329-341.
- Department of Education and Science (DES, 2007) *Audit of School Enrolment Policies*. Dublin: DES.
- Department of Education and Skills (2011) *Discussion Paper on a Regulatory Framework for School Enrolment*. Dublin: DES.
- Department of Education and Skills/Office of Minister for Integration (DES/OMI, 2010) *Intercultural Education Strategy 2010 – 2015*. Dublin: DES/OMI.
- Devine, D. (2005) Welcome to the Celtic Tiger? Teacher responses to immigration and increasing ethnic diversity in Irish schools. *International Studies in Sociology of Education* 15 (1): 49-70.
- (2009) Mobilising Capitals? Migrant children's negotiation of their everyday lives in schools. *British Journal of Sociology of Education* 30(5): 521-535.
- (2011) *Immigration and Schooling in the Republic of Ireland: Making a difference?* Manchester: Manchester University Press.
- Eivers, E., Close, S., Shiel, G., Millar, D., Clerkin, A., Gilleece, L. and Kiniry, J. (2010) *The 2009 National Assessments of Mathematics and English Reading*. Dublin: Educational Research Centre.
- Eivers, E. Shiel, G. and Shortt, F. (2004) *Reading Literacy in Disadvantaged Primary Schools*. Dublin: Educational Research Centre.
- Equality Authority and Department of Education and Science (2004) *Schools and the Equal Status Act*, 2nd edition. Dublin: Equality Authority and DES.
- Fanning, B. (2002). *Racism and Social Change in the Republic of Ireland*. Manchester: Manchester University Press.
- Fanon, F. (1986) *Black Skin, White Masks*. London: Pluto Press.
- Garner, S. (2004) *Racism in the Irish Experience*. London: Pluto Press.
- Garner, S. (2010) *Racisms*. London: Sage.
- Gillborn, D. (1995) *Racism and Antiracism in Real Schools: Theory, policy, practice*. Buckingham: Open University Press.
- Growing up in Ireland Study (2011) *Influences on 9-year-olds' learning: Home, school and community executive summary*. <www.growingup.ie/childpublications>.
- Hall, S. (1997) *Race, the Floating Signifier*. United States: Media Education Foundation.
- Heffernan, B. (2012) Traveller loses his appeal over school's preference for past pupils' children. *Irish Independent* February 4th.
- Helms, J. E. (1995). An Update of Helms's White and People of Color Racial Identity Models. In Ponterotto, J., Casas, J.M., Suzuki, L.A. and Alexander, C.M. (eds) *Handbook of Multicultural Counselling*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, 181 - 189.

- Hourigan, N. and Campbell, M. (2010) *The TEACH Report Traveller Education & Adults: Crisis Challenge and Change*. Dublin: National Association of Travellers' Centres.
- Huxley, A. (1954) *The Doors of Perception*. London: Chatto and Windus.
- Kenny, M. (1997) *The Routes of Resistance: Travellers and second level schooling*. Aldershot, UK: Ashgate.
- Kirby, P. and Murphy, M. (2011) *Towards a Second Republic: Irish politics after the Celtic Tiger*. London: Pluto Press.
- Kitching, K. (2010) An Excavation of the Racialised Politics of Viability Underpinning Education Policy in Ireland. *Irish Educational Studies: Special Issue on 'Race' Migration and Education in a Globalised Context* 29 (3): 213-229.
- (2011a) Interrogating the Changing Inequalities Constituting 'Popular', 'Deviant' and 'Ordinary' Subjects of School/Subculture in Ireland. *Race Ethnicity and Education* 14(3) : 293 – 311.
 - (2011b) Taking Responsibility for Race Inequality and the Limitless Acts Required: Beyond good/bad whites to the immeasurably whitened self. *Power and Education* 3(2): 164 - 178.
 - (2012a) Understanding Class Anxiety and Race Certainty in Changing Times: Moments of home, school, body and identity configuration in 'new migrant' Dublin. In Bhopal, K. and Preston, J. (eds) *Intersectionality and "Race" in Education*. London: Routledge, 158-177.
- Ladson-Billings, G. (2006). From the Achievement Gap to the Education Debt: Understanding achievement in U.S. schools. *Educational Researcher* 35(7): 3-12.
- Lentin, A. (2004) *Racism and Anti-Racism in Europe*. London: Pluto Press.
- Lentin, R. (2001) Responding to the Racialisation of Irishness: Disavowed multiculturalism and its discontents. *Sociological Research Online* 5 (4).
- Lentin, R. (2007) Illegal in Ireland, Irish Illegals: Diaspora nation as racial state. *Irish Political Studies* 22(4): 433-453.
- Lentin, R. (2012) Turbans, hijabs and other differences: 'Integration from below' and Irish interculturalism. *European Journal of Cultural Studies* 15(2) 226–242.
- Lentin, R. and McVeigh, R. (2006) *After Optimism? Ireland, racism and globalisation*. Dublin: Metro Éireann Publications.
- Lyons, Z. (2010) *Irish Educational Studies: Special Issue on 'Race' Migration and Education in a Globalised Context* 29(3): 289-303.
- Mac an Ghaill, M. (1991) Young, Gifted and Black: Methodological reflections of a teacher/ researcher. In Walford, G. (ed.) *Doing Educational Research*. London: Routledge, 101-120.
- Mac an Ghaill, M. (2002) Beyond a black-white dualism: racialization and racism in the Republic of Ireland and the Irish diaspora experience. *Irish Journal of Sociology* 3 (2): 99-122.
- Mac Ruairc, G. (2009) 'Dip, dip, sky blue, who's it? NOT YOU': Children's experiences of standardised testing: a socio-cultural analysis'. *Irish Educational Studies* 28 (1): 47-66.
- McCutcheon, F. (2007) *Is our School System Institutionally Racist?* *Metro Éireann*, September 13.
- McGovern, F. (1995) The Education of Refugee Children in Ireland. *Oideas Summer*: 82-93.
- McVeigh, R. (1992) The specificities of Irish racism. *Race and Class*, 33(4): 31-45.
- Migrant Rights Centre Ireland (2011) *Singled Out: An exploratory study on ethnic profiling in Ireland and its impact on migrant workers and their families*. Author.
- Murji, K. (2007) Sociological Engagements: Institutional racism and beyond. *Sociology* 41(5): 843-855.
- National Council for Curriculum and Assessment (2005) *Guidelines for intercultural education in the primary school*. Dublin: The Stationery Office.
- OECD (2009) *OECD Reviews of Migrant Education: Closing the gap for immigrant students: Policies, practice and performance*. Paris: OECD.
- Ramachandran, V.S. and Hubbard, E. M. (2003) Hearing Colors, Tasting Shapes. *Scientific American* 5: 52-59.
- Sahlberg, P., Munn, P. and Furlong, J. (2012) *Report of the International Review Panel on the Structure of Initial Teacher Education Provision in Ireland*. Department of Education and Skills <http://www.education.ie/en/Press-Events/Press-Releases/2012-Press-Releases/Report->

- of-the-International-Review-Panel-on-the-Structure-of-Initial-Teacher-Education-Provision-in-Ireland.pdf. Accessed 19th October 2012
- Smyth, E., Darmody, M., McGinnity, F. and Byrne, D. (2009) *Adapting to Diversity: Irish schools and newcomer students*. ESRI Research Series 8. Dublin: ESRI.
- Titley, G. (2009) Celtic, Christian and Cosmopolitan: 'Migrants' and the mediation of exceptional globalisation. In Ging, D. Cronin, M. and Kirby, P. (eds) *Transforming Ireland: Challenges, critiques, resources*. Manchester: Manchester University Press.
- Warmington, P. (2009) Taking Race out of Scare Quotes: Race conscious social analysis in an ostensibly post-racial world. *Race Ethnicity and Education* 12(3):281-296.
- Weir, S. (2011) *A Report on the First Phase Evaluation of DEIS: Summary report*. Dublin: Educational Research Centre.
- Youdell, D. (2006) *Impossible Bodies, Impossible Selves: Exclusions and student subjectivities*. Dordrecht: Springer.

Appendix A: Biographies of speakers

Professor Mairtin Mac an Ghaill is Professor of Multi-Professional Education at Newman University College Birmingham. He is a research leader internationally in the areas of educational and social inequalities, ethnicity, racism and cultural belonging, the sociology of masculinity, and the Irish diaspora in Britain. He is renowned for his earlier school-based studies *Young, Gifted and Black* and *The Making of Men*, as well as for *Contemporary Racisms and Ethnicities*. He has recently co-authored a book with Dr. Chris Haywood titled *Education and Masculinities: Social, Cultural and Global Transformations*. This book situates the relationship between educational processes and contemporary anxieties about masculinity within local and global societal changes.

Dr. Delma Byrne is a Lecturer at the Departments of Sociology and Education at National University of Ireland Maynooth (NUIM), Ireland. Her key areas of interest lie in sociology of education and social stratification in education and the labour market. She is current a co-ordinator of an international study that explores how inequality is maintained through the structure of schooling across 18 countries with Samuel Lucas at the University of California, Berkeley. She current teaches modules on Sociology of Education and on Structures of Inequality: Class, Race and Gender. Homepage: <http://sociology.nuim.ie/staff.shtml>.

Hannagh McGinley is a PhD student at the School of Education, NUI Galway, under the supervision of Dr. Elaine Keane. Hannagh is an Irish Research Council for the Humanities and Social Sciences (IRCHSS) Postgraduate Scholar. Her current research is a qualitative study that will examine post-primary teachers' preparation for intercultural education, with particular reference to Traveller pupils. It will examine teachers' experiences with Traveller pupils and the implications for their teaching practice, and will identify ways in which initial teacher education may better prepare teachers to teach for social justice. Hannagh was the recipient of the 2011 Dr. Mary L. Thornton Scholarship in Education from the NUI.

Dr. Karl Kitching is a lecturer with the School of Education, University College Cork. He teaches and supervises those studying education in UCC at student teacher, Masters and PhD level. He has published a number of peer reviewed scholarly articles and book chapters about the politics of racism in education in Ireland/internationally. He is currently writing a book about the politics of racism and education, and is also Principal Investigator on *Making Communion: Disappearing and Emerging Forms of Childhood in Ireland's Schools, Homes and Communities*. This is an Irish Research Council 2012-13 project that seeks to examine the historical and contemporary experiences of of Catholic, minority religion and secular students in and outside of Catholic schools. He was the organising chairperson of this event, having received funding from the Irish Research Council for the Humanities and Social Sciences 'New Ideas' Scheme 2011-2012. Homepage: <http://research.ucc.ie/profiles/Ao13/kkitching>.

Dr Alicia Curtin did not present at the conference, but made an important contribution to analysing and editing this proceedings document, as well as helping run the event. She is a researcher in the School of Education, University College Cork. Her current projects include an IRCHSS-funded teaching-led knowledge exchange study and a SCOTENS-funded research project exploring teacher assessment in Higher Education. She is also working under contract with Routledge on a co-authored book *Networks of the Mind – A Critical Neurocultural Perspective on Learning* and has recently completed a chapter with Professor Kathy Hall for *The International Handbook of Research on Children's Literacy, Learning and Culture*.

Appendix B: Biographies of discussion group facilitators

Ifrah Ahmed has worked on many different projects with many organizations including; Cairde, The Africa Centre, Spirasi, Somali Community in Ireland, Integration of African Children in Ireland and AkiDwA. She is very interested in health issues and in particular women's health needs. She sits on the Steering Committee for Ireland's National Plan of Action to Address Female Genital Mutilation.

Claire Dorrity works as Nursing Co-ordinator in the School of Applied Social Studies and teaches on both undergraduate and post graduate nursing programmes, as well as the BSW programme. Claire also coordinates the Diploma in Social and Psychological Health Studies in CACE and teaches on the Diploma in Social Studies, Developmental Studies, and Community Development. Her teaching and research interests include the marginalisation of asylum seekers, institutional racism and discrimination, displacement and translocation, integration and settlement and the framing of ethnocentric and hegemonic constructions of identity.

Nilmini Fernando is a PhD candidate with Dept of Sociology, UCC. Her current research adopts a critical postcolonial feminist perspective to explore representation and identity construction with women seeking asylum in Cork, using Participatory Arts-based research methods. With a background in Occupational Therapy and the use of creative arts in mental health, she has worked in a variety of clinical and community settings in Australia, UK and Ireland. Nilmini teaches part-time at the School of Clinical Therapies, UCC.

Dr. Lindsey Garratt is a research associate with the Children's Research Centre Trinity College Dublin. She recently completed her PhD under the Trinity Immigration Initiative. Her research focuses on inter-ethnic relations between migrant and majority group boys of primary school age.

Eileen Hogan is a graduate of University College Cork. She is currently completing her PhD research, an ethnography exploring the mediation and negotiation of identities through popular music, in the University of Liverpool. She engages in teaching and research on racism and anti-racism in Ireland and Europe; gender studies and community arts.

Luke Kasuwanga is a social justice activist based in Dublin. He is a founder and leading member of Anti Racism Network Ireland (ARN). This grassroots activist-based group was formed in 2010 in response to drastic cuts in NGO funding which resulted in racism, including both state and institutional, not being monitored as closely as heretofore.

Dr. Elaine Keane is a lecturer in the School of Education, NUI Galway. Her teaching and research focus on the Sociology of Education (in particular, on social class and ethnicity at school and higher education levels) and qualitative research methods.

Dr. Rory McDaid is a Lecturer in Education in Marino Institute of Education, Dublin. He has taught at both primary and post-primary levels in Ireland and London and is a former Research Fellow in Trinity College, Dublin and member of staff in the Special Education Department, St. Patrick's

College, Drumcondra. He is the author of a number of book chapters on the education of minority language students in Irish schools and co-editor of a recent volume on culture and identity in contemporary Ireland.

Cyndi Njoki is a Genetics student in DCU. She has a passion for empowering, advocacy and volunteering, and is particularly interested in youth work and its societal importance. Cyndi has been involved in various rights and advocacy based work such as training youth workers, the Children's Mental Health Coalition and the Mpower Project which tackled the challenges faced by young migrants especially on education and accessing third level. Cyndi has also been involved in the rewriting of some articles in the UN charter of children's rights.

Amel Yacef presently coordinates the Youth Health programme of the Base Youth Centre in Ballyfermot. Amel has been working in the Irish youth and community sector for the past 11 years and has extensive experience working in the areas of health and young people, integration, unaccompanied minors, advocacy and rights.

Appendix C: Power and racisms in Irish education: Selected research and theorisation

Not an exhaustive or 'recommended' list; restricted to empirical and secondary research and theory on the Irish education context. Research is also being conducted/finalised by a number of the discussion group co-facilitators whose biographies are included in Appendices A and B.

Bryan, A. (some published work is already listed in the **reference list, section 7**).

- (2009) Pedagogies of Privilege: Re-thinking interculturalism and anti-racism in education. In Drudy, S. (ed) *Education in Ireland: Challenge and change*. Dublin: Gill and MacMillan, 226-240.
- (2009) Migration Nation: Anti-racism and intercultural education as symbolic violence in Celtic tiger Ireland. In Vavrus, F. and Bartlett, L. (eds) *Critical Approaches to Comparative Education: Vertical case studies from Africa, Europe, the Middle East and the Americas*. New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 129 - 146.
- (2010) Common-sense Citizenship, Citizenship Tourism, and Citizenship Education in an Era of Globalisation: The case of Ireland during the Celtic tiger era. In Reid, A., Gill, J. and Sears, A. (eds) *Globalisation, the Nation-State and the Citizen: Dilemmas and directions for civics and citizenship education*. New York: Routledge, 143 - 157.
- (2010) Corporate Multiculturalism, Diversity Management and Positive Interculturalism in Irish Schools and Society. *Irish Educational Studies: Special Issue on 'Race' Migration and Education in a Globalised Context* 29(3): 253-269.
- (2011) Band-Aid Pedagogy, Celebrity Humanitarianism and Cosmopolitan Provincialism: A critical analysis of global citizenship education in the Republic of Ireland. In Malleck, S. and Wankel, S. (eds) *Ethical Models and Applications of Globalization: Cultural, socio-political and economic perspectives*. Hershey, PA: IGI Global.
- (2011, with Bracken, M.) *Learning to Read the World? Teaching and learning about global citizenship and international development in post-primary schools*. Authors.
- (2011, with Bracken, M.) They Think the Book is Right and I Am Wrong': Intercultural education and the positioning of ethnic minority students in the formal and informal curriculum. In Darmody, M., Tyrrell, N. and Song, S. (eds) *The Changing Faces of Ireland: Exploring immigrant and ethnic minority children's experiences*. Rotterdam: Sense, 105-124.
- (2012) 'You've Got to Teach People that Racism is Wrong and then they Won't be Racist': Curricular representations and young people's understandings of 'race' and racism. *Journal of Curriculum Studies* 44(5): 599 – 629.
- (2012) Using International Development themed Film to Promote a Pedagogy of Discomfort. In Parker-Jenkins, M. and Liddy, M. (eds) *Education that Matters: Critical pedagogy and development education at local and global levels*. Peter Lang. Forthcoming.

- Boucher, G. (1998) *The Irish are Friendly, But...: A report on racism and international students in Ireland*. Irish Council for International Students. Dublin: ICOS.
- (2000) Mixing Multi-Culturalism, Assimilation and Discrimination: International students perceptions of Ireland's acculturation ideologies. In O'Connell, M. and MacLachlan, M. (eds) *Cultivating Pluralism*. Dublin: Irish Academic Press, 243-258.
- Byrne, D. (a number of published works are already listed in the **reference list, section 7**)
- (2010, with McGinnity, F., Smyth, E., and Darmody, M.) Immigration and School Composition in Ireland. *Irish Educational Studies: Special Issue on Race, Migration and Education in a Globalised Context* 29(3): 271-288.
- Curry, P., Gilligan, R. Garratt, L. and Scholtz, L. (2011) *Where to From Here? Inter-ethnic relations among children in Ireland*. Dublin: Liffey Press.
- Daly, E. (some published work is already listed in the **reference list, section 7**)
- (2009) Religious Freedom as a Function of Power Relations: Dubious claims on pluralism in the denominational schools debate. *Irish Educational Studies* 28 (3): 235-251.
 - (2011, with Hickey, T.) Religious Freedom and the Right to Discriminate in the School Admissions Context: A neo-republican critique. *Legal Studies* 31 (4): 615-643.
- Darmody, M. (some published work is already listed in the **reference list, section 7**)
- (2011, with Tyrrell, N. and Song, S. eds) *The Changing Faces of Ireland: Exploring the lives of immigrant and ethnic minority children*. Rotterdam: Sense Publishers.
 - (2011, with Smyth, E., Byrne, D., and McGinnity, F) New School, New System? The experiences of immigrant students in Irish schools. In Bekerman, Z. and Geisen, T. (eds) *Migration, Minorities, and Learning – Understanding Cultural and Social Differences in Education*. London: Springer. 283 – 300.
 - (2011, with Smyth, E., Byrne, D. and McGinnity, F.) Power, Education and Migration into Ireland. *Power and Education* 3 (3): 224- 237.
- Devine, D. (some published work is already listed in the **reference list, section 7**).
- (2002, with Kenny, M.) *Ethnicity and Schooling: A study of ethnic diversity in selected Irish primary and post-primary schools*. Commissioned report for the Department of Education and Science. Dublin: DES.
- (2004, with Deegan, J. and Lodge, A.) *Primary Voices: Equality, diversity and childhood in Irish primary schools*. Dublin: Institute of Public Administration.
 - (2006, with Kelly, M.). 'I Just Don't Want to Get Picked on by Anybody': Dynamics of inclusion and exclusion in a newly multi-ethnic Irish primary school'. *Children and Society* 20 (2): 128-139.
 - (2007) Immigration and the Enlargement of Children's Social Space in School. In Zeiher, H., Devine, D., Kjørholt, A and Strandell, H. (eds) *Flexible Childhood? Exploring children's welfare in time and space*. Odense: University Press of Southern Denmark, 143-169.
 - (2008, with Kenny, M, and Macneela, E.) Naming the 'Other: Children's construction and experience of racisms in Irish primary schools. *Race Ethnicity and Education* 11: 369-385.
 - (2009) Dynamics of Inclusion and Exclusion in Children's Social World in School. In Drudy, S. *Education in Ireland: Challenge and change*. Dublin: Gill and MacMillan, 57-72.
 - (2011) Securing Migrant Children's Educational Well-Being: Policy and practice in Irish schools. In Darmody, M., Tyrrell, N. and Song, S. (eds) *The Changing Faces of Ireland: Exploring the lives of immigrant and ethnic minority children*. Rotterdam: Sense. 73-88.
 - (2013) Constructing the Productive Child? The 'added-value' of migrant children in schools. *Children and Society* Forthcoming.
 - (2013, with Luttrell, W.) Researching Children, Global Childhoods and Education in Neo-liberal Times. *Children and Society* Forthcoming.
- Dunne, C. (2009) Host Students' Perspectives of Intercultural Contact in an Irish University. *Journal of Studies in International Education* 13(2): 222-239.
- Faas, D. (2012, with Ross, W.) Identity, Diversity and Citizenship: A critical analysis of textbooks and curricula in Irish schools. *International Sociology* 27: 574-591.
- (2012, with O'Connor, L.) The impact of Migration on National Identity in a Globalized

- World: A comparison of civic education curricula in England, France and Ireland. *Irish Educational Studies* 31 (1): 51-66.
- (with O'Connor, L., in press) Constructions of "Europe", identity and citizenship in postprimary social studies curricula in the Republic of Ireland. In S. Philippou (ed.) *'Europe' Turned Local – the Local Turned European? Constructions of 'Europe' in social studies curricula across Europe*. Berlin: Lit Verlag.
- Fionda, R. (2011) Immigrant Students and Second Level Education in the Republic of Ireland. *Translocations* 7(1). *Translocations*.
<http://www.translocations.ie/docs/v07i01/Vol%207%20Issue%201%20-%20Peer%20Review%20-%20Education%20&%20Immigrants,%20Fionda.pdf>. Accessed 19th October 2012.
- Hegarty, T. (2011) *Documenting Initial Challenges in Adapting the Yellow Flag Pilot Project*. Dublin: DICE. .
- Keane, E. (2009) 'Frictional' Relationships...Tension in the Camp: Focusing on the relational in under-represented students' experiences in higher education. *Irish Educational Studies* 28(1): 85-102.
- (2011) Dependence-Deconstruction: Widening participation and traditional-entry students transitioning from school to higher education in Ireland. *Teaching in Higher Education* 16(6): 707-718.
 - (2011) Distancing to Self-Protect: The perpetuation of inequality in higher education through socio-relational dis/engagement. *British Journal of Sociology of Education* 32(3): 449-466.
 - (2011, with Boland, J.) The Transformative Potential of Service/Community-Based Learning As a Pedagogy for Diversity and Social Justice in Teacher Education: A case study from Ireland. In Murphy, T. and Tan, J. (eds) *Service Learning and Educating in Challenging Contexts: International perspectives*. UK: Continuum Books.
 - (2012) Differential Prioritising: Orientations to higher education and widening participation. *International Journal of Educational Research* 53: 150-159.
- Keogh, A. (2000) Talking about the Other: A view of how secondary school pupils construct opinions about refugees and asylum seekers. In Mac Lachlan, M. and O'Connell, M. (eds) *Cultivating Pluralism: Psychological, social and cultural perspectives in a changing Ireland*. Dublin: Oak Tree Press, 123 - 37.
- Kitching, K. (some published work is already listed in the **reference list, section 7**).
- (2011c) Changing the Anti-racist Politics of the Intercultural Education Strategy. Human Rights in Ireland. <http://www.humanrights.ie/index.php/2011/08/22/thoughts-on-a-new-irelandchanging-the-anti-racist-politics-of-the-intercultural-education-strategy>. Accessed 19th October 2012.
 - (2011d) The Mobility of Racism in Education: Contested discourses and new migrant subjectivities in Irish schooling. In Darmody, M., Tyrrell, N. and Song, S. (eds) *The Changing Faces of Ireland: Exploring the lives of immigrant and ethnic minority children*. Rotterdam: Sense. 89 – 104.
 - (2012b) Official Literacy Co-constructs Racialised Bodies: Ways to untangle racism in cultural and critical research on literacy. In Hall, K., Cremin, T., Comber, B. and Moll, L. (eds.) *International Handbook of Research in Children's Literacy, Learning and Culture*. Oxford: Blackwells, Forthcoming.
 - (2013a) Childhood's Role in the Post-secularisation of (G)local Spaces: Power and 'the problem' of religious and moral education in contemporary Ireland. Under review: available on request.
 - (2013b) "Where is She From if She's Not Making Her Communion?" Understanding the politics of belonging to 'Irish' schools in terms of post-secularisation. Under review: available on request.
- McDaid, R. (2007) New Kids on the Block. In Downes, P. and Gilligan, A.L. (eds) *Beyond Educational Disadvantage*. IPA: Dublin, 268-279.
- (2011) GŁOS, VOCE, VOICE: Minority language children reflect on the recognition of

- their first languages in Irish primary schools. In Darmody, M., Tyrrell, N. and Song, S. (eds) *The Changing Faces of Ireland: Exploring Immigrant and ethnic minority children's experiences*. Rotterdam: Sense, 17-33.
- (2011, with Duibhir, P. and O'Shea, A., eds) *All Changed? Culture and identity in contemporary Ireland*. Dublin: Duras.
- McGovern, F. (1995) The Education of Refugee Children in Ireland. *Oideas Summer*: 82-93.
- Ní Chonaill, B. (2008) Perceptions of Migrants and their Impact on the Blanchardstown Area: Local views. Author.
- Nowlan, E. (2008) Underneath the Band-Aid. *Irish Educational Studies* 27(3): 253-266.
- O'Brien, J. (2009) Institutional Racism and Anti-Racism in Teacher Education: Perspectives of teacher educators. *Irish Educational Studies* 28(2): 193-207.
- Parker-Jenkins, M. and Liddy, M. (2012) (eds) *Education that Matters: Critical pedagogy and development education at local and global levels*. Peter Lang. Forthcoming.
- Schlepper, A. (2004) They Don't Really Want to Know Us: Experiences and perceptions of international students at the Dublin Institute of Technology. *Level* 3(2). DIT.
http://level3.dit.ie/html/issue2_list.html. Accessed 19th October 2012.
- Smyth, E. (some published work is already listed in the **reference list, section 7**)
- (2011, with Darmody, M.) Religious Diversity and Schooling in Ireland. In Darmody, M., Tyrrell, N. and Song, S. (eds) *The Changing Faces of Ireland: Exploring Immigrant and ethnic minority children's experiences*. Rotterdam: Sense, 125-144.
 - (2010, with REMC team) *Religious Education in a Multicultural Society: School and home in comparative context*. ESRI.
 - (2009, with Darmody, M., McGinnity, F. and Byrne, D.) What Do We Know About Large Scale Immigration and Irish Schools? ESRI Research Bulletin 2009/2/6. Dublin: ESRI
- Tormey, R. (2006) Sustainable Development. In Regan, C. (ed.) *80:20 Development in an Unequal World*, 5th Edition. Bray: 80:20, 63-79.
- (2006) The construction of national identity through primary school history: the Irish case. *British Journal of Sociology of Education* 27 (3): 311-324.
 - (2010, with Corcoran, R.) Teacher education, emotional competencies and development education. *Procedia - Social and Behavioural Sciences* 2 (2): 2448-2557.
 - (2012, with Gleeson, J.) Irish post-primary students' attitudes towards ethnic minorities. *Irish Educational Studies* 31(2): 157-173.
- Wallen, M. and Kelly-Holmes, H. (2006) 'I Think They Just Think It's Going to Go Away at Some Stage': Policy and practice in teaching English as an additional language in Irish primary schools. *Language and Education* 20 (2): 141-61.

Appendix D: Existing non-governmental, non-profit networks

This list is not an endorsement of any particular organisation/network, and it is not an exhaustive list. Organisations should be approached critically. Contact websites for research report

- Access Ireland
- Afri – Action from Ireland
- Africa Centre
- AkiDwA (Akina Dada wa Africa)
- Anti-Deportation Ireland
- Anti-Racism Network Ireland
- Ballymun Intercultural Group
- Canal Communities Partnership
- Clare Intercultural Network
- Comhlámh
- Crosscare Migrant Project
- Cork Anti-Racism Network
- Developmenteducation.ie
- DICE
- Dominican Justice Office
- English Language Support Teachers' Association
- European Network Against Racism (ENAR) Ireland
- Galway One World Centre
- Irish Refugee Council
- Immigrant Council of Ireland
- Immigrant Parents/Guardians Support Association
- Integration Centre
- Irish Traveller Movement
- Mayo Intercultural Action
- Migrant Rights Centre
- Nasc Immigrant Support Centre
- Nino's (YMCA Cork)
- New Communities Partnership
- Pavee Point
- Residents Against Racism
- Spirasi
- Together-Razem
- Traveller Visibility Group
- Ubuntu

Appendix E: School-based resources and programmes

This list is not an endorsement of any particular school-based resource or programme. Nor should it replace, or substitute interrogation of children and young people's lived realities as curriculum. Readers should critically interrogate the meanings of societal and school racism, neo-colonialism and development adopted in such resources. Many are available for free online.

- *Africa Also Smiles: A Cross-Curricular Educational Resource About the African Continent* (Africa Centre, Irish Aid and Trócaire)
- *All Different All Equal Resource Pack* (National Youth Council of Ireland Dev. Ed. programme)
- *Anti Racism and Multiculturalism Campaign: Activity and Resource Pack for Student Coordinators* (Friend-Pereira and Mc Daid)
- *Autobiography of Intercultural Encounters* (Council of Europe <http://www.coe.int>)
- *Changing Perspectives: Cultural Values Diversity and Equality in Ireland and the Wider World* (NCCRI)
- *Compass – A Manual on Human Rights Education with Young People* (available at <http://www.european-citizenship.org>)
- *English as an additional language: Guidelines for Teachers* (available at www.ncca.ie)
- *Every student matters: Activities for engagement and widening participation in higher education*: a preliminary collection, Resource developed as a result of collaborative NUI Galway, DIT and NUI Maynooth publication (Keane, Farrell, Harvey and Coughlan, 2006).
- *Human Rights* (Amnesty International - website includes many primary and secondary resource packs including *Human Rights Stories for Primary Schools*, *The Right Start*, *Lift off*, *Me You Everyone*, *Human Rights Education: The Whole School Approach*, *Voice our Concern*, *A is for Action*, *Geography Development and Human Rights*, *Celebrating the Universal Declaration of Human Rights*)
- *Integrating non-English speaking students into the school and curriculum* (available at www.ncca.ie)
- *Intercultural and Anti Racism Week Resources for Schools and Youth Workers* (NCCRI)
- *Intercultural Educational Guidelines for Schools* (Joint Managerial Body)
- *Intercultural education in the post-primary school and Life Stories* (National Youth Council of Ireland Development Education programme)
- *Intercultural education in the primary school* (National Council for Curriculum and Assessment)
- *Kids Like Us – Irish and Kenyan Kids Together* (Actionaid Ireland)
- *Pathways for Parental Integration* (Immigrant Council of Ireland - Toolkit and supplementary materials available at www.immigrantcouncil.ie)
- *Resource for Global Education for Action* (Mayfield Community Arts Centre)
- *Rich Man's World* (National Youth Council of Ireland Development Education programme - available on website)
- *Signposts – Lessons For Living* (Dermody, Ward and Kelly)
- *Show Racism the Red Card* (theredcard.ie)
- *The Pavee Pack* (National Youth Council of Ireland Development Education programme)
- *The Rights Stuff* (An Educational Resource on the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child available at <http://cspe.slss.ie/resources>)
- *The Toolkit for Intercultural Learning* (National Youth Council of Ireland Development Education programme)
- *Toolkit for Diversity in the Primary School* (available at www.integration.ie)
- *Up and Away; a resource book for language support in primary schools* (available at www.integration.ie)
- *What? Me a Racist?* (www.euireland.ie)
- *Yellow Flag Programme* (www.yellowflag.ie)

In 2004, an Equality Authority/Department of Education and Science (DES) publication noted that the Equal Status Acts prohibit three forms of discrimination: indirect discrimination, discrimination by imputation and discrimination by association. However, if a school provision, practice or requirement indirectly puts someone at a disadvantage, a school may not be accused of indirect discrimination "if the provision is objectively justified by a legitimate aim and the means of achieving that aim are appropriate and necessary" (Equality Authority/DES 2004: 7).

Since then, the terms of key related documents: the 2007 Audit on Enrolment Policies, the 2010 National Intercultural Education Strategy, the 2012 Report of the Advisory Group to the Forum on Patronage and Pluralism, and the 2012 Report of the International Review Group on Teacher Education, make at best surface reference to combating, or educating about indirectly racist patterns of discrimination in schools and other education institutions. Collectively, they cite an ethos of 'inclusion', and a number of global, European and national conventions, in a rather weak manner. For example, the latter report does not make reference, in its discussion of issues of teacher 'supply and demand', to the financial and institutional barriers faced by certain people of migrant and minority ethnic background in their pursuit of third level teacher education. The 2011 Discussion Paper on a Regulatory Framework for School Enrolment makes reference to the potential disadvantages faced by 'newcomer' students. But the continued use of this term for (second generation Irish) children is deeply problematic and dismissive. Furthermore, the 2011 document does not take meaningful account of the very specific, intergenerational exclusion of Traveller children and families from education.

It is not known what the outcome of a possible 2013 regulatory framework on enrolment might be. But we do know that the search for more 'politically correct' terms for 'diversity and inclusion' alone does not help change powerful mindsets, unequal institutions and dominating cultures. For example, we know that the logic of 'free parent choice' often disguises the unequal pitting of social groups against each other in accessing schools. We know that the matter of institutional racism has to some extent been dwarfed by the alarming nature of immigration, asylum and citizenship policies in Ireland and across Europe. We also know from recent British history that legal recognition of institutional racism, while hard-won, can be defined in a way that oversimplifies its manifestation and ignores class inequalities.

The lack of problematisation of these complex issues in Irish social and education policy is of deep concern. The need to understand their specific shape in the context of Ireland is urgent. This document aims to further encourage and support such goals, as a critical story of the Racism and Education Conference and Networking Event held on Friday, 17th February 2012 in University College Cork.

Using a social and cultural perspective on racism, power and education, the document provides a set of questions for ongoing public, policy-making and research debate. It also includes a list of contemporary research on racism, power and education in Ireland, as well as a list of currently available resources for schools. The publication and dissemination of this document was planned as part of a Irish Research Council funded 'New Ideas' proposal. Its intended audience includes education and social policy-makers, and education and community practitioners, as well as anti-racism activists.